PROJECT SUMMARY

The Smithsonian Institution (SI) has submitted preliminary site development plans for the Hirshhorn Museum Sculpture Garden’s revitalization. The Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden is located at 700 Independence Avenue, SE, Washington, DC, on the National Mall, and is part of the Hirshhorn Museum complex. The Commission provided comments on the concept design at its June 6, 2019 meeting, and supported the Smithsonian’s intention to revitalize the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden to improve the visitor experience and public engagement, and accommodate the museum’s mission and contemporary programming needs.

According to SI, the project presents an opportunity to rehabilitate and revitalize the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden and address the following goals of the Hirshhorn Museum:

- **Show the Museum’s historically significant bronze sculpture collection to strongest effect.** The creation of outdoor galleries will respond to curatorial needs by increasing the number of sculptures on view by 50 percent through rotating sculptural exhibitions. Smaller roomlike moments within the Garden will create intimate experiences between viewers and individual works of art.

- **Create flexible space for artists working to push the media of sculpture and performance forward into the twenty-first century.** An open lawn and expanded central reflecting pool will host a variety of year-round uses to support the Hirshhorn’s expanded programming.

- **Enhance visitor experience and public engagement.** New ramps from the north and south will provide universal accessibility, while increased shade and seating within the Garden and along its edges will create welcoming spaces for visitors throughout the year.
• Replace failing infrastructure, meet current code requirements, and design for resilience and sustainability. Infrastructure to address storm water management, flood mitigation, improved security, and new lighting and audiovisual systems will equip the sculpture garden with needed improvements to support Museum programming and become a resilient landscape.

• Reinforce the connections between the National Mall, Sculpture Garden, and Museum. Re-establishing key elements of Gordon Bunshaft’s design, including a widened north entry and reopening the underground passage as an immersive art experience, will strengthen the relationship between the Hirshhorn campus and the National Mall. New features such as ground-level east and west overlooks from the Mall into the Garden will deepen that visual connection.

• Revitalize and build upon the historic framework of the Sculpture Garden. The original perimeter walls, south entrance, and underground passage will be restored; an enlarged central reflecting pool will remain the Garden’s focal point; and the design will incorporate enhanced seating and shade to incorporate central elements of Gordon Bunshaft’s original design and Lester Collins’ later modifications.

KEY INFORMATION

• Designed by Gordon Bunshaft of Skidmore, Owings and Merrill, the Hirshhorn campus is located on Independence Avenue SW, framed by 7th Street to the east, the Mary Livingston Ripley Garden to the west, and across Jefferson Drive, the sculpture garden opens to the National Mall along its northern edge. The museum and sculpture garden are organized around the 8th Street north-south axis, aligning with the National Gallery of Art’s Sculpture Garden and the National Archives across the National Mall to the north. When the Hirshhorn opened in 1974, it featured an underground passage below Jefferson Drive, creating an important pedestrian link between the sunken sculpture garden and the Museum Plaza.

• Soon after opening, the sculpture garden proved inhospitable due to the expanse of gravel and lack of shade in the hot, humid DC summers. Additionally, visitor access to the sunken Sculpture Garden was entirely dependent on stairs, making it inaccessible to visitors with strollers or wheelchairs, and persons with limited mobility.

• Modifications to the sculpture garden were completed in 1981 by landscape architect Lester Collins, to improve accessibility and visitor comfort through the introduction of ramped walkways, shade trees, and ground cover plantings. The visitor pathways, now paved in brick, were defined by planting beds or lawn.

• The museum has selected renowned artist and architect Hiroshi Sugimoto to realize the project’s curatorial and programming goals.
• The Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden together have been determined eligible for the National Register of Historic Places, while already considered contributing elements to the National Mall’s listing. The original Determination of Eligibility and draft National Register nomination for the Museum and Sculpture Garden identifies the following features of Gordon Bunshaft’s design as character-defining: sunken plan, concrete perimeter and inner partition walls, north and south stairs, reflecting pool, and setting for the display of sculpture.

• Since the Commission’s concept review, garden elements introduced by Lester Collins in 1981, have been re-evaluated as part of the Section 106 Consultation process and are now considering contributing to the significance of the sculpture garden. Those elements include the hardscape paving, garden “rooms”, lateral north ramps for accessibility, and the east ramp at the intermediate level.

• The Smithsonian Institution’s South Mall Campus Master Plan was approved by the Commission on June 7, 2018. It included recommendations to improve and revitalize both the Hirshhorn Museum and the Sculpture Garden.

• To fulfill the Section 106 requirements for the South Mall Master Plan, both the Smithsonian Institution and NCPC signed a Programmatic Agreement (PA) in 2018.

• The Smithsonian has engaged with the National Capital Planning Commission (NCPC), the U.S. Commission of Fine Arts (CFA), the National Park Service (NPS), the District of Columbia State Historic Preservation Office (DC SHPO), and the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation (ACHP) as required by the South Mall Master Plan Programmatic Agreement.

• The Smithsonian Institution has initiated the Section 106 process for this project, and created a project web site. Five Section 106 Consultation Meetings have been hosted by the Smithsonian and the Hirshhorn Museum to date.

• The Commission provided comments on the concept design at its June 6, 2019 meeting, and supported the Smithsonian’s intention to revitalize the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden to improve the visitor experience and public engagement, and accommodate the museum’s mission and contemporary programming needs. The Commission recommended that the applicant explore a pool alternative that retains the historic character-defining dimensions of Bunshaft’s pool design and recommended the applicant continue to explore ways in which the new stone walls can be compatible with the historic perimeter materials, but differentiated, through material, color tone, or stacking pattern.
RECOMMENDATION

The Commission:

Approves the preliminary site development plans for the Hirshhorn Museum Sculpture Garden Revitalization, with the exception of the proposed changes to the inner partition wall and the reflecting pool.

Supports the Smithsonian’s intention to revitalize the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden to improve the visitor experience and public engagement, as well as accommodate the museum’s mission and contemporary programming needs.

Finds that components of the revitalization can reinforce and improve the visual and physical connections between the National Mall, Sculpture Garden, and Museum.

Finds the revitalization must balance visitor experience, changing programming needs, and historic preservation considerations.

Notes the preliminary design for the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden incorporates a design and artistic vision based on Zen garden principles.

Finds the sculpture garden design has changed substantially over time in response to improving visitor access, environmental comfort, and programmatic needs; however certain components of Bunshaft’s original design including the reflecting pool, perimeter walls, and inner partition wall have remained unchanged.

Visitor Access and Experience

Supports improvements that enhance accessibility to and through the sculpture garden for visitors of all abilities.

Notes the museum site and sculpture garden were originally connected by a tunnel beneath Jefferson Drive. The tunnel was closed in 1993.

Supports re-opening the tunnel connection between the museum and the garden to improve connectivity between the two areas.

Supports the applicant’s preferred approach to expand the stair opening to the top of the monumental Plaza entrance stairs, without bisecting the stairs, which allows for the desired daylight into the stair entrance and tunnel.

Requests the applicant work with the National Park Service regarding design options for Jefferson Drive that improve the pedestrian crossing.
Finds the inclusion of trees and plantings throughout the garden enhance shade which is important to visitor comfort.

Programming

Notes the museum and garden have a need to accommodate interactive art, larger sculpture, and other contemporary installations, in addition to the bronze sculpture collection displayed today.

Supports the museum’s goal to revitalize the sculpture garden to accommodate new, flexible, and varied opportunities for museum programming.

Historic Preservation

Notes that staff analyzed the preliminary design for the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden revitalization project using the Comprehensive Plan policies and the Secretary of the Interior Standards, namely to preserve, rehabilitate, and protect historic landscapes and open spaces, both natural and designed, which are integral components of federal properties.

Notes that in following the guidance of the Comprehensive Plan and the Standards, as well as discussions during the Section 106 consultation process, staff has emphasized the preservation of contributing and character-defining elements of the current garden, while acknowledging that the Museum’s programming needs may justify certain alterations if there are no other alternatives.

Notes the Hirshhorn Museum Building and Sculpture Garden have been determined eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places and the complex was designed by noted architect Gordon Bunshaft.

Notes the original Bunshaft elements have been determined to contribute to the eligibility of the garden. These elements include the sunken plan, concrete perimeter walls and inner partition wall, reflecting pool, south and north stairs, and the setting for display of rotating sculpture.

Notes that the Lester Collin design elements, introduced to the garden in 1981, have been re-evaluated as part of the Section 106 consultation process and have been determined to contribute to the significance of the sculpture garden. Those elements include the hardscape paving, garden “rooms”, lateral north ramps for accessibility, and the east ramp at the intermediate level.

Finds the sunken garden space is a fundamental feature of the original Bunshaft design and the proposed revitalization will not alter the relationship of the garden’s elevation to the National Mall.

Reflecting Pool

Supports the applicant’s desire to improve the area around the reflecting pool, including the addition of another pool, to accommodate new performance programs.

Finds the reflecting pool is a fundamental feature of the original Bunshaft design. The pool proportions were intended to relate to the north window and balcony of the Hirshhorn Museum. The reflecting pool was retained by Collins in his 1981 alterations.
Finds that in response to the Commission’s comments at the concept review, the applicant is proposing a design for the pool element that adds to the reflecting pool’s original dimensions, with an expanded apron of water on three sides.

Finds the design for the proposed treatment of the Bunshaft reflecting pool, with the expanded apron of water on three sides, does not visually retain the distinct dimensions of the original reflecting pool and that the program need for the expansion is unclear.

Recommends the applicant provide a comprehensive rationale for the programming needs that require the expanded aprons around the Bunshaft reflecting pool and study other design alternatives prior to any Commission consideration.

Walls

Notes that all the existing concrete walls within the Sculpture Garden suffer from alkali silica reactions (concrete disease) and require replacement.

Notes that staff has evaluated the Sculpture Garden’s walls in three groups: the perimeter wall, inner partition wall, and the auxiliary walls. Each wall group has a different purpose and relationship to the garden.

Perimeter Walls

Notes the existing perimeter walls are contributing elements to Bunshaft’s garden design and the concrete aggregate material directly relates the sculpture garden to the museum building.

Supports the effort to replace the failing original perimeter aggregate walls of Bunshaft’s design with in-kind materials, consisting of Swenson Pink aggregate, to maintain these character-defining elements.

Supports the reconfiguration of the north and south overlooks and the introduction of new overlooks to the east and west, to improve the connectivity of the garden with the National Mall.

Inner Partition Wall

Notes the inner partition wall is a contributing element to Bunshaft’s garden design and was retained by Collins in his 1981 alteration.

Notes that the current location of the inner partition wall appears to meet the applicant’s programming needs as it will be replaced in the same location.

Notes the applicant proposes to change the inner partition wall’s material composition from the original concrete aggregate to stacked stone, with some Swenson Pink granite stones incorporated, noting the change is part of an artistic vision for the overall garden.

Finds the inner partition wall is a central focus of the overall garden and backdrop to the reflecting pool and the concrete aggregate material directly relates the sculpture garden to the museum building.
**Finds** that the applicant has not demonstrated a strong programmatic rationale for altering this character-defining feature.

**Recommends** the applicant provide a comprehensive rationale of the programming need for the change in material prior to any Commission consideration.

*Auxiliary Walls*

**Notes** that the existing non-contributing auxiliary walls within the garden will be removed to allow for the construction of universal accessibility ramps on the north and south end of the garden and for other programming needs.

**Supports** the introduction of walls in new locations to assist in providing universal accessibility into the garden and to enhance the Museum’s programming needs while serving as backdrops for the sculpture collection.

**Notes** the design proposes the introduction of new stacked stone walls within the garden that will act as new backdrops for displayed art, while defining space.

**Notes** that the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation require that new additions to historic resources be contemporary in design expression but compatible with the historic contributing, character-defining elements.

**Notes** that in keeping with the Standards, new auxiliary walls in the garden should be easily differentiated from the Bunshaft aggregate perimeter walls so as not to create a false sense of history or confusion. The new walls should always be lower in height than the historic concrete perimeter walls to provide a sense of hierarchy.

**Recommends** the applicant continue to explore ways in which the new stacked stone walls can be made more compatible with the historic aggregate perimeter walls and inner partition wall, through material, texture, color tone, or stacking pattern.

*Security*

**Notes** a guard booth will be located from the north side of the garden, adjacent to the National Mall, to the south side, near the western apron, adjacent to the new accessibility ramps.

**Notes** the applicant is continuing to explore options for the design of the guard booth, with input from the consulting parties.

**Notes** that security gates will be located at all pedestrian access to the garden, to allow for securing the garden when not open to the public.

*Stormwater Management*

**Finds** that the garden currently suffers from a lack of updated stormwater management practices, and the garden experiences flooding during significant rain events.
Notes the applicant intends to meet local stormwater management requirements and flooding issues, and therefore has been coordinating with the District Department of Energy and Environment.

Coordination

Requests the applicant continue to coordinate with the National Park Service to address any issues related to potential impacts to the National Mall or Jefferson Drive.

Requests the applicant continue to consult as necessary with the federal agencies and the Section 106 consulting parties, to continue to explore ways to minimize impacts to historic resources, and to determine appropriate mitigation to resolve adverse effects, to be included in a Memorandum of Agreement.

PROJECT REVIEW TIMELINE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Previous actions</th>
<th>June 7, 2018 – approval of South Mall Campus Master Plan.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>June 6, 2019 – approval of comments on concept plan for</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sculpture Garden Revitalization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Remaining actions (anticipated) | Final approval of site development plans. |

PROJECT ANALYSIS

Executive Summary

The Smithsonian Institution has submitted the preliminary site development plans for the revitalization of the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden at the Hirshhorn Museum. Staff analyzed this project using guidance in the Comprehensive Plan, particularly those related to visitor experience and historic preservation. Staff also considered those policies related to parks and open space, given the garden’s location on the National Mall. Staff also utilized the NCPC Adapting Designed Landscapes Assessment Form to assist in analyzing the proposed design and inform the recommendations to the Commission.

The Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden is in a prominent location on the National Mall and changes should ensure a high-quality space that supports the mission of the museum and engages the surrounding context. As identified by the applicant, two of the goals of the project design for the sculpture garden are to reinforce the connections between the National Mall, sculpture garden, and Museum; and to enhance visitor experience and public engagement. Staff believes these goals are consistent with the policies set forth in the Comprehensive Plan, and recommends the Commission
supports the Smithsonian’s intention to revitalize the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden to improve the visitor experience and public engagement, and accommodate the museum’s mission and contemporary programming needs. Further, staff recommends the Commission find that components of the revitalization can reinforce and improve the visual and physical connections between the National Mall, Sculpture Garden, and Museum, and further, the revitalization must balance visitor experience, program needs, and historic preservation considerations.

The Commission reviewed and approved the Smithsonian’s South Mall Campus Plan in June 2018. The Master Plan includes recommendations to restore the Hirshhorn Museum building and to improve connectivity between museums across the campus. The plan also includes other improvements to the Hirshhorn including restoration and re-establishment of the below-grade tunnel that links the museum building and the sculpture garden. The Commission supported the reestablishment of the existing below-grade connection between the museum and sculpture garden to help improve access between the two areas.

Finally, the master plan proposed more substantial alterations to the sculpture garden as well as new below-grade gallery space. These more significant additions are not contemplated as part of the current revitalization plan. The Commission requested that future project submissions for the sculpture garden should describe the proposed program needs, the existing and proposed functionality of the space, and how the project might affect the garden’s original design intent.

The Commission provided comments on the applicant’s concept plans for the revitalization of the Sculpture Garden on June 6, 2019, and commented favorably on many aspects of the project, requesting additional considerations for the historic reflecting pool design, additional information on the proposed new stacked stone walls within the garden, and recommending that the 1981 Lester Collins’ aspects of the garden be evaluated to see if they contribute to the overall historic significance of the garden’s historic character.

Since the 2019 review, the applicant has continued to work with the federal agencies and the Section 106 consulting parties on the design. Staff supports a majority of the project’s components which will enhance the visitor experience and help the Hirshhorn meet its mission to share modern and contemporary art. While many of the components of the project will require additional refinements before the final review, the applicant has responded to the Commission’s comments from 2019, and therefore, staff recommends the Commission approves the preliminary site development plans for the Hirshhorn Museum Sculpture Garden Revitalization, with the exception of the proposed changes to the inner partition wall and the reflecting pool. The two primary outstanding issues, as are described later in this report, include the material treatment of certain garden walls, and the expansion of the original Bunshaft pool.

Analysis

The Sculpture Garden is one component of the Hirshhorn complex, which is located on Independence Avenue SW, and framed by 7th Street to the east, the Mary Livingston Ripley Garden to the west. Located across Jefferson Drive, the garden opens to the National Mall along
its northern edge. The museum and sculpture garden are organized around the 8th Street north-south axis, aligning with the National Gallery of Art’s Sculpture Garden and the National Archives across the National Mall to the north. When the Hirshhorn opened in 1974, it featured an underground passage below Jefferson Drive, creating an important pedestrian link between the sunken sculpture garden and the museum Plaza.

Designed by Gordon Bunshaft of Skidmore, Owings and Merrill, Bunshaft’s design for the sculpture garden was shaped by concrete retaining walls at the east, south, and west, with a planted berm opening to the National Mall at the north. Within these bounds, sculpture was displayed through a series of gravel-paved, austere terraces, and framed by a few internal concrete walls and hedges. It was accessed by a single set of broad stairs from the north, and a pair of lateral stairs from the south, with a second series of wide stairs leading to a central reflecting pool. The Bunshaft elements have been determined to contribute to the eligibility of the garden, including the sunken plan, concrete perimeter and inner partition walls, reflecting pool, south and north stairs, and the setting for display of rotating sculpture, and that later alterations are not character defining features. Therefore, staff recommends the Commission find the sunken garden space is a fundamental feature of the original Bunshaft design and the proposed revitalization will not alter the relationship of the garden’s elevation to the National Mall.

As a significant part of the revitalization of the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden, the museum selected renowned artist and architect Hiroshi Sugimoto to realize three curatorial and programming goals: create flexible space for artists working to push the media of sculpture and performance forward into the twenty-first century; show the museum’s historically significant bronze sculpture collection to strongest effect; and revitalize and build upon the historic framework of the sculpture garden. Mr. Sugimoto’s artistic vision for the garden revitalization incorporates Japanese Zen garden principles, with the key new garden interventions, such as the pool, new stacked stone walls, and the altered partition wall, reflecting these principles. A such, the preliminary design for the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden incorporates a design and artistic vision based on Zen garden principles. Given the project goals and background, staff’s analysis focuses on visitor access and experience, programming, and historic preservation considerations and the project’s consistency with relevant policies included in the Comprehensive Plan.

Visitor Access and Experience

The original garden was not accessible as it predated Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) requirements. Later design changes by Lester Collins in the early 1980s incorporated ramps along the north side of the site and within the garden to allow for an accessible route down to the sculpture. Today, there is no accessible entrance or exit from Jefferson Drive, and the ramps at the north can only be reached via the gravel walk along the National Mall. As such, visitors from the south must travel completely around the site to gain access to the garden. The design proposes ramps accessible from both the north and south providing universal access for all visitors. The southern ramp is located across from the accessible entry on the Museum plaza to help strengthen the campus connection. These changes will help shorten the travel distance for visitors. Thus, staff recommends the Commission support improvements that enhance accessibility to and through the sculpture garden for visitors of all abilities. The proposed design also introduces overlooks on both the east and west sides into the garden which will also be accessible.
As stated previously, the preliminary plan includes goals for the revitalized sculpture garden, including the desire to reinforce the connections between the National Mall, sculpture garden, and museum. When the Hirshhorn opened in 1974, it featured an underground passage below Jefferson Drive, creating an important pedestrian link between the sunken sculpture garden and the museum plaza. The tunnel connecting the Plaza and the garden was closed in 1993 due to safety concerns. Currently, a large-scale artwork sits over the Plaza tunnel entrance. The tunnel was later enclosed for use as the Museum’s ArtLab educational space. The original granite stairs are still present at the back of the ArtLab.

The tunnel’s closure has impeded the original flow of visitors ever since, requiring visitors to exit the sculpture garden and cross Jefferson Drive to access the Hirshhorn Museum. Sugimoto’s concept for the underground passage transforms the tunnel into an immersive art experience. The Underground Passage is lined by two symmetrical stainless-steel curved art panels that reflect light, views, and imagery of the Sculpture Garden. Sugimoto states, “The Garden greenery is experienced like the mirror image of an Impressionist painting by Seurat or Monet, but curved.” The stainless-steel curves into a funnel shape that recalls Sugimoto’s iconic Infinity sculptures. Its northern end widens dramatically to increase the sense of openness to the Sculpture Garden and bring in daylight. This requires limited removal of historic fabric.

As proposed, the majority of the tunnel will remain intact. The Plaza opening will be uncovered and enlarged by extending the opening above the stairs to increase natural light and ventilation into the passage. The design restores the historic stair connecting with the Museum Plaza, with balustrade designs based on historic details, modified to meet today’s code requirements. The north end will be widened to increase daylight into the space. The extant stairs will be restored, and salvaged stair treads will be used to reopen this pedestrian link to the museum plaza. The size of the original plaza stair opening was just under 36 feet in length and surrounded by a concrete balustrade.

The plan proposes to introduce more light into the stair as they descend into the tunnel. This was one of the challenges with the original stair design, as it was dark and uninviting. This design would not impact the historic monumental Plaza stairs rising from Jefferson Drive. The tunnel’s original granite stairs would be restored, and the balustrade will resemble the original design but would meet current building codes.

Overall, staff finds the design approach is successful, and therefore recommends the Commission support the applicant’s preferred approach for the stair opening to the tunnel under Jefferson Drive, to expand the stair opening to the top of the monumental Plaza entrance stairs, without bisecting the stairs, which allows for the desired daylight into the stair entrance and tunnel.

Programming

One of the goals of the project is accommodate new and flexible space for the presentation of contemporary sculpture and performance art. While the mission of the museum remains the same, the types of art and potential for exhibitions continue to change, and the sculpture garden should accommodate those changes. In particular, staff notes the museum and garden has a need to accommodate interactive art, larger sculpture, and other contemporary installation, in addition to the bronze sculpture collection displayed today, and finds the sculpture garden should be
revitalized to accommodate new, flexible, and varied opportunities for museum programming. The preliminary project design responds to the Museum’s vision by creating distinct garden spaces and galleries:

The East Gallery, a series of interconnected open “galleries” for the Hirshhorn’s collection of modern bronze sculptures, maximizing both visual impact and a feeling of intimacy between viewer and work of art. These galleries will also allow for rotating sculptural exhibitions that increase the number of sculptures on display by 50 percent, exploring new narratives within an established history of art.

The West Gallery, an open, flexible lawn space will showcase temporary exhibitions, interactive installations, public programming, and monumental sculpture by contemporary artists. Visitors will engage directly with performers, sound, movement, and materials, at a scale previously unfeasible.

Central Gallery of Reflecting Pool and Performance Area, a shallow water feature in the central garden that will serve as a focal point for visitor engagement and reflection. Sugimoto’s scheme integrates a performance stage, a stacked stone backdrop, and shaded amphitheater seating to form an inviting venue for the performative arts, including music, dance, and participatory art of the twenty-first century.

Entrances and Overlooks, a new and enhanced “front door” on the National Mall, providing space for pause and reflection, with clear vistas encompassing the full breadth of the Garden. Destination artworks positioned around the perimeter will draw visitors in, encouraging flow between the garden and Museum. New shaded seating will provide opportunities for rest and contemplation.

Historic Preservation

The Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden have been determined individually eligible for the National Register of Historic Places, while already considered contributing elements to the National Mall’s listing. The Determination of Eligibility and draft National Register nomination identifies the following features as character-defining: sunken plan, concrete perimeter and inner partition walls, north and south stairs, reflecting pool, and setting for the display of sculpture from Bunshaft’s design.

Soon after opening, the Sculpture Garden proved inhospitable due to the expanse of gravel and lack of shade in the hot, humid DC summers. Additionally, visitor access to the sunken Sculpture Garden was entirely dependent on stairs, making it inaccessible to visitors with strollers or wheelchairs, and persons with limited mobility. Modifications to the garden, which were completed in 1981 by landscape architect Lester Collins, improved accessibility and visitor comfort through the introduction of ramped walkways, shade trees, and ground cover plantings. The visitor pathways, now paved in brick, were defined by planting beds or lawn. Staff notes the Lester Collin design elements, introduced to the garden in 1981, have been re-evaluated as part of the Section 106 consultation process and have been determined to contribute to the significance of the sculpture garden. Those elements include the hardscape paving, garden “rooms”, lateral north ramps for accessibility, and the east ramp at the intermediate level.
Thus, staff recommends the Commission find the sculpture garden design has changed substantially over time in response to improving visitor access and environmental comfort. An additional layer of changes is proposed as part of the revitalization.

Staff has analyzed the preliminary design for the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden revitalization project using the Comprehensive Plan policies and the Secretary of Interior Standards, namely, to preserve, rehabilitate, and protect historic landscapes and open spaces, both natural and designed, which are integral components of federal properties.

Furthermore, in following the guidance of the Comprehensive Plan and the Standards, as well as discussions during the Section 106 Consultation process, staff has emphasized the preservation of contributing and character-defining elements of the current garden, while acknowledging that the Museum’s programming needs may justify certain alterations if there are no other alternatives. Related to this, staff has focused on two major components and their relationship to the historic context, including the reflecting pool and walls, as described below.

**Reflecting Pool**

Bunshaft’s design included a rectangular reflecting pool on the northern end of the sunken central garden, with dimensions that link it to the window and balcony on the north side of the Hirshhorn Museum. The reflecting pool is a character-defining feature for the sculpture garden’s individual eligibility (along with the Museum) for the National Register of Historic Places. Thus, staff recommends the Commission finds the reflecting pool is a fundamental feature of the original Bunshaft design. The pool proportions were intended to relate to the north window and balcony of the Hirshhorn Museum. The reflecting pool was retained by Collins in his 1981 alterations.

The concept plan in 2019 included several alternatives for a re-design of the reflecting pool, all of which significantly enlarged the historic pool. The Commission’s comments in 2019 included the following request and recommendation:

- **Requests** the applicant provide additional details regarding the proposed pool modifications, including the design of the proposed stage and pedestrian paths, to demonstrate the impacts of any changes on the historic character of the pool and the visitor experience.
- **Recommends** the applicant explore a pool alternative that retains the historic character-defining dimensions of Bunshaft’s pool design.

Since the concept review, the applicant looked at various options for the reflecting pool, which were shared with the consulting parties, that retained the footprint of the historic reflecting pool, while creating a new reflecting pool to its south. The applicant had looked at a design that retained the historic reflecting pool in its original location and dimensions, with a new pool to the south, smaller than shown during the concept review, but dismissed this option as it did not meet the program requirements for the revitalization of the garden.
The applicant’s preferred design for the pool elements of the preliminary application consists of a new pool design that retains the historic Bunshaft reflecting pool with its rectangular shape in its current location, but with an extended apron around three sides, plus a new U-shaped pool to the south, with a platform, to serve as a flexible programming and exhibition space. The basins to the north and south of the art platform are stepped, concentrically, and the pool can be drained for programming. Staff recommends the Commission support the applicant’s desire to improve the area around the reflecting pool, including the addition of another pool, to accommodate new performance programs. The applicant has indicated that the historic pool will be heated during winter to allow water to be in the historic pool dimensions. Thus, staff recommends the Commission find that in response to the comments provided at the concept review, the applicant is proposing a design for the pool element that adds to the reflecting pool’s original dimensions, with an expanded apron of water on three sides.

However, staff recommends the Commission find the design for the proposed treatment of the Bunshaft reflecting pool, with the expanded apron of water on three sides, does not visually retain the distinct dimensions of the original reflecting pool and that the program need for the expansion is unclear. As such, staff suggest the Commission recommends the applicant provide a comprehensive rationale for the programming needs that require the expanded aprons around the Bunshaft reflecting pool and study other design alternatives prior to any Commission consideration.

Walls

Within the sculpture garden, walls mark the overall garden boundary, while serving as retaining walls, given the sunken nature of the garden. Staff has evaluated the Sculpture Garden’s walls in three groups: the perimeter walls, interior partition wall, and the auxiliary walls. Each wall group has a different purpose and relationship to the garden. The perimeter walls and the partition wall have been determined to be contributing elements to the significance of the garden. The auxiliary walls include existing non-contributing walls within the garden as well as the proposed new walls to serve as backdrops for the sculpture collection and to frame space.

Under the plan, the original perimeter concrete aggregate walls that were part of Bunshaft’s design will be replaced with in-kind material. According to SI, the replacement is needed due to the structural failing of the original walls. These walls will be re-built in the original locations, with the in-kind material consisting of sandblasted exposed crushed granite aggregate. The walls will also be slightly raised to meet current building codes. Thus, staff notes that all the existing concrete walls within the Sculpture Garden suffer from alkali silica reactions (concrete disease) and require replacement. The existing perimeter walls are contributing elements to Bunshaft’s garden design and the concrete aggregate material directly relates the sculpture garden to the museum building. In addition, staff recommends the Commission support the effort to replace the failing original perimeter aggregate walls of Bunshaft’s design with in-kind materials, consisting of Swenson Pink aggregate, to maintain these character-defining elements.

The walls installed under Lester Collin’s work in 1981 to define the north accessibility ramps will be replaced with new a secondary perimeter wall on the north, to complete the shape of the garden and define arrival points. Similarly, there will be new secondary walls along the new accessibility
ramps on the west side of the garden. The material will be concrete aggregate to compliment the original Bunshaft wall material. The purpose of these walls is to define two new elements of the garden: the enlarged north overlook and the new ramped west entry to the garden. Guardrails and balustrades at Overlooks, the Plaza Stair, and secondary concrete walls will be constructed with consistent material, appearance, and texture as the historic concrete, matching the perimeter walls.

Historic balustrade designs at the South Overlook and Plaza Stair will be adapted for a height of 3’-6” above adjacent grade in order to meet code requirements. The curb height will be slightly raised in order to maintain the historic proportions of the top rail. Horizontal openings larger than 4” will be brought into compliance by introducing a centered horizontal bronze tube.

Under Hiroshi Sugimoto’s design for the applicant, new stacked stone gallery walls are proposed in the revitalization, meant to function as new backdrops for art and further define new programmatic spaces for the garden. The stone walls are always slightly lower than the concrete perimeter walls, as the applicant attempts to form a distinctly different secondary system of organization. The contributing inner partition wall to the north of the Bunshaft reflect pool is proposed to be rebuilt in its same location, but shorter, and with a material change from concrete aggregate, to stacked stone, with some Swenson Pink granite components. The inner partition wall is a contributing element to Bunshaft’s garden design and was retained by Collin’s in his 1981 alteration. In addition, the current location of the inner partition wall appears to meet the applicant’s programming needs as it will be replaced in the same location. However, staff notes the applicant proposes to change the inner partition wall’s material composition from the original concrete aggregate to stacked stone, with some Swenson Pink granite stones incorporated, noting the change is part of an artistic vision for the overall garden.

Consistent with the original garden design, staff recommends the Commission finds the inner partition wall is a central focus of the overall garden and backdrop to the reflecting pool and the concrete aggregate material directly relates the sculpture garden to the museum building. The Commission finds that the applicant has not demonstrated a strong programmatic rationale for altering this character defining feature. Therefore, the Commission recommends the applicant provide a comprehensive rationale of the programming need for the change in material prior to any Commission consideration.

The existing non-contributing auxiliary walls within the garden will be removed to allow for the construction of universal accessibility ramps on the north and south end of the garden and for other programming needs. Overall staff recommends the Commission supports the introduction of walls in new locations to assist in providing universal accessibility into the garden and to enhance the Museum’s programming needs while serving as backdrops for the sculpture collection.

The design proposes the introduction of new stacked stone walls within the garden that will act as new backdrops for displayed art, while defining space. Staff notes that the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation require that new additions to historic resources be contemporary in design expression but compatible with the historic contributing, character-defining elements. In keeping with the Standards, new auxiliary walls in the garden should be
easily differentiated from the Bunshaft aggregate perimeter walls so as not to create a false sense of history or confusion. The new walls should always be lower in height than the historic concrete perimeter walls to provide a sense of hierarchy.

Staff **recommends the applicant continue to explore ways in which the new stacked stone walls can be made more compatible with the historic aggregate perimeter walls and inner partition wall materials, but differentiated, through material, texture, color tone, or stacking pattern.**

Both on the outside of the perimeter walls and within the garden, the applicant is proposing new planter walls, that frame raised planters and function as visitor seating benches. The raised planters alternate with planting at pavement level and create benches at strategic locations throughout the sculpture garden. Placed beneath the shade of trees, benches are proposed throughout the site, both lining planter beds as well as at stone walls. At the reflecting pool, benches are provided in tiers to serve as amphitheater seating. At the East and West Overlooks and around the Elm trees the seating provides a respite and area to view down into the garden. At the East Garden, benches along raised planter beds give opportunities for contemplative viewing of artwork in a more intimate setting.

The preliminary plan includes alterations to the garden overlooks around the sculpture garden. For the north overlook, the north entry will be widened to create a stronger connection to the Mall. To strengthen this arrival point and connection to the Museum, the entrance’s east-west width has been restored to 60’-0” to match the width of the original 1974 north entrance. Flanking stairs into the Sculpture Garden recall the organization of the ramps introduced in 1981. The addition of an overlook at grade with the Mall will welcome visitors as they enter and are oriented with a clear view of the garden. The South Overlook and stairs will be rebuilt based on the original 1974 details with the reuse of original stone stair treads. The east and west overlooks create a transition zone between the surrounding site and the garden. These overlooks provide accessible view opportunities, shaded seating, and the display of sculpture along 7th Street and Mall walkways for visitors. Perimeter seat walls and ground covers are designed to provide a shaded visitor amenity while offering protection for sculpture in the Aprons. Within the Aprons, new overlooks provide views into the Sculpture Garden under the shade of preserved mature Elm trees. These new overlooks will provide educational signage for visitors that describe the history and evolution of the Sculpture Garden. Therefore, staff **recommends the Commission support the reconfiguration of the north and south overlooks and the introduction of new overlooks to the east and west, to improve the connectivity of the garden with the National Mall.**

**Landscaping and Pavement**

The primary purpose of the sculpture Garden is the display of art and the creation of a venue for programming such as performances and other events. Therefore, the Hirshhorn’s mission distinguishes the sculpture garden from other public gardens. The landscape design expresses this need through the creation of a subdued and restrained plant palette which encourages a focus on art display and the comfortable viewing of art works. The number of trees, their canopy type, shape, and location were carefully studied to balance the need for open display areas with the critical need for shade.
The proposed tree and plant palette reflect design influences of both Gordon Bunshaft and Lester Collin and draw similar inspiration from Japanese and Chinese gardens. In addition to the careful preservation of the mature Elm trees at the East and West Aprons, cherry trees reminiscent of those introduced in 1981 will grace the northern edge of the Sculpture Garden. A Sugar Maple will be located nearly in the exact location as the one introduced in 1981. Two additional Sugar Maple trees will flank the North Overlook and reinforce the Sculpture Garden’s north-south axis. A cluster of pines is introduced in the East Galleries, in keeping with Asian garden design traditions seen in the 1981 plantings.

Trees have been selected for visual characteristics of form, texture, color, seasonal diversity, and resiliency in addition to reflecting Sculpture Garden history. Trees will frame views into the Sculpture Garden from overlooks at all four cardinal directions. Trees along the north and south edges of the Sculpture Garden are held back from the central axis to enhance connections between the Museum and the National Mall. This axis is further framed by the trees flanking the Central Gallery.

Shade trees are introduced throughout to enhance visitor comfort: at benches around planters and tiered seating flanking the Central Gallery. Tightly spaced red maple trees will create a grove-like effect with a delicate canopy that reinforces the human scale of the gallery rooms. The maple trees will grow straight and upward to create a high, lacy canopy with brilliant red color in the fall. This canopy will produce a soft, filtered light with dappled shade. North of center of this grove like area, a contrasting trio of Loblolly Pines will create a year-round evergreen highlight.

All tree species except three are native or cultivars of North American native plants. Under-story natives and non-natives will be utilized for diversity and resiliency. Tree placement for the revitalization has been strategic to provide shade over seating areas within the East Galleries and throughout to create a comfortable environment for the viewing of art.

The proposed tree plan is compliant with the NCPC tree replacement guidelines. No trees 31.8” diameter or greater will be removed. Existing trees were assessed for potential successful transplant and no candidates were identified. Replacement trees are native or non-invasive and will be planted at larger than the minimum caliper size or height. Forty-nine existing trees will be removed as a part of this project with forty-nine replacements required and provided. The new trees will be planted on the project site within the limits of disturbance. Planting soil volumes are consistent with industry best practices.

For the ground plane, simple planes of ground cover plants will provide a complementary base for display of works of art. Diverse plantings at the ground plane have been selected for diversity of form, texture, seasonal interest and height to emphasize and complement sculpture and architecture. The design concept incorporates a stylized naturalism, refined with soft tones and lush textures. The ground plane has been developed to be a horticulturally rich mix of primarily native species set in drifts in raised and at grade planting beds.

Visitors encounter a rich four-season landscape, with delicate flowering plants and moments of discovery in each gallery. The proposed planting is a sustainable planting palette of 47 species of
individual plants. The overall design includes 60-70% native planting by quantity/area. The interdisciplinary team has made efforts to introduce plantings native to the region as well as those connected to Asian garden design concepts present throughout the Sculpture Garden’s history. Anticipating a changing climate, species are selected for this, and slightly warmer hardiness zones. Thus, **staff recommends the Commission finds the inclusion of trees and plantings throughout the garden enhance shade and are important to visitor comfort.**

**Materials**

Salvaged and new Swenson Pink granite is used in keeping with the historic material palette of the Sculpture Garden. Swenson Pink will be incorporated at visitor arrival points including the North and South Overlooks, stair treads and ramps. Original stair treads salvaged and stored by the Smithsonian during the 1981 modifications will be reinstalled. New dimensional granite will be used as required for a consistent and harmonious overall treatment. The pavers will be approximately 18”x36.”

Reclaimed Asian granite pavers, salvaged from paths and plazas, will be used for the horizontal paving within the Sculpture Garden. Individual pavers are elongated in shape and vary in size, typically 9”x72”. At the Central Gallery, reclaimed pavers will be approximately 18”x36” typically, with large rectangular granite slabs to be installed at the Art Platform.

The reflecting pool will be clad in Absolute Black granite consistent with the existing reflecting pool material, and to contrast with surrounding paving for safety. The material used for the historic 1974 pool basin may be treated differently - with a distinct honed or thermal finish - to differentiate and highlight this area.

A custom bronze handrail is envisioned along stairs and ramps throughout the Sculpture Garden and connecting to the Museum Plaza from the Underground Passage. The code-compliant handrails will have a roughly oval shape, with a continuous recess below to receive a linear lighting element. The handrails are to be supported on cast bronze posts along stone walls, and attached directly to concrete walls with bronze brackets.

**Stormwater Management**

The sunken Sculpture Garden has faced challenges throughout its history with its unique micro-climate and sunken location, and its elevation approximately eleven feet below the National Mall. The Sculpture Garden experiences heavy flooding that threatens collections, endangers plant health, and stifles operations during and after major storms. Its facilities are especially vulnerable to flooding when heavy precipitation occurs over a short period. **Staff recommends the Commission find that the garden currently suffers from a lack of updated stormwater management practices, with the garden experiencing flooding during high rain events.**

The applicant intends to meet the stormwater management requirements of the District’s Office of Energy and Efficiency (DOEE) and has been coordinating with DOEE. A multi-tiered storm water management strategy is proposed to meet DOEE requirements and achieve a sustainable, long-term solution for the Sculpture Garden’s unique below-grade conditions. Discussed in consultation
with DOEE, the approach includes under-slab retention and infiltration along with capture, treatment, and reuse of storm water. A 20,000-gallon cistern beneath the North Overlook is proposed to capture storm water. The captured water will be treated to meet potable water requirements and reused on site for irrigation and toilet demand. Currently being studied is the use of treated storm water to recharge the central reflecting pool, which provides evaporative cooling for visitor comfort during the unrelenting heat of the summer months.

Water retained under slab will be infiltrated to recharge groundwater. Plantings will benefit from this stored storm water without being inundated. The conservation of the heritage elms will also earn storm water credits as DOEE considers this a storm water retention practice. Percolation tests will be conducted in the coming weeks to confirm soil conditions and volumes. A new storm sewer line that connects with the 7th Street main will be installed to address any water not infiltration or reused on site. In addition to addressing the lack of adequate drainage and associated flooding, temporary flood barriers will be deployed at Sculpture Garden entrances, ramps, and stairs prior to heavy storm events.

**Lighting**

In regard to lighting, the preliminary plan intends for the sculpture garden to achieve the holistic goal of being a good neighbor that is consistent with other buildings and sites on the National Mall while not competing with major landmarks such as the Washington Monument, particularly during the nighttime. Light sources will be fully integrated and concealed within the architecture to provide a soft, luminous glow on paving and adjacent hard surfaces. This strategy is combined with a layered approach to provide appropriate levels of illumination for the Garden’s unoccupied and occupied conditions. The lighting design aims to meet the dark sky approach.

General site lighting includes LED fixtures integrated within seat walls and handrails to create an ambient glow on adjacent surfaces, ground planes and egress paths. Lighting mock-ups will be studied to orient these fixtures for a wide spread of light on adjacent paths. Handrail lighting systems provide required ramp and stair illumination that comply with prescribed life safety lighting requirements.

Unique, location-specific lighting within the Sculpture Garden is found at the Underground Passage, Reflecting Pool, and Allée. At the Underground Passage, linear coves are concealed above and below the art walls, providing illumination for circulation, small events, and operational needs. Submersible wet/dry LED fixtures concealed at the Art Platform and walkway edge illuminate the stepped basin. Fixtures concealed within the concrete wall that supports the North Overlook illuminate the Allée paving.

At Aprons, works of art are illuminated via hidden, in-grade LED fixtures. Additionally, portable cord and plug art lighting is to be provided as required for art programming and events. A lighting control system will allow for multi-scene and fixture dimming control affording the Museum the capacity to program light levels for a variety of functions.
The lighting concept for the Underground Passage includes linear LED coves at the base and top of the stainless-steel walls following the curvature of the wall. Small aperture LED downlights at the entry and exit provide additional illumination as required. Overall, staff finds the lighting approach is appropriate and compatible with the museum’s goals and the setting.

Security

The Sculpture Garden revitalization proposes a layered approach to security that includes perimeter strengthening, camera surveillance, lighting, and a 24-hour personnel presence on site. Integrated security gates will protect the Sculpture Garden’s major entrances after dark. At Overlook perimeter walls, double-leaf security gates will swing and extend out from recesses in the walls. At accessible entrances, sliding security gates will extend across the pedestrian route. At the Underground Passage, a security grille will close off the entrance from the base of the Plaza stairs. The security gates will be located at all pedestrian access to the garden, to allow for securing the garden when not open to the public.

Personnel presence will ensure safety for visitors and artwork. A guard booth will be re-located from the north side of the garden, adjacent to the National Mall, to the south side, near the western apron, adjacent to the new accessibility ramps. A guard booth provided at the SW corner of the site will allow for in-person surveillance to accompany site cameras. Video camera surveillance will be discretely placed throughout the garden with 24-hour full coverage of the sunken garden, aprons, and passage. In the Aprons, temporary light fixtures providing sculpture illumination will add security for sculptures placed along this edge. The applicant is continuing to explore options for the design of the guard booth, with input from the Consulting parties.

CONFORMANCE TO EXISTING PLANS, POLICIES AND RELATED GUIDANCE

Comprehensive Plan for the National Capital

Staff has reviewed policies from the Urban Design, Historic Preservation, Parks and Open Space, and Visitors & Commemoration Elements, and the analysis and recommendations are intended to support consistency with the Comprehensive Plan.

National Historic Preservation Act

Both the Smithsonian Institution and NCPC have independent responsibilities to comply with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA). To fulfill the Section 106 requirements for the South Mall Master Plan, both the Smithsonian Institution and NCPC, a Programmatic Agreement was signed in 2018.
The Smithsonian Institution has initiated the Section 106 process for this project, with Public Meeting #1 held on 4/10/19, and creation of a project web site. SI has held five Consultation meetings to date. Due to the anticipated adverse effects expected, a Memorandum of Agreement will be prepared to formalize mitigation measures. The Smithsonian has also engaged with the NCPC, CFA, DC SHPO, NPS, and the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation as required by the South Mall Master Plan Programmatic Agreement.

**National Environmental Policy Act**

NCPC is the lead agency for compliance with the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA). The revitalization of the Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden was among the projects identified in the Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) prepared as part of the South Mall Master Plan. The proposed revitalization scope is less that that evaluated in the EIS.

**CONSULTATION**

**Coordinating Committee**

The Committee forwarded the proposed preliminary site development plans to the Commission with the statement that the proposal has been coordinated with all participating agencies. The DC SHPO noted that this undertaking will result in significant adverse effects on the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden and Museum. The DC SHPO is coordinating subject to completion of Section 106 but does not support the proposal because the Smithsonian Institution has failed to provide persuasive arguments why, at a minimum, Bunshaft’s reflecting pool cannot be retained in its original form to preserve more of the garden’s modernist character and the important visual connection with the museum’s singular window. Several consulting parties have raised similar objections, but the Smithsonian Institution has not modified its plans in any ways that will meaningfully or substantially avoid or minimize adverse effects. The participating agencies were: NCPC; the District of Columbia Department of Transportation; the District of Columbia Department of Energy and Environment; the General Services Administration; the District of Columbia State Historic Preservation Office (DC SHPO); the National Park Service; and the Washington Metropolitan Area Transit Authority.

**U.S. Commission of Fine Arts**

At their May 16, 2019, the U.S. Commission of Fine Arts commented favorably on the concept design for the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden Revitalization. Please see attached letter. The project is anticipated returning to the Commission in 2021.
ONLINE REFERENCE

The following supporting documents for this project are available online at www.ncpc.gov:

- Submission Package
- Letters of support for project submitted by the Smithsonian Institution
- Section 106 Consultation comment letters and Museum responses
- Cultural Landscape Foundation letters
- Public Comments

POWERPOINT (ATTACHED)

Prepared by Lee Webb
11/25/2020
Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden - Sculpture Garden Revitalization

Independence Avenue, SW & 7th Street, SW, Washington DC

Approval of Preliminary Site Development Plans

Smithsonian Institution
Project Summary

The Smithsonian Institution has submitted preliminary site development plans for the revitalization of the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden at the Smithsonian’s Hirshhorn Museum. The Hirshhorn Museum is located 700 Independence Avenue, SE, Washington, DC, on the National Mall, and is part of the Hirshhorn Museum complex. As shown in the concept review in 2019, the primary changes to the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden proposed in this preliminary review include: the introduction of new stacked stone walls within the garden to serve as backdrops and to delineate space, a new pool and extension of the historic reflecting pool in the lower garden, new garden overlooks on the east and west side of the garden, new accessibility ramps from the north and south on the western side of the garden, and alteration to a historic partition wall within the garden. The historic concreted perimeter wall will be replaced with in-kind materials and the historic tunnel underneath Jefferson Street will be reopened. This application also includes more information on lighting, guard booths, and materials.

The Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden’s Determination of Eligibility and draft National Register nomination identifies the following features as character-defining: sunken plan, concrete perimeter walls and sense of enclosure, center axis entrance and exits, reflecting pool, and setting for the display of sculpture. The revitalization of the Garden’s materials and infrastructure will be accomplished using best practices for safety, sustainability, and resilience, while incorporating the character-defining features of the original design.
Project Summary

Designed by Gordon Bunshaft of Skidmore, Owings and Merrill, the Hirshhorn campus is located on Independence Avenue SW, framed by 7th Street to the east, the Mary Livingston Ripley Garden to the west, and across Jefferson Drive, the Sculpture Garden opens to the National Mall along its northern edge. The Museum and Sculpture Garden are organized around the 8th Street north-south axis, aligning with the National Gallery of Art’s Sculpture Garden and the National Archives across the National Mall to the north. When the Hirshhorn opened in 1974, it featured an underground passage below Jefferson Drive, creating an important pedestrian link between the sunken Sculpture Garden and the Museum Plaza.

Bunshaft’s realized design for the Sculpture Garden was shaped by concrete retaining walls at the east, south, and west, with a planted berm opening to the National Mall at the north. Within these bounds, sculpture was displayed through a series of gravel-paved, austere terraces, and framed by a few internal concrete walls and hedges. It was accessed by a single set of broad stairs from the north, and a pair of lateral stairs from the south, with a second series of wide stairs leading to a central reflecting pool.

Soon after opening, the Sculpture Garden proved inhospitable due to the expanse of gravel and lack of shade in the hot, humid DC summers. Additionally, visitor access to the sunken Sculpture Garden was entirely dependent on stairs, making it inaccessible to visitors with strollers or wheelchairs, and persons with limited mobility. Modifications to the Garden, which were completed in 1981 by landscape architect Lester Collins, improved accessibility and visitor comfort through the introduction of ramped walkways, shade trees, and ground cover plantings. The visitor pathways, now paved in brick, were defined by planting beds or lawn.

PROJECT GOALS

The Hirshhorn has selected renowned artist and architect Hiroshi Sugimoto to revitalize the Sculpture Garden in support of both its curatorial and programmatic objectives as well as to improve the visitor experience and to meet its infrastructure needs. Sugimoto has designed a variety of indoor and outdoor spaces that create meaningful linkages between art and architecture. He has had a long relationship with the Hirshhorn, beginning with his first major US retrospective in 2006 and, most recently, his innovative redesign of the Museum’s lobby. The proposed design will address the following project goals:

Reinforce the connections between the National Mall, Sculpture Garden, and Museum. Re-establishing key elements of Bunshaft’s design, including a widened north entry and reopening the underground passage as an immersive art experience, will strengthen the relationship between the Hirshhorn campus and the National Mall. New features such as ground-level east and west overlooks from the Mall into the Garden will deepen that visual connection.
Project Summary

*Enhance visitor experience and public engagement.* New ramps from the north and south will provide universal accessibility, while increased shade and seating within the Garden and along its edges will create welcoming spaces for visitors throughout the year.

*Create flexible space for artists working to push the media of sculpture and performance forward into the twenty-first century.* An open lawn and expanded central reflecting pool will host a variety of year-round uses to support the Hirshhorn’s expanded programming.

*Show the Museum’s historically significant bronze sculpture collection to strongest effect.* The creation of outdoor galleries will respond to curatorial needs by increasing the number of sculptures on view by 50 percent through rotating sculptural exhibitions. Smaller roomlike moments within the Garden will create intimate experiences between viewers and individual works of art.

*Revitalize and build upon the historic framework of the Sculpture Garden.* The original perimeter walls, south entrance, and underground passage will be restored; an enlarged central reflecting pool will remain the Garden’s focal point; and the design will incorporate enhanced seating and shade to incorporate central elements of Gordon Bunshaft’s original design and Lester Collins’ later modifications.

*Replace failing infrastructure, meet current code requirements, and design for resilience and sustainability.* Infrastructure to address storm water management, flood mitigation, improved security, and new lighting and audiovisual systems will equip the Sculpture Garden with needed improvements to support Museum programming and become a resilient landscape.
Project Summary

By addressing each of these goals, the proposed design for the Sculpture Garden revitalization will holistically improve access, visitor experience, and the presentation of modern and twenty-first-century art as well as the operations and maintenance of the Sculpture Garden. This next evolution of the Sculpture Garden will give new life to a beloved setting, as an all-season venue to experience art in the nation’s capital outside the confines of the traditional Museum setting.

The preliminary design is in conformance with the approved Smithsonian South Mall Master Plan. The restoration of the perimeter concrete walls of the Sculpture Garden was a need identified as a project under the Master Plan. To date, the Smithsonian is in compliance with the Programmatic Agreement for the Master Plan, and will continue to follow public process and mitigations outlined in the Agreement. The Section 106 process for this project has been initiated with the Smithsonian hosting many public and consultation meetings over the last 2 years. The Smithsonian has also engaged with the NCPC, NPS, CFA, DC SHPO and the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation as required by the South Mall Master Plan Programmatic Agreement.
Vicinity Map and Project Area
Location Map and Context
Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden Revitalization Project
Project Team
# Table of Contents

## 1. Introduction
- Overview
- Mission
- Goals
- Public Process Resolution

## 2. Project Context
- Area Description
- Transportation
- Existing Conditions
- Site History and Preservation

## 3. Program and Vision
- Program
- Curatorial Vision

## 4. Proposed Design
- Design Vision
- Scale and Organization
- Overlooks and Entries
- West Gallery
- East Galleries
- Central Gallery
- Underground Passage

## 5. Landscape + Materials
- Landscape
- Concrete Walls
- Concrete Guardrails
- Stacked Stone Walls
- Inner Partition Wall
- Stone Seating Elements
- Stone Paving
- Handrails
- Lighting
- Security
- Signage
- Flooding and Stormwater Management
- Sustainability
- Utilities

## Appendix

### A. Reports
- South Mall Campus Master Plan and EIS Record of Decision
- Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources

### B. Design Studies
- Reflecting Pool Balustrade
- Plaza Access
- Guard Booth

---

**National Capital Planning Commission**

**File: 7889**
Project Introduction

CHAPTER 1 - INTRODUCTION

OVERVIEW

The Smithsonian Institution’s Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden serves as the national museum of modern art. Its collection ranks among the top tier of modern and contemporary art museums. Since 1974, the Museum has invited local, national, and international visitors to engage with its most important art, artists and ideas of our time.

The Hirshhorn routinely welcomes nearly one million visitors annually to the Museum, yet less than 150,000 people experience the Sculpture Garden adjacent to the National Mall. Forty-six years after its dedication, the Museum’s Sculpture Garden requires urgent repairs to address irreversible deterioration of its concrete structure and severely failing systems and a more accessible welcome to the more than 30 million annual visitors to the National Mall.

The Hirshhorn’s proposed revitalization fulfills its mission and obligation as steward of its world-renowned collection. The revitalization design by renowned architect Hiroshi Sugimoto provides a flexible venue for changes in artmaking, improves visitor amenities, provides universal accessibility and prepares the Sculpture Garden for future generations. While Gordon Bunshaft’s iconic Museum building is largely unchanged, the Plaza and Sculpture Garden are outdoor gallery spaces that have experienced significant modifications beginning in the late 1970s. The proposed design is the next phase of the evolution of the Hirshhorn Museum as it transitions from the twentieth century into the twenty first century.

MISSION

The Hirshhorn is a leading voice for modern and contemporary art and culture and provides a national platform for the art and artists of our time. We seek to share the transformative power of modern and contemporary art with audiences at all levels of awareness and understanding by creating meaningful, personal experiences in which art, artists, audiences, and ideas converge. We enhance public understanding and appreciation of modern and contemporary art through acquisition, exhibitions, education and public programs, conservation, and research.

Situated at the southern end panels at the edge of the National Mall, the Sculpture Garden serves as the major arrival point for visitors approaching the Hirshhorn from the north. The Sculpture Garden’s revitalization is an important opportunity to enhance connections between the Museum and the National Mall, and welcome more visitors to experience the Museum’s extraordinary collections and groundbreaking programming.

As the nation’s only major modern art museum with free admission, the Hirshhorn, especially its Sculpture Garden, offers an extraordinary opportunity to offer visitors an encounter with our time’s most important art. The Hirshhorn is uniquely positioned to captivate an audience far larger than well-informed art-lovers, by providing the public a chance to encounter with art on the National Mall that can spark transformational curiosity.

The Sculpture Garden plays an essential role in the fulfillment of the Museum’s mission, providing spaces for the presentation of modern and contemporary sculpture, and more recent genres of time-based and performance art. In recent decades, contemporary artists are working at ever larger scales and engage visitors in new, dynamic ways. The existing Sculpture Garden cannot adequately accommodate the range of works found in the art of today and anticipated for the future. As part of the Smithsonian Institution, the Hirshhorn is obligated to present its national collection of modern masterworks to its greatest effect while providing universal accessibility and the broadest access and engagement.

GOALS

• Fulfill our mission by showing the Museum’s historically significant bronze sculpture collection to a stronger effect. The creation of outdoor galleries will respond to custodial needs by increasing the number of sculptures on view by nearly 50 percent through rotating sculpture exhibitions. Smaller rooftop moments within the Sculpture Garden will create intimate experiences between viewers and individual works of art.

• Respond and adapt to changes in参观ism by creating flexible spaces for artists working to push the media of sculpture and performance forward into the twenty-first century and large-scale, site-specific commissions. The West Gallery open setup and expanded central Reflecting Pool and Art Pavilion will host a variety of year-round uses to support the Hirshhorn’s expanded programming.

• Enhance visitor experience and public engagement. New ramps from the north and south will provide universal accessibility, while increased shade and seating within the Sculpture Garden and along its edges will create welcoming spaces for visitors throughout the year.

• Replace failing infrastructure, meet current code requirements, and design for resilience and sustainability. Infrastructure to address storm water management, flood mitigation, improved security, and new lighting and audiovisual systems will equip the Sculpture Garden with needed improvements to support Museum programming and become a resilient landscape.

• Reinforce the connections between the National Mall, Sculpture Garden, and Museum. Re-establishing key elements of Gordon Bunshaft’s campus design, including a widened north entry and re-opening the underground passage as an immersive art experience, will strengthen the relationship between the Hirshhorn campus and the National Mall and create a welcoming new “front door” to the Museum. New features such as ground-level east and west overviews from the Mall into the Sculpture Garden.

Sculpture Garden Revitalization
Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden

National Capital Planning Commission
File: 7889
Sculpture Garden will deepen a visual connection with the National Mall context.

- Revitalize and build upon the historic framework of the Sculpture Garden. The original perimeter walls, south entrance, and underground passages will be restored; an enhanced central reflecting pool will remain the Sculpture Garden’s focal point; and the design will incorporate enhanced seating and shaded areas to incorporate central elements of Gordon Bunshaft’s original design and Lester Colfitt’s later modifications.

**PUBLIC PROCESS**

Revitalization of the Sculpture Garden is a design project within the Smithsonian Institution’s South Mall Campus Master Plan. On June 7, 2018, the project was approved by the Commission under the Program Agreement for the Master Plan, which is the resolution of the Section 106 process for the South Mall Campus Master Plan. The Sculpture Garden Revitalization will continue to follow public process and mitigation outlined in the Program Agreement. The Program Agreement is the resolution of the Section 106 process for the South Mall Campus Master Plan. The project will execute needs identified in this master plan including recommendations to improve connectivity between museums across the campus, and restore and revitalize the below-grade tunnel link between the Hirshhorn Plaza and Sculpture Garden. The master plan proposed more substantial alterations to the Sculpture Garden as well as new below-grade gallery space. These more extensive changes are not a part of the current project.

The Smithsonian Institution has conducted extensive public engagement regarding this Sculpture Garden Revitalization project. As required by the Program Agreement, consultations with NCPC, CFA, NPS, the DC SHPO, and the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation were initiated in 2017, with additional consultations held on August 29, 2018; October 1, 2018; February 8, 2019; and August 5, 2020.

The Section 106 process began with a public meeting on April 10, 2019, to present the design concept to the consulting parties and the public. As part of this process, the project website was developed providing opportunities for the public to register for virtual meetings as well as download copies of all meeting presentations. Consultations continued with public meetings on September 11, 2019; February 24, 2020; May 27, 2020; and October 7, 2020.

On September 11, 2019, the Smithsonian hosted an open house to review stacked stone wall mock-ups with members of the consulting parties and the public. Two stone wall designs were considered: a geometric design using stones with a cool tone and a more organic design using stones warmer in character. Feedback from the consulting parties indicated strong support for the museum’s preferred option featuring a more organic design (shown in the photograph at left top). Since that time, sculptures from the museum’s permanent collection of varying sizes, materials, and textures have been reviewed in front of these mock-ups confirming the appropriateness and appropriateness of the stone wall design as a backdrop for a range of works in the Museum’s collections.

The February 24, 2020 meeting was focused on presenting the analysis of the Period of Significance, the evolution of the Sculpture Garden, and curatorial and programming goals. The research on the craftsmanship by Lester Colfitt was made available for review and comment by the consulting parties and public. This meeting resulted in the revision of the Period of Significance to be 1974-1981 to include the modifications by Lester Colfitt.

At the May 27, 2020 meeting, the Smithsonian Institution presented the draft assessment of effects on historic properties for review and comment by the consulting parties and public. The full document was made available on the website for additional comment after the presentation.

In August 2020, the Smithsonian posted an update to the project website for review and public comment. The supplemental materials included alterations proposed to character-defining features, two additional reflecting pool studies, and the Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources.

At the most recent meeting on October 7, 2020, proposed mitigation and mitigation for the adverse effects were presented with a request for comments. Concluding steps of the Section 106 process are anticipated for early 2021 including drafting and finalization of a memorandum of agreement alongside a review of a third design mock-up.

NCPC approved comments on the Concept Design on March 5, 2019, and CFA favorably reviewed the Concept Design at its June 2019 meeting. Final NCPC and CFA review is anticipated in the spring of 2021.
RESOLUTION
In response to comments and feedback received from NCPC Commissioners on May 3, 2019 and throughout the Section 106 process, this preliminary design submission includes further information and design evolution. NCPC made the following requests, recommendations, and comments.

Reflecting Pool
- Requests: additional details regarding proposed pool modifications including the design of the proposed stage and pedestrian paths, to demonstrate the impacts of any changes on the historic character of the pool and the visitor experience.
- Recommends: Explore a pool alternative that retains the historic character-defining dimensions of Bunshaft’s pool design.
- Consulting Party Comment: Address the programmatic need for a larger reflecting pool.

Stacked Stone Walls
- Requests: Provide ways in which the new stone walls can be compatible with the historic parametric materials, but differentiated, through material, color tone, or stacking pattern.
- Supports: The introduction of new walls to define space in the garden and serve as a backdrop for sculpture collection. The new walls should always be lower in height than the concrete perimeter walls, forming distinctly different secondary system of organization.
- Consulting Party Comment: Look at replacing the inner partition wall with in-kind concrete.
- Consulting Party Comment: Provide more information on the proposed material treatment for the inner partition wall. Clarify if it is only to be granite to match the new stacked stone walls or if it will include aggregate to complement the original Bunshaft walls.

Pedestrian Access
- Requests: The Commission requests that the Smithsonian work with NPS regarding potential alternatives for Jefferson Drive that improve the pedestrian crossing.

Historic Preservation
- Notes: The Lester Collins design elements, introduced to the garden in 1961, will need to be reevaluated as part of the Section 106 consultation process.

Signage
- Consulting Party Comment: Explain how on-site interpretation will take place and how it will show the layered site history and articulate the altered character-defining features such as the inner partition wall and reflecting pool.

Graphical and narrative responses to the above comments are included herein, along with preliminary submission requirements. On pages 29-30, updated reflecting pool design information shows incorporation of the historic Bunshaft pool footprint with a termed configuration that also enhances opportunities for varied modes of public engagement. On pages 48-50 internal stacked stone wall design is articulated along with further use of the mock ups for study of sculpture placement.
**Project Context**

**Area Description**

The Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden is located at the south side of the National Mall, centered on the city’s 8th Street axis facing the National Gallery of Art, Sculpture Garden and the National Archives Building. The Museum’s campus is bounded by 7th Street at east, Independence Avenue SW at south, Mary Livingston Ripley Garden at west, and the Mall at north. Jefferson Drive bisects the campus, running east-west between the Museum Plaza, and the Sculpture Garden. The 9th Street tunnel passes under the west side of the campus.

The Sculpture Garden is situated in the aim panel that runs along the south edge of the National Mall. Its area— including sunken areas created by perimeter concrete retaining walls and street level areas at east and west, known as Aprons — is approximately 74,000 square feet. The site has been used continuously as a sculpture garden since 1974. Through this proposed revitalization it will continue to evolve to serve this function. Non-Federal lands south of the Museum are zoned for high-density development (D-4, D-5 and D-8).

The revitalization of the Sculpture Garden was among the projects identified in the Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) prepared as part of the South Mall Campus Master Plan. NCPC has not reviewed Smithsonian support for additional NEPA, as part of this project. The South Mall Campus Master Plan Record of Decision mitigation measures applies to the Sculpture Garden’s design and construction. Refer to appendix pages 62 and 63 for the applicable mitigation measures. As a previously developed site, there are no existing wetlands or natural habitats for endangered species. As noted in the EIS, wildlife in the project area is limited to those highly adapted to urban environments. No endangered or threatened species are known to be harbored on the proposed project site.
Project Context

TRANSPORTATION
Located in the vibrant South Mall campus of the Smithsonian, the Sculpture Garden is accessible by public and private transportation. The Smithsonian does not provide public parking and the South Mall campus is reliant on a robust public transit system. Existing transportation to the site will be unchanged by the Sculpture Garden revitalization. No parking is currently provided on site nor will be added as part of this project.

The site diagram illustrates key locations for Metro, bus, bicycle, pedestrian, and vehicular transportation. Multiple Metro and bus lines are within walking distance. The Metro’s Green, Yellow, Blue, and Orange Lines stop at the L’Enfant Plaza station, three blocks south of the Sculpture Garden, and the Blue and Orange Lines also stop at the Smithsonian Station, one long block west of the Sculpture Garden. The National Mall Circulator stops at the intersection of Jefferson Drive and 7th Street SW and the free District Wharf neighborhood shuttle stops at the intersection of 7th Street and Independence Avenue SW. Bikeshare stations and bike racks within two blocks of the site provide an alternative mode of transportation. The museum building and plaza revitalization will study the potential for additional bike rack locations on the Hirshhorn campus.

Daily commutes to the site will not increase, as no new employment is anticipated as a result of the project. Visitation to the specific site is anticipated to increase, but can be accommodated by the existing transportation infrastructure. The site transportation is consistent with that outlined in the South Mall Campus Master Plan.
Existing Conditions Photographs
Existing Conditions Photographs
Site History and Preservation

The Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden functions as the Smithsonian Institution's museum of modern and contemporary art, designed to house the collection of benefactor Joseph H. Hirshhorn. Architected Gordon Bunshaft of the firm Skidmore, Owings & Merrill designed the Sculpture Garden in conjunction with the Museum and Plaza, which opened to the public in 1974. As the design for the Museum evolved between 1967 and 1971, Bunshaft's initial design for a cross Mall Sculpture Garden significantly changed with a reduction in the size of the Sculpture Garden and its central reflecting pool.

Bunshaft's resulting design for the Sculpture Garden was minimal and austere to provide a neutral setting in which the artwork would be prominent. The sunken Sculpture Garden consisted of a series of terraces, paved in gravel and subdivided into smaller spaces with walls and plantings. Concrete cast in place walls with an exposed aggregate surface bordered the Sculpture Garden on the east, south and west, and an earth berm separated the Sculpture Garden from the National Mall on the north, creating an intimate space in contrast with the open Mall vistas. Visitors accessed the Sculpture Garden through a wide single set of stairs on the north and a pair of lateral stairs on the south, with a second series of wide stairs leading to a central reflecting pool. An underground tunnel and staircase connected the Sculpture Garden with the Museum Plaza beside the Jefferson Drive. The majority of the outdoor space consisted of stone paving and gravel with no grass and few plants to offer shade. After the Sculpture Garden opened to the public, the vast gravel expanses and almost complete lack of shade resulted in an inhospitable environment for visitors.
Site Timeline
Project Context

In 1977, the Smithsonian Institution commissioned landscape architect Lester Collins to modify the Sculpture Garden to provide accessibility and environmental comfort. Planting beds, a sod lawn, and brick pathways replaced gravel and concrete. Additional modifications included the installation of a reflecting pool, the addition of shade trees, and the creation of open-air rooms. The project also involved the redesign of the west stairs, which were narrowed to allow for two new ramps. The redesign also changed the topography of the garden, including the addition of a new fountain at the eastern side of the site. The modified Sculpture Garden opened in September 1981.

The Sculpture Garden has continued to evolve, most notably with the closure of the underground passageway in the 1990s. Other significant changes include the replacement of landscape plantings and the removal of the sunken Sculpture Garden. The pool is often kept milky to create an emergency reservoir to mitigate frequent flooding events. However, the evolution of the Sculpture Garden has always been in support of the Hirshhorn's mission. The goals of the 1981 modifications are identical to those today—improving accessibility, enhancing outdoor comfort, and providing outdoor gallery space for the effective display of sculpture.

The Area of Potential Effect (APE) for this project was delineated in consultation with the DC Historic Preservation Office and other consulting parties. The APE includes the cultural resources that could be impacted as part of the undertaking, as well as the area from which the project site is readily visible, particularly along major streets and vistas. The APE is roughly defined by Constitution Avenue NW on the north, 3rd Street on the east, Independence Avenue SW on the south, and 19th Street on the west, with an extension south to C Street SW bound by 9th Street SW on the west and 7th Street SW on the east. Refer to the area map at top left. The table above provides a list of identified historic properties within the APE.
Project Context

The Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden is a contributing resource to the National Mall Historic District listed in the National Register of Historic Places. In 2015, the Hirshhorn was determined individually eligible for National Register listing under Criteria A, for its association with historical events and patterns, and Criteria C, for its architectural characteristics. Meeting Criteria A, the determination documented the property’s association with the growth of the Smithsonian Institution and the National Mall during the second half of the twentieth century. For Criteria C, it also established the significance of the building as an outstanding example of Modernist architecture designed by Gordon Bunshaft. The property was also determined to meet Criteria Consideration G, for properties of exceptional importance that have achieved significance within the last fifty years.

The draft National Register nomination and the Determination of Eligibility note a period of significance for the Hirshhorn of 1936, which is consistent with National Register guidelines to limit the period of significance to the date of construction. After further study concluded in early 2020, the Period of Significance was revised to 1974-1981 to acknowledge the work of Lester Collins. This combined period of significance reflects the layered and evolving history of the site.

Character-defining features for these periods are listed below and graphically identified in the site plan at left:

1974:
- Setting for rotating display of sculpture;
- Reeded grade below the National Mall;
- Concrete perimeter walls and interior partition walls;
- Reflecting pool;
- North and South stairs;

1981:
- Lateral north ramps;
- East ramp (intermeidal level);
- Hardscape paving;
- Garden rooms.

The design of the revitalization respects the evolving Bunshaft-Collins design, maintaining and balancing on its character-defining features. The revitalization rebuilds many historic features including the concrete perimeter walls, south stairs, and alignment of the east ramp into the Central Gallery. The new design introduces improved universally accessible ramps that, for the first time, connect directly with accessible routes on both the National Mall and Jefferson Drive, Honda-Sugimoto’s introduction of contemplative gallery spaces defined by timeless exploded stone walls develop the concept of Collins’s scaled garden "rooms."

The proposed revitalization meets new requirements, programs, and standards for public exhibitions, and is in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation. The Smithsonian has identified that the project will result in adverse effects on historic resources. Refer to the appendix for the Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources.
Program and Vision for Project

CHAPTER 3 - PROGRAM AND VISION

PROGRAM
The proposed Sculpture Garden program achieves the project goals outlined in the Introduction to support the Hirshhorn’s mission. The elements are organized into distinct programmatic zones for the public’s enjoyment, providing free and wide open views of the Hirshhorn’s new galleries. Destinations positioned at the Sculpture Garden’s perimeter will attract visitors from the National Mall to explore the Sculpture Garden, then guide them to the Plaza and Museum. Sheltered seating will introduce spaces for rest and contemplation at street level. Apron overlooks will connect new and accessible connections with elevated views into the activities of the sunken galleries, and improved connection with the National Mall context.

Contemporary Art and New Commissions:
The West Gallery. A dynamic open plan will support changing programs and unique contemporary art exhibitions. This flexible space will showcase temporary exhibitions, interactive installations, public programming, and monumental sculpture and exclusive commissions by leading contemporary artists working on monumental scales that the existing Sculpture Garden cannot accommodate.
Program and Vision for Project

Aisle. The Aisle will connect the West and East Galleries providing a visitor path and sculpture corridor that allows for varied placement of art within the immersive environment. The Aisle provides an additional overlook into the Central Gallery and underground passage to reinforce the connection of the Sculpture Garden to the Hirshhorn campus.

19th and 20th Century Masterworks: The East Galleries. The vitality and originality of the museum's sculptural masterworks, many of them part of Joseph Hirshhorn's founding gift to the nation, will be highlighted by intimately scaled gallery environments defined by timeless stacked-stone walls.

A series of interconnected open galleries for the Hirshhorn's extraordinary collection of modern bronze sculptures will maximize visual impact and viewer engagement. These galleries will dramatically increase the number of masterworks on display—up to 50% more. These opportunities enable curators and visitors to explore new narratives within an established history of art.

Community Activations: The Central Gallery and Reflecting Pool. The Central Gallery will provide a space for contemplation and performance art engagement. Its center is defined by an Art Platform surrounded by a tiered water feature; together these elements will provide a focal point for daily visitor reflection and improve comfort through evaporative cooling in warm months, in combination with amphitheater-like seating at either side of the Central Gallery, these flexible elements support a unique setting for the performing arts, including music, dance, and participatory art of the twenty-first century. Performers and audiences will engage with each other in site-specific configurations altered to sound, movement, materials, and changes over time.

Connection with the Museum Plaza: Underground Passage. Re-opening of the Underground Passage restores a key element of the Sculpture Garden's original design and is critical to strengthening its connection with the Museum Plaza. The design improves visitor experience, comfort, and safety through the increase of daylight, visibility, openness, and ventilation. Openings at both ends of the Passage are to be enlarged along with the installation of reflective art panels and security features to address these needs.

Garden Support. To support operations, areas under the North and South Overlooks will provide tool and equipment storage, and support areas for garden exhibition, security, events, conservation, and operational needs.

CURATORIAL VISION
Since its opening, the Sculpture Garden’s presentation of world-class modern and contemporary sculpture has provided visitors the opportunity to encounter iconic late nineteenth and twentieth-century masterworks against the incomparable backdrop of the National Mall. Anchored by Joseph H. Hirshhorn’s collection, the Sculpture Garden welcomes visitors to enjoy works such as Auguste Rodin’s Monument to Balzac and The Burghers of Calais as well as iconic twentieth-century works, such as Henry Moore’s King and Queen.

In the revitalized Sculpture Garden, a varied but united architecture and landscape.
Program and Vision for Project

The Hirshhorn’s curators are working closely with the design team to test and calibrate their curatorial vision. The curatorial study plan (seen left) highlights Sculpture Garden zones and their purpose. The West Gallery will be open and adaptable, showcasing contemporary artworks that explore social interaction, architecture, process, music, dance, and mixed media, often on a monumental scale. By contrast, the East Galleries invite visitors into a sequence of gallery “rooms” to highlight foundational masterworks by artists like Auguste Rodin, Henry Moore, and Barbara Hepworth. The Central Gallery, with its Reflecting Pool and Art Platform, will be a dynamic space for site-specific works and performances, in addition to serving as a gallery for the display of masterworks from the Hirshhorn’s permanent collection.

Above: The curatorial team and design team are working together to define and test the relationships between space, sculpture, and architecture within the virtual Sculpture Garden environment. The site plan above reflects the study of the proposed sculpture and its placement, in scale, within a section of the East Galleries.

Smithsonian
CHAPTER 4 - PROPOSED DESIGN

DESIGN VISION

Gordon Bunshaft established the design vision for the Hirshhorn's campus, encompassing the Sculpture Garden, Plaza and Museum, in 1974. Three years later, Lester Collins was commissioned to adjust intangible elements of Bunshaft’s design vision in the Sculpture Garden to increase shade and seating and to introduce accessibility. The proposed design by acclaimed Japanese-American artist and architect Hiroshi Sugimoto adds to the layered visions of Bunshaft and Collins. Bunshaft looked to Japanese Zen gardens for inspiration, and similarly Collins drew inspiration from Japanese garden design and Chinese cup gardens. Sugimoto is a fitting partner for the Hirshhorn and his design is fully responsive to the needs of a 21st-century national modern and contemporary art museum. The museum is committed to spotlighting diverse, global perspectives; showcases dramatic changes in artmaking reflected in the permanent collection over the last five decades; and offers a dynamic platform for future art innovation.

Designing a contemplative sunken garden with a minimalistic palette of materials and plantings. Bunshaft was likely introduced to the Japanese Zen tradition through collaborations with Isamu Noguchi, the celebrated Japanese-American artist and sculptor. Noguchi was known for fusing traditional and modern art, Noguchi and Bunshaft photographed with Nima Bunshaft at Ryōan-ji Temple, both left, worked together to create sunken gardens within well-known projects such as Yale University’s Bregade Library and Chase Manhattan Bank Plaza in New York.

In 1981, Lester Collins adapted the Sculpture Garden design for visitor comfort and access. Inspired by Asian cup garden traditions, Collins incorporated rich vegetation, rock and water features, “garden rooms” (similar to cup gardens) and “hide-and-reveal” moments that encourage visitor movement and flow. He also incorporated these techniques at the Hirshhorn Garden, seen in the middle photo.

A master of Japanese garden design, Hiroshi Sugimoto advances the influences of Asian design principles of Bunshaft and Collins. Sugimoto’s Okinawa Art Foundation completed in 2017 is a masterful integration of galleries, outdoor stages, art and gardens. He has an innate understanding as to how best to display masterworks with his long history of creating public outdoor art installations at the most important venues across the world. Sugimoto introduces intimate and contemplative galleries for modern art and flexible new galleries and art platforms for performances, video, and new large-scale commissions. Within the sunken garden, Sugimoto’s design defines gallery rooms with stacked-stone walls inspired by Japanese artistic traditions. The use of ancient stacked stone masonry techniques in the Sculpture Garden revitalization lends a sense of timelessness to the space, a compelling context and backdrop for the display of modern and contemporary art.

Stone is often incorporated at points of contemplation in Japanese gardens. In Sugimoto’s design for a karesansui garden, or “dry garden” (seen in the bottom photo), a view from a guesthouse veranda reveals a large stone island in front of a richly textured stacked stone wall. Built using century-old Japanese techniques these walls contain large feature stones in a harmonious composition. Similar stone gallery walls within the Sculpture Garden provide a cohesive design character while shaping space, movement and flow throughout the space.
Scale and Organization

The proposed design strengthens the Sculpture Garden’s connection with the Museum and the National Mall along the city’s 16th Street axis. The Museum campus is bounded by the historic aggregate concrete walls (shown in the diagram at left). The monumental scale, character, alignment, and material continuity of the walls bounding the Sculpture Garden and Museum unify the Museum campus as seen from the National Mall. They are organized symmetrically about a central axis, with openings of varying widths, overlooks and vistas. The proposed design preserves the perimeter aggregate concrete walls as a fundamental uniting feature of the Hirshhorn campus. Secondary exposed aggregate concrete walls at overlooks signal pieces of arrival and reinforce the hierarchy of the perimeter walls.

Within the Sculpture Garden’s perimeter walls, stacked stone gallery walls and landscape elements shape visitor flow and create contemplative spaces for viewing art. These elements work together to create a cohesive setting with hide and reveal experiences, first introduced in the Garden by Collines, to display diverse forms of art.

On the next page, site sections illustrate visual relationships and overlook conditions shaped by the Hirshhorn’s campus. Iconic overlook views highlighting the 16th Street axis are featured from the Museum’s Lemon Room balcony (which will be reconnected), and the Sculpture Garden’s North and South Overlooks. Framed by the Sculpture Garden’s perimeter walls, inner gallery walls, and landscape, these visual relationships serve to unify the Museum campus and its relationship to the National Mall.
Scale and Organization
Overlook and Entries

Overlooks and Atriums provide physical and visual access points to strengthen the connection between the Museum and the National Mall, welcome and orient visitors with views into the Sculpture Garden, and improve accessibility.

Entrances to the Sculpture Garden will be framed by colorful plantings that draw attention and signal welcome. At north and south, spacious overlooks provide moments of orientation before visitors descend to the sunken garden level. Visitors coming from the Museum Plaza will also be able to make their way through the Underground Passage to the lowest level of the Sculpture Garden, or cross Jefferson Drive to arrive at the South Overlook.

Graceful ramps along the west side of the site will connect with accessible, paved routes from the National Mall and from the Museum Plaza. This universally accessible route descends to an overlook and down to the West Lawn. From there, accessible pathways continue throughout the Sculpture Garden allowing visitors of diverse ages and mobilities to experience Museum programs and collections together.

The Smithsonian will continue to coordinate with NPS regarding pedestrian access along Jefferson Drive. This project will not include material changes to the road due to future staging and construction activities anticipated with the major Museum Revitalization project currently in the planning stages.
Overlook and Entries

OVERLOOKS AND ENTRIES

NORTH AND SOUTH OVERLOOKS

The North Overlook is the main entrance to the Sculpture Garden from the National Mall. To strengthen this arrival point and connection to the Museum, the entrance’s east-west width has been restored to 60’-0”, matching the width of the original 1874 north entrance. Planting strips into the Sculpture Garden recall the organization of the ramps introduced in 1981. In views from the National Mall, the presence of the historic concrete walls is maintained (refer to top left image). The South Overlook and stair will be rebuilt based on the original 1874 detailing with the reuse of original stone stair treads. At bottom left, the view from the Museum’s Lerner Room balcony functions as an additional overlook providing expansive views of the Sculpture Garden that reinforce the axial relationships of the museum campus.

EAST AND WEST APRONS

The East and West Aprons create an inviting intermediate zone between the surrounding site and the Sculpture Garden. They provide changing sculpture displays that enliven the Museum to 7th Street and the National Mall walkway. Perimeter seat walls and ground covers are designed to provide a shaded visitor amenity while offering protection for sculpture in the Aprons. Within the Aprons, new overhanging provide views into the Sculpture Garden under the shade of preserved mature Elm trees. These new overhangs will provide educational signage for visitors that describe the history and evolution of the Sculpture Garden.
West Gallery

Visitors entering at the west side of the site descend to the West Gallery via a gracious accessible route from the Museum Plaza or the National Mall. This route provides universal access to the Sculpture Garden, with open and filtered views of artwork and activities at the West Gallery lawn, Aisle, and Central Gallery.

Above View of the West Gallery from the South Overlook.
West Gallery

The West Gallery is an expansive and flexible open lawn, open to the sky. The lawn will be periodically adapted to support temporary programs, seasonal pavilions, and the display of large-scale sculpture. Through these opportunities the Museum will engage visitors in new, dynamic ways. The West Gallery is framed by a sculptural stone wall along the walkways at west, and planters on the remaining three sides. Seat walls surrounding the planters are shaded by tree canopy and separated from the lawn by accessible paths.
East Galleries

The East Galleries will display modern and late 20th Century sculpture within a series of connected intimately scaled rooms. Visitor pathways weave between landscape and stacked stone gallery walls to create hide and reveal experiences that shape visitor flow and encourage the contemplation of artwork. The trees canopy in this area has been designed to provide a grove-like setting with soft diffused light illuminating outdoor gallery rooms. Complementary materials, tones, and features of concrete perimeter walls, stacked stone walls, benches, shade, and plantings are composed to provide extraordinary settings for experiencing art.

Above: Photograph of a physical model illustrating the play of shade produced by integrated sculptures in the East Galleries.
East Galleries

Placement and alignment of stone walls throughout the East Galleries purposefully shape gallery rooms in a series for curatorial benefit. Visitor pathways weave in and out of these galleries revealing groupings of works that suggest distinct narratives. The size and configuration of the gallery room depicted at left encourage visitors to pause, and contemplate artworks at a human scale. Seat walls along planting beds provide opportunities for rest and contemplation.
Central Gallery

The three signature elements of the Central Gallery are the Inner partition wall, reflecting pool, and the Underground Passage. These three elements combine stone, water, and reflection in the tradition of Asian garden design principles, inspired by Bunschaft and Collin, to strengthen the sculpture Garden’s connection with the Museum, and activate the space.

The Central Gallery is situated at the nexus between the National Mall, North and South Overlooks and Museum along the 8th Street axis. The proposed inner partition wall, reflecting pool and curving art walls of the Underground Passage create a moment of connection and a compelling transition along this progression. These design elements create a setting of unique spatial and sensory characteristics, ready to inspire artists and audiences. Seasonality, sight lines, and different types of exhibitions and programs were studied to refine the Central Gallery design.
Central Gallery

CENTRAL GALLERY
INNER PARTITION WALL

Bunshaft’s design included a concrete partition wall that separated the Sculpture Garden’s central space from its north entry on the National Mall. The concrete partition provided a northern boundary to the central space and was similar in material character to the perimeter walls. The addition of ramps in 1981 created another spatial boundary north of this wall, changing the inner partition wall’s relationship to the Mall and purpose within the Sculpture Garden. The proposed design retains the inner partition wall’s location but adjusts its height and construction to unify the Sculpture Garden spatially and materially. The height of the new wall has been reduced to enhance visibility into the Central Gallery from the Atrium. The wall is to be constructed of stacked stone masonry to unite the Sculpture Garden in a fully cohesive and timeless design.

In a traditional Zen garden, the most important design decision is identifying the Akari or “scenic stones” which occupy the garden space and anchor the composition’s abstract. The inner partition wall is effectively Sugimoto’s “refractory stone,” so, much, it is crucial to the Sculpture Garden’s overall composition. It provides a cohesive material character and texture that connects east and west and an iconic backdrop for sculpture, new installations, and performance art in the Central Gallery space and Art Platform.

Above: View of performance at the Central Gallery reflecting pool with inner partition wall to the background. The audience is positioned at the east and west amphitheater seating, temporarily scaling to the south, and standing room along the Area.

SCULPTURE GARDEN REVITALIZATION
HIRSHHORN MUSEUM AND SCULPTURE GARDEN

NCPD PRELIMINARY REVIEW 28
30 December 2020
Central Gallery

REFLECTING POOL
At the heart of the Sculpture Garden, the reflecting pool will provide remarkable visitor engagement with site-specific sculptures, time-based and performance art, serve as a cool oasis for contemplation in D.C.’s hot summers, and integrate key features of the Sculpture Garden’s history.

The proposed design incorporates the 1974 pool shape and location into the expanded pool configuration. It highlights and honors the 1974 footprint by ensuring that this portion of the pool will be prominent and visible year-round by using heated water. This will be distinctive, as the Smithsonian typically drains water features (including the Sculpture Garden’s existing pool) during winter and when threatened by floods. The reflecting pool’s history will be highlighted by informational signage and Hirshhorn Eyes, the dynamic, interactive gallery guide that uses image recognition to share easily accessible video content via mobile devices. The Hirshhorn is committed to preserving the memory of the historic pool and highlighting the Sculpture Garden’s evolution. The pool’s design improves visitor comfort by reducing heat island effect and providing evaporative cooling. The reflecting pool is flanked at the east and west by amphitheater seating along raised planting beds with extensive shade from surrounding trees.

An Art Platform at the center of the pool serves as a flexible programming and exhibition space. The basin to the north and south of the art platform are stepped, concentrically.

Nested terraces are revealed with reduced water levels, allowing for a variety of pool sizes and flexible seating around and in the pool when drained. Artists will be able to anticipate the distance between their artwork or performance by filling or draining the pool’s basin. The terraces may also support site-specific works and performances.

On the next page you will see the variety of seating and performance arrangements made possible through the pool design.

KEY PLAN

SCULPTURE GARDEN REVITALIZATION
HIRSHHORN MUSEUM AND SCULPTURE GARDEN

NCPC PRELIMINARY REVIEW
29
36
National Capital Planning Commission
File: 7889
Central Gallery Reflecting Pool Arrangements

- Typical Seminar Configuration - Pool Filled
- Performance Seating around Pool
- Curated Exhibition
- Inclusive Group Gathering
- Performance Seating in Terraces
- Typical Water Configuration - 1974 Pool Heated

Smithsonian

Sculpture Garden Revitalization
 Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden

NCPC Preliminary Review 30
03 December 2020
Central Gallery Reflecting Pool Studies

Additional studies were conducted to consider other means to retain the historic dimensions and location of the 1974 pool while addressing the Museum's programming needs. The two alternatives were not successful at meeting the program requirements.

**ALTERNATIVE 1**
In Alternative 1, the art platform is shifted south to further distinguish and create a complete border around the 1974 pool area. Along with the Art Platform, the southern, bordering area of the pool is also shifted to the south. These shifts situate the stage off center from the Central Gallery space, and compromise the design as a setting for performance in the round. It reduces circulation space and seating area capacity south of the reflecting pool to an uncomfortable degree, making it a completely closed boundary around the basin north of the Art Platform and encroaches the two basins for a disjointed composition.

**ALTERNATIVE 2**
In Alternative 2, the 1974 pool area north of the Art Platform is featured more prominently by removing the outer tier from the proposed design. The Alternative 2 pool footprint corresponds approximately to the size of the art panel currently in the Sculpture Garden south of the 1974 reflecting pool. Refocusing the original design and contrasting with adjacent pavers, a dark border defines the 1974 pool edge and matches the basin. This treatment results in an unsafe condition which lacks the visual contrast required between the pool edge and pool basin.

Alternative 2 reduces the overall width and proportions of the reflecting pool, minimizing it as a Central Gordan focal point and the care taken to develop the dimensional relationship between the Underground Passage opening, pool and seating. The reduced seating capacity within the reflecting pool that is developed with this alternative renders programming flexibility and the potential for intimate engagement with an audience and artist. The smaller reflecting pool size also increases the landscape to pool ratio which reduces the effectiveness of the pool to temper the garden micro-climate with evaporative cooling.
UNDERGROUND PASSAGE

The 1974 design included an underground visual and physical connection between the Museum and the Sculpture Garden beneath Jefferson Drive. However, the narrow proportions of the passage and lack of natural daylight created a dark and unwelcoming experience resulting in the closure of the Underground Passage. The Plaza Level passage entrance was covered over in the 1993 Plaza modifications. The passage was later enclosed for use as an art educational space. This closure of the Underground Passage has impeded the original flow of visitors and visual connection between the National Mall and Museum ever since.

The Sculpture Garden revitalization will reestablish a direct connection between the Sculpture Garden and the Museum Plaza by reopening the Underground Passage. As illustrated at left, the Passage is a physical connector between spaces and provides visual continuity from the Atrium through the Reflecting Pool and to the Museum Plaza.
UNDERGROUND PASSAGE

In order to successfully reopen the Underground Passage, the space must be safe and inviting to visitors. This is achieved by increasing visibility, light, openness, and ventilation, along with additional security measures.

The Underground Passage is lined by two symmetrical stainless steel curved art panels that reflect light, views, and imagery of the Sculpture Garden. Sugimoto states, "The Garden greenery is experienced like the mirror image of an Impressionist painting by Seurat or Monet, but curved." The stainless steel curves into a funnel shape that recalls Sugimoto's iconic Infinity sculptures. Its northern end widens dramatically to increase the sense of openness to the Sculpture Garden and bring in daylight. This requires limited removal of historic fabric.
UNDERGROUND PASSAGE

The passageway symbolically aligns with the center of the Museum and fountain, and reinforces the central north-south axis of Barnhardt's original design. This steel panel will be assembled of smaller welded vertical panels, polished to a mirror finish. The design of the manufacturing and assembly of these composite panels will be expressed, through vertically segmented, curved, mirrored reflections.

The Plaza opening will be uncovered and enlarged by extending the opening above the stairs to increase natural light and ventilation into the Passage. The design restores the historic stair connecting with the Museum Plaza, with balustrade design based on historic details, modified to meet today’s code requirements.
Landscape Materials

Chapter 5 - Landscape Materials

Landscape

Historically Inspired

Reclaimed

The Sculpture Garden material palette consists of plantings, historically inspired materials, and reclaimed landscape materials that work together to create a unified composition. The project's material palette is shaped by historic influences with construction of important site features in mind with their historic counterparts, as well as the reuse of previously salvaged historic materials.
Landscape Organization

Landscape elements are fully integrated with the architecture to reinforce and complement its spatial strategies and character and incorporate key aspects of the historic landscape. Canopy and ground cover contribute to visitor comfort and a serene harmonious environment for experiencing sculpture.

Planting within the Sculpture Garden creates distinct character zones which visitors can experience throughout their procession. Zone A provides improved visibility and connection between the Sculpture Garden and its context. Zones B and C emphasize the 6th street axis with views between the Museum, the National Mall, and the Garden overall. "Garden rooms" in Zones D and E reflect Collins' design influence and provide intimately scaled galleries and moments of reflection with works of art. These complementary settings will bring sculpture, architecture, and plantings into a cohesive garden environment.
Landscape History

The proposed tree and plant palette reflects design influences of both Gordon Bunshaft and Lourie Colin and draw similar inspiration from Japanese and Chinese gardens. In addition to the careful preservation of the mature Elm trees at the East End and West Avenues, cherry trees reminiscent of those introduced in 1951 will grace the northern edge of the Sculpture Garden. A Sugar Maple will be located nearly in the exact location as the one introduced in 1951. Two additional Sugar Maple trees will flank the North Overlook and reinforce the Sculpture Garden’s north-south axis. A cluster of pines is introduced in the East Galleries, in keeping with Asian garden design traditions seen in the 1951 plantings.

Several species included in the proposed garden have been selected as counterparts to Colin’s original plant list. These native and adapted species have been selected to reflect the color, texture, and flavor of some of Collins’ selections which support the sustainable goals of the garden revitalization, while achieving a lush ground plane.
Landscape View Sheds

As seen in the top section, a strong edge of Japanese flowering cherry trees along the north side of the Sculpture Garden mirrors Corbin’s gesture on the National Mall and reinforces the axial view from the Museum. Preservation of the mature oaks at the East and West Aprons maintains the elm panel, and National Mall view shed. The project does not negatively affect any existing view sheds.
Landscape: Trees

Trees have been selected for visual characteristics of form, texture, color, seasonal diversity, and resiliency in addition to reflecting Sculpture Garden history. Trees will frame views into the Sculpture Garden from overlooks at all four cardinal directions. Trees along the north and south edges of the Sculpture Garden are held back from the central axis to enhance connections between the Museum and the National Mall. This axis is further framed by the trees flanking the Central Gallery.

Shade trees are introduced throughout to enhance visitor comfort at benches around planters and tiered seating flanking the Central Gallery. Tightly spaced red maple trees will create a grove-like effect with a delicate canopy that reinforces the human scale of the gallery rooms. The maple trees will grow straight and upward to create a high, lacy canopy with brilliant red color in the fall. This canopy will produce a soft, filtered light with dappled shade. North of center of this grove-like area, a contrasting trio of Lobolly Pines will create a year-round evergreen highlight.
Landscape: Tree Species

- Acer saccharum x Searchform 'Sander'sville' Sugar Maple 28-32m
- Ulmus davidiana var. japonica 'Motion' ACCLADIE Elm Deciduous Tree 15-20m
- Gymnocladus dioica Kentucky Coffee Tree Deciduous Tree 10-14m
- Pinus taeda Loblolly Pine Evergreen Tree 13-17m
- Prunus yedoensis 'Akebono' Flowering Cherry Deciduous Tree 8-13m
- Acer rubrum ARWC5 Stat to Last Red Maple Deciduous Tree 10-12m
- Cornus kousa Kousa Dogwood Deciduous Tree 8-10m
- Ceratodonium japonicum Katsura Tree Deciduous Tree 10-15m
Landscape: Tree Information
Landscape: Tree Information

LANDSCAPE

TREES

All tree species except those are native or cultivars of North American native plants. Under-story natives and non-natives will be utilized for diversity and resiliency.

The two plan diagrams at the left compare the tree canopies provided today with the proposed design. Tree placement for the revitalization has been strategic to provide shade over existing areas within the East Galleries and throughout to create a comfortable environment for the viewing of art.

The proposed tree plan is compliant with the NCPC tree replacement guidelines. No trees 31.8” diameter or greater will be removed. Existing trees were assessed for potential successful transplant and no candidates were identified. Replacement trees are native or non-invasive and will be planted at larger than the minimum caliper size or height. Refer to the chart on the left that shows seven existing trees on site that have a trunk diameter greater than 10” and will be replaced. Of these trees, three have scores that require 1:1 replacement and two have scores that require 1:2. The species rating is derived from the Mid-Atlantic tree species rating guide, while the conditions rating is based on the Council of Tree and Landscape Appraisers (CTLA) Guide to Plant Appraisals. All other trees were narrower in diameter and require only a 1:1 replacement. Forty-nine existing trees will be removed as a part of this project with forty-nine replacements required and provided. The new trees will be planted on the project site within the LOD. Planting soil volumes are consistent with industry best practices.
Landscape: Ground Plane

LANDSCAPE
GROUND PLANE

Diverse plantings at the ground plane have been selected for diversity of form, texture, seasonal interest and height to emphasize and complement sculpture and architecture. The design concept incorporates a stylized naturalism, refined with soft lines and lush textures. The ground plane has been developed to be a texturally rich mix of primarily native species set in drifts in raised and at grade planting beds.

Visitors encounter a rich four-season landscape with delicate flowering plants and moments of discovery in each gallery. The proposed planting is a sustainable planting palette of 47 species of individual plants. The overall design includes 60-70% native planting by quantity/area. The interdisciplinary team has made efforts to introduce plantings native to the region as well as those connected to Asian garden design concepts present throughout the Sculpture Garden’s history. Anticipating a changing climate, species are selected for this, and slightly warmer, hardiness zones.

SOIL
Soil profiles have been designed for the various planting conditions in the Sculpture Garden to provide healthy growth, adequate under drainage, and proper aeration. Soils are designed to mimic the genesis of natural soil profiles, higher organic content in surficial soils and lower organic content in deeper layers. Deep-rooting soil profiles provide high nutrient and soil moisture availability. Planting bed soils embody properties to maximize plant vigor and minimize maintenance.
Landscape: Ground Plane Information
Concrete Walls

The existing perimeter walls of cast-in-place, exposed aggregate concrete are a major unifying feature of the Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden. These walls define an identifiable precinct for the Museum campus. They are organized symmetrically about the 5th Street axis, with openings of varying widths, overlooks and vistas.

The perimeter concrete walls will continue to be a fundamental unifying feature of the Hirshhorn campus and will be strengthened by the proposed design with an enhanced northern boundary. Secondary exposed aggregate concrete walls signal places of arrival and reinforce the hierarchy of the perimeter walls. They will accommodate gracious arrival experiences, including improved access from both north and south for persons using mobility devices.
Concrete Walls

Due to an alkali-silica reaction within the concrete wall known as "concrete disease," the existing perimeter walls are failing and are required to be fully replaced. These walls will be re-built using Swenson Pink granite aggregate, sourced from the original Maine quarry used in the 1974 construction. Swenson Pink is ubiquitous within the Hirshhorn campus, and will be used for several applications on this project. The perimeter walls will be slightly raised to a height of 3'-6" above adjacent grade to meet current code requirements. Modification to the wall construction will ensure strength, longevity, and prevent future alkali-silica reaction.
Concrete Guardrails

CONCRETE GUARDRAILS

Guardrails and balustrades at Overlook, the Plaza Stair, and secondary concrete walls will be constructed with consistent material, appearance, and texture as the historic concrete, matching the perimeter walls.

Historic balustrade designs at the South Overlook and Plaza Stair will be adapted for a height of 3'-0" above adjacent grade in order to meet code requirements. This rail height will be slightly raised in order to maintain the historic proportions of the top rail. Horizontal openings larger than 4" will be brought into compliance by introducing a centered horizontal bronze tube, as shown in the two section details at far left.
Stacked Stone Walls

Inner walls that shape the Sculpture Garden's gallery spaces are distinct and lower than the perimeter walls to reinforce the primacy of the concrete perimeter walls, and to maintain historic views from the National Mall. To establish the important hierarchy between the historic concrete perimeter walls and new stacked stone walls, the tops of stacked stone walls are typically two feet lower than the adjacent concrete perimeter walls. Where the two types of wall meet, they are separated by a one-foot reveal.

Typical stacked stone walls will be made of reclaimed Brandywine granite from Pennsylvania, harvested from construction sites. This salvaged granite is a sustainable material source that meets the aesthetic requirements of tone, texture, and patina.
STACKED STONE WALLS

The use of ancient stone setting techniques with care for orientation, angle, sequence, and fitting will result in beautiful and durable handcrafted walls. The stone stacking technique will yield pylon-shaped walls with sloped faces at an 1:10 angle, identical to the faces of the Plaza’s perimeter walls.

Stacked stone walls, along with the concrete perimeter walls and landscape elements within the Sculpture Garden shape gallery spaces and serve as backdrops for art. Images at the bottom left show investigations conducted by the Hirshhorn curatorial team using the 2019 design mock-up.
INNER PARTITION WALL

As the iconic heart of the Sculpture Garden, the inner partition wall is the only stacked stone wall constructed in the location of an existing wall and will incorporate Swenson Pink granite stones sourced from the original quarry used for the aggregate in the concrete walls. As with the Brandywine granite, these stones will be salvaged from resources that have been weathered and pitted, for a consistent effect that is subtly distinguished and will reduce the carbon footprint created from new mining. As with the other stacked-stone gallery walls, the inner partition wall faces will be battered with a profile in keeping with those of the Plaza’s perimeter walls, as shown at near left.

5 - LANDSCAPE + MATERIALS
Stone Seating Elements

Swannson Pink granite will be featured in several Garden seating and paving elements, for consistency of the material palette and to relate to the historic concrete aggregate and staiir tread of 1974, and bench design of 1981. Seat wall bases will be constructed of solid, thermal-finished Swannson Pink granite blocks, up to 6’0” long. Throughout the Sculpture Garden, continuous stone seat walls surrounding raised planters are inspired by seat wall planters introduced in the East and West Gardens in 1981 (refer to top left image). Seat walls throughout the Sculpture Garden provide nearly four times the seating capacity currently available and give opportunities for rest with options for visitors using mobility devices to sit shoulder-to-shoulder with their companions. Ampitheater-like benches Bank the Central Gallery and recall the amphitheater-like steps of the 1974 design. Freestanding seat walls surround the at-grade planters at the East and West Aprons. The seat walls are designed to conceal continuous LED lighting to illuminate nearby pathways. At strategic locations, the solid bench base stone will include flush custom bronze enclosures that house electrical, water and data outlets.

Smithsonian

SCULPTURE GARDEN REVITALIZATION
HOPHORN MUSEUM AND SCULPTURE GARDEN

NCPC PRELIMINARY REVIEW 51
05 December 2009
STONE PAVING
Salvaged and new Swenson Pink granite is used in keeping with the historic material palette of the Sculpture Garden. Swenson Pink will be incorporated at visitor arrival points including the North and South Overlooks, stair treads and ramps. Original stair treads salvaged and stored by the Smithsonian during the 1981 modifications will be reinstalled. New dimensional granite will be used as required for a consistent and harmonious overall treatment. The pavers will be approximately 18”x36”.

Reclaimed Asian granite pavers, salvaged from potthals and plazas, will be used for the horizontal paving within the Sculpture Garden. Individual pavers are elongated in shape and vary in size, typically 9”x22”. At the Central Gallery, reclaimed pavers will be approximately 18”x36” typically, with large rectangular granite slabs to be installed at the Art Platform.

The reflecting pool will be clad in Absolute Black granite consistent with the existing reflecting pool material, and to contrast with surrounding paving for safety. The material used for the historic 1974 pool basin may be treated differently - with a distinct honed or thermal finish - to differentiate and highlight this area.
Handrails

A custom bronze handrail is envisioned along stairs and ramps throughout the Sculpture Garden and connecting to the Museum Plaza from the Underground Passage. The code-compliant handrails will have a roughly oval shape, with a continuous recess below to receive a linear lighting element. The handrails are to be supported on cast bronze posts along stone walls, and attached directly to concrete walls with bronze brackets.
Lighting

The nighttime appearance of the Sculpture Garden will be consistent with other buildings and sites on the National Mall, with low light levels that do not compete with major landmarks such as the Washington Monument and Capitol. Light sources will be fully integrated and concealed within the architecture to provide a soft, luminous glow on paving and adjacent hard surfaces. This strategy is combined with a layered approach to provide appropriate levels of illumination for the Garden's unoccupied and occupied conditions. The lighting design aims to meet the dark sky approach.

General site lighting includes LED fixtures integrated within seat walls and handrails to create an ambient glow on adjacent surfaces, ground planes and egress paths. Lighting mock-ups will be studied to orient these fixtures for a wide spread of light on adjacent paths. Handrail lighting systems provide required ramp and stair illumination that comply with prescribed lift safety lighting requirements.
LIGHTING

Unique, location-specific lighting within the Sculpture Garden is found at the Underground Passage, Reflecting Pool, and Atrium. At the Underground Passage, linear coves are concealed above and below the art walls, providing illumination for circulation, small events, and operational needs. Submersible exterior LED fixtures concealed at the Art Platform and walkway edge illuminate the stepped basin. Fixtures concealed within the concrete wall that supports the North Overlook illuminate the Atrium paving.

At Aprons, works of art are illuminated via hidden, in-grade LED fixtures. Additionally, portable cord and plug art lighting is to be provided as required for art programming and events. A lighting control system will allow for multi-scene and fixture dimming control, affording the Museum the capacity to program light levels for a variety of functions.
SECURITY

The Sculpture Garden revitalization proposes a layered approach to security that includes perimeter strengthening, camera surveillance, lighting, and a 24-hour personnel presence on site. Integrated security gates will protect the Sculpture Garden's major entrances after dark. At Overlook perimeter walls, double-leaf security gates will swing and extend out from recesses in the walls. At accessible entrances, sliding security gates will extend across the pedestrian route. At the Underground Passage, a security grille will close off the entrance from the base of the Plaza stairs.

Personnel presence will ensure safety for visitors and artwork. A guard booth provided at the SW corner of the site will allow for in-person surveillance to accompany site cameras. Video camera surveillance will be discretely placed throughout the garden with 24-hour full coverage of the sunken garden, apertures, and passageways. In the Aprons, temporary light fixtures providing sculpture illumination will add security for sculptures placed along this edge.
SIGNAGE

Signage will be provided to address wayfinding, education, exhibitions, donors, and landscape identification. Sculpture Garden identification signage will be placed on perimeter concrete walls at major entry points. Trees and groundcover east and west of the North and South Overlooks have been planned to provide visibility of signage to each side of the overlook entrances.

Educational exhibits will be located at street level as well as within the sunken Garden. These exhibits will describe the Garden’s evolution, and identify features of the designs of Runshaft, Collins, and Sugimoto. The reflecting pool and inner pavilion will be identified and interpreted, to reveal what has been retained and altered over time. Additionally, the Hirshhorn Eye initiative will make videos of experts and contextual information available to all visitors, providing opportunities to dive deeper into the Garden’s history. Signage design is in its early phases and will be further described in the next submission.
Flooding and Stormwater Management

The sunken Sculpture Garden has faced challenges throughout its history with its unique micro-climate and sunken location. Within a 500-year floodplain and at an elevation approximately eleven feet below the National Mall, the Sculpture Garden experiences heavy flooding that threatens collections, endangers plant health, and stifle operations during and after major storms. Its facilities are especially vulnerable to flooding when heavy precipitation occurs over a short period. Over the last year, the Sculpture Garden has experienced severe flood events in July 2019 and August 2020. The Sculpture Garden is an integral part of the Hirshhorn campus, thus relocation was not considered. Instead, the revitalization requires a new stormwater management approach to address flooding.

Water level monitoring conducted from December 2019 to October 2020 has confirmed the water table is below the lowest level of the Sculpture Garden. However, field investigations conducted in early 2020 found that an existing sewer pipe below the Garden is non-functional and cannot be used as an outlet in future. The inability to drain water effectively to the storm sewer is contributing to excessive flooding.
A multi-tiered storm water management strategy is proposed to meet DOE's requirements and achieve a sustainable, long-term solution for the Sculpture Garden's unique below-grade conditions. Consultation with DOE will include under-slab retention and infiltration along with capture, treatment, and reuse of storm water. A 20,000-gallon cistern beneath the North Overlook is proposed to capture storm water. The captured water will be treated to meet potable water requirements and reused on site for irrigation and toilet demand. Currently being studied is the use of treated storm water to recharge the central reflecting pool, which provides evaporative cooling for visitor comfort during the unseasonable heat of the DC summer months.

Water retained under slab will be infiltrated to recharge groundwater. Plantings will benefit from the stored storm water without being inundated. The conservation of the heritage trees will also earn storm water credits as DOE considers this a storm water retention practice. Percolation tests will be conducted in the coming weeks to confirm soil conditions and volumes. A new storm sewer line that connects with the 7th Street main will be installed to address any water not infiltrated or reused on site.

In addition to addressing the lack of adequate drainage and associated flooding, temporary flood barriers will be deployed at Sculpture Garden entrances, ramps, and stairs prior to heavy storm events.
A. REPORTS

SOUTH MALL CAMPUS MASTER PLAN AND EIS RECORD OF DECISION

The Sculpture Garden Revitalization is addressing the following priorities of the South Mall Campus Master Plan:

- Enter & Experience: Make points of entry clearer, more accessible, and easier to find through improved orientation, wayfinding, and location.
- Upgrade the Underground: Better utilize the existing below-grade space through improved circulation, increased daylighting, and easier access to amenities.
- Activate the Avenues: Provide the experiential, program, and technical capacity to support active nightlife within the South Mall Campus museums and galleries.
- Expand Education: Update and expand educational facilities to provide greater flexibility, incorporate new technology, and connect with other SI programs.
- Engage the Gardens: Capitalize on the beauty and popularity of the existing gardens by improving circulation, providing better maintenance facilities, integrating with museum programs, and expanding their ability to accommodate large groups.
- Connect the Campus: Improve circulation across the campus to encourage entry from the National Mall, facilitate east-west pedestrian flow both at-and below-grade, and remove impediments to a connected campus.
- Convene & Collaborate: Provide opportunities and venues for pan-institutional collaboration, meetings, and events. Pan-institution refers to activities that may occur across the Smithsonian.

The Sculpture Garden Revitalization is addressing the following purpose and need of the South Mall Campus Master Plan:

- Restore, repair, and rehabilitate historic properties.
- Replace or retrofit building systems that are at the end of their useful lives.
- Improve accessibility and usability by individudals with disabilities.
- Improve circulation throughout the campus.
- Provide additional museum and event space.
- Update security measures to meet SI and federal requirements.

The Sculpture Garden Revitalization will implement the following mitigation measures identified in the Final EIS of the South Mall Campus Master Plan:

- Soils: An erosion and sediment control plan will be implemented in compliance with District Department of Energy and Environment regulations.
- Drainage: BMPs will be implemented that will include, but are not limited to silt fence, erosion matting, curb inlet protection, hay bales, and revegetation of exposed sediment.
- Site: Soils to be used as fill will be tested for hazardous materials and structural stability before use.
- Preconstruction surveys will be conducted prior to any underground excavation.
- Air Quality: Short-term impacts will be mitigated through the use of proper control measures including minimizing vehicle idling times, maintaining emission controls on construction vehicles and equipment, covering/protecting exposed soils to reduce fugitive dust.
- Developers and construction contractors will be required to submit a construction management plan, including plans to control impacts to air quality during construction.
- Outdated mechanical systems that are at the end of their useful lives will be replaced.
- Cultural Resources: This project has complied with the Section 106 Programmatic Agreement for the South Mall Campus Master Plan, and has incorporated its mitigation and mitigation measures pertaining to the Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden.

Visual Quality:

- Sensitive, context-appropriate designs that reference, and are compatible, with existing features will be utilized.
- Above-grade structures and landscape features proposed for the South Mall Campus will be limited in their size and placement in order to preserve and enhance existing views and historic vistuals.

The Smithsonian will endeavor to specify appropriately, mature replacements where replanting of existing vegetation to undertaken.

- Where possible, infrastructure elements such as the new loading dock ramp, perimeter security features, and control utility plant ventilation will be integrated into landscape.

SMITHSONIAN

SCULPTURE GARDEN REVITALIZATION
HIRSHHORN MUSEUM AND SCULPTURE GARDEN

NCPC PRELIMINARY REVIEW 62
10 December 2019
• Land Use Planning & Policies:
  • Individual projects for the South Mall Campus Master Plan will be subject to review and approval by NCPC.
  • Visitor Use & Experience:
  • SI will provide appropriate signage and fencing to keep passersby out of construction areas.
  • The SI will maintain the SI’s website, signage, postings on social media webpages, email blasts, and press releases in accordance with its communications policies and protocols, to alert visitors to the potential for closed exhibits and/or construction areas.
  • Construction activities will be coordinated in a manner that will minimize disruptions during planned events.
  • Pathways through the South Mall Campus will be rerouted during construction to maintain pedestrian flow.

• Utilities:
  • Campus-wide energy efficiency and sustainability measures, such as energy-efficient lighting, improved building envelopes, modernized HVAC systems, skylights and natural ventilation, low-flow plumbing fixtures, and renewable energy systems will be implemented.
  • Stormwater throughout the South Mall Campus will be collected and stored, to the maximum extent practicable, in the central utility plant and will be reused for irrigation, reducing stormwater runoff and demand for potable water. If any facilities that use to be impacted are on NPS-owned land, SI will obtain any permits needed from NPS for use of NPS land and will similarly do the same for any DC public space adjacent to the South Mall Campus.

• Waste Management:
  • Recyclable and compostable materials will be separated from the landfill-bound waste stream to the maximum extent practicable.
Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources

ASSESSMENT OF EFFECTS ON HISTORIC RESOURCES

Hirschhorn Sculpture Garden Revitalization

August 2020

The following table provides an assessment of effects of each feature or action of the Hirschhorn Sculpture Garden Revitalization. An effect determination is proposed based on the criteria of adverse effect, with additional information or comments provided as applicable. Adverse effect determinations are noted in the following chart with bold typeface.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature/Destination</th>
<th>Proposed Effect Determination</th>
<th>Additional Information/Minimization of Adverse Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Site Plan</td>
<td>Maintains 1991, 2014 plan with layout organized around the 46th Street axis and minimum north/south view at the lowest level. No adverse effect.</td>
<td>- Reinforces the north-south axial organization of the 1991 design. - Maintains the spatial complexity of the 1991 design with expanded garden rooms, walls, and plantings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Setting for Display of Sculpture</td>
<td>Program and site consistent, sculpture garden continues to function well and fills its missions as a setting for sculpture. No adverse effect.</td>
<td>- Siting for sculpture is a character-defining feature and retains high integrity. - Project goals include showing the historically significant sculpture collection to a strong effect, while providing flexible open space to support programming and contemporary art.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Removed Grade Below the National Mall</td>
<td>Sculpture garden maintains a removed elevation below the National Mall, with terraced topography. Proposed changes include 10° grade change at the southwest corner, and approximately 2° grade change on the east side. No adverse effect.</td>
<td>- Removed topography is a character-defining feature and retains high integrity. - No impacts to contributing views identified in the amended National Mall Historic District. - Lowering the grade at the southwest corner after the Burr Oak tree died increases programmable space. - Laying the grade at the southwest corner after the Burr Oak tree died increases programmable space. - Maintaining a removed grade is required by the South Mall Campus Master Plan Programmer Agreement.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adverse effect determinations – bold typeface notes minimization.
## Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources

### Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden Revitalization

#### Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources

**August 2020**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature/Action</th>
<th>Proposed Effect Determination</th>
<th>Additional Information/Amelioration of Adverse Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Concrete Walls – Perimeter</td>
<td>Stairs will be replaced with similar height increase to meet code requirements. Height increase varies between 0 and 12 inches due to grade changes. North walls raised from a low retaining wall to 5’ in height. Walls proposed to enclose the northeast corner currently open to public drive. No adverse effect.</td>
<td>Concrete perimeter walls are a character defining feature and retain high integrity. Replacement in-kind is required due to inapproximate walllice reaction inherent in the concrete mixture. Acoustic appearance of aggregate concrete poured-in-place walls will be maintained, using the historic Swanson Pink (millennium) granite as the basis of design. North walls remain obscured behind plantings. Perimeter of aggregate concrete walls will be maintained. Minor alterations at the northeast and southwest corners of the perimeter walls to provide universal accessibility. Renovating/reconstructing the concrete perimeter walls is required by the South Mall Campus Master Plan Programmatic agreement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concrete Walls – Inner Partition</td>
<td>Wall will be re-built in the same location as stacked stone. The wall will be situated by approximately 18” to a total height of 8’3”. No adverse effect.</td>
<td>Concrete inner partition wall is a character defining feature. Minor wall line to improve interior views and vistas, and limit visibility from the National Mall of the material change. The wall contrast, stacked stone is only visible once a visitor reaches the north overlook or areop. Wall constructed in an arranged composition of Swanson Pink and other complementary colored granite. Change to a solid wall shape differs from the existing condition but is in keeping with the Place perimeter wall shape. Adverse effect on the Hirshhorn is minimized by maintaining the width of the wall, reorienting the wall in the same location to continue to articulate the lower and upper portions of the garden, and use of Swanson Pink granite. Adverse effect on the national mall historic district is avoided with limited visibility from the sculpture garden’s north overlook, and from the Mall path. Aggregate concrete walls will be the first material visible from the exterior of the garden.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Adverse effect determination – bold typeface notes minimization.
### Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources

#### Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden Revitalization

**Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources**

**August 2020**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature/Item</th>
<th>Proposed Effect Determination</th>
<th>Additional Information/Minimization of Adverse Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Stacked Stone Walls</strong></td>
<td>New materials and construction technique introduced in the limited materials palette of the sculpture garden. Advance effect.</td>
<td>- Differentiating the new walls with a complementary granite material and color palette, as consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s standards. - National Park Historic District features varied architectural styles and materials palette including precedents for granite limestone. - Adverse effect minimized by maintaining all stacked stones at a recessed height below the concrete perimeter walls and detailed with a reveal adjacent to aggregate concrete walls. - Adverse effect eliminated by using a complementary granite in terms of color and tone, to the aggregate concrete walls.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reflecting Pool</strong></td>
<td>Historic pool dimensions integrated into an enlarged water feature, remain central within the Garden. Advance effect.</td>
<td>- Reflecting pool now reflects dimensions aligned with the original width of the north wall at no loss. - Reflecting pool is a character defining feature and retains high integrity. - Adverse effect minimized by retaining a dimensional memory of the 1974 pool within the enlarged water feature. - Adverse effect minimized by maintaining a water feature at the center of the Garden organized around the 8th Street axis. - Adverse effect eliminated by providing heat source only within the dimensions of the 1974 pool, allowing a year-round water presence only within the historic pool. - Adverse effect eliminated by using black granite in keeping with the historic pool material and applying a different finish treatment to differentiate the 1974 pool.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>South Stairs</strong></td>
<td>Granite stairs reconstructed after structural work and aggregate concrete replaced in-kind. Height of reconstructed balustrade increased to meet code requirements. No adverse effect.</td>
<td>- Lateral south stairs are a character defining feature and retain high integrity. - No change is proposed to stair composition. - Minimal design changes to the reconstructed balustrade height to meet code requirements by raising the curb and adding a metal rail at the curb gap, preserving the proportions of the concrete rail.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Smithsonian**

SCULPTURE GARDEN REVITALIZATION
HIRSHHORN MUSEUM AND SCULPTURE GARDEN

NCPC PRELIMINARY REVIEW 67
31 December 2020
## Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources

### Hirschhorn Sculpture Garden Revitalization

#### Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature/District</th>
<th>Proposed Effect Determination</th>
<th>Additional Information/Minimization of Adverse Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North Stair and Lateral North Ramps</td>
<td>Overhead and lateral stairs are introduced. Local north stair and lateral ramps removed.</td>
<td>Adverse effect.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility</td>
<td>New ramps on the west side with access from the north and south. Modifies the existing intermediate level ramp on the east side to make two shorter ramps.</td>
<td>Adverse effect.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Underground Passage and Historic Stairs</td>
<td>Passage will be reopened, and historic stairs restored. No adverse effect.</td>
<td>- Historic Stadium Rock granite stair treads and aggregate concrete railings are present within the passage. - Underground passage was previously identified as non-contributing and was accessed as a character-defining feature. - Excavation for utilities and support spaces adjacent to the underground passage will have no effect on the passage. - Features link between the Mall, sculpture garden, Plaza, and Museum building. - Significant restoration work required, including concrete patching and cleaning, and gralite cleaning.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Smithsonian**

**SCULPTURE GARDEN REVITALIZATION**

**HIRSHHORN MUSEUM AND SCULPTURE GARDEN**

**NCPC PRELIMINARY REVIEW**

**DC CHECKLIST 2020**
## Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources

### Mishkohn Sculpture Garden Revitalization

**Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources**

**August 2020**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature/Option</th>
<th>Proposed Effect Determination</th>
<th>Additional Information/Minimization of Adverse Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Underground Passage Art Installation</td>
<td>Installation obscures and requires attachment to historic fabric; installation removes portions of concrete walls and coffered ceiling at the north access point to the Sculpture Garden. Adverse effect.</td>
<td>- Installation will bring light and ventilation to the historically dark underground passage condition, creating a safer environment for visitors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Underground Passage – Plaza Access (Alternative b)</td>
<td>Expanded opening for improved daylighting to the base of the historic stairs. Adverse effect.</td>
<td>- Place access was covered over in 1985, and the balustrade was removed. Original dimensions of the opening restricted head height clearance at the stair landing and restricted daylight to the underground passage. Reporting an incident that visitors repeatedly bowed adoringly. Alternative provides daylighting to the base of the stairs and improves head height clearance for a welcoming entry. Adverse effect minimized by maintaining the monumental Plaza stairs from Jefferson Drive. Adverse effect minimized with minimal design changes to the reconstructed balustrade height to meet code requirements by raising the arch and adding a metal rail at the north-gate, preserving the proportions of the design of the 1973 balustrade.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garden Rooms</td>
<td>Presence of garden rooms, maintained in the east garden and added on the area modifications. No adverse effect.</td>
<td>- Garden rooms subdivide the larger open space of the sculpture garden to create intimate settings for sculpture viewing. 1974 design used hedges to create garden rooms. Garden rooms created with ramps, planters, and vertical plantings are a character defining feature, and retain modest architectural integrity. Maintains site project goal of improving sculpture viewing. Proposed garden rooms turned with ramps, planters, vertical plantings, and new stacked stone walls to improve the display of the modern collection.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Smithsonian**

**SCULPTURE GARDEN REVITALIZATION**

**NATIONAL MUSEUM OF ART AND SCULPTURE GARDEN**

**NCPC PRELIMINARY REVIEW**

*3 December 2020*
**ASSESSMENT OF EFFECTS ON HISTORIC RESOURCES**

Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden Revitalization
Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources

August 2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature/Area</th>
<th>Proposed Effect Determination</th>
<th>Additional Information/Minimization of Adverse Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Plant Palette</strong></td>
<td>Planting plan includes trees and ground cover consistent with or similar to the 1983 condition. No adverse effect.</td>
<td>- 1983 shade conditions will be improved, with species planted suitable to the climate. - Concept of garden rooms and screened views from the 1983 landscape maintained. - Cherry trees along National Mall to be replaced with similar species. - Plantings will emphasize the central garden room space of the garden consistent with 1983. - Tree plantings will maintain the 5th Street axial.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Seating and Benches</strong></td>
<td>Benches integrated into planters constructed from Swenson Pink granite consistent with the 1983 bench design and material. Benches flanking the reflecting pool consistent with the spatial arrangement of the tiers from the 1970 redesign and constructed from Historic salvaged Swenson Pink granite slab steps or new Swenson Pink granite.</td>
<td>- Benches integrated into planters constructed from Swenson Pink granite consistent with the 1983 bench design and material. Benches flanking the reflecting pool consistent with the spatial arrangement of the tiers from the 1970 redesign and constructed from Historic salvaged Swenson Pink granite slab steps or new Swenson Pink granite.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Paving</strong></td>
<td>Removal of small brick hardscape paving and replacement with large granite pavers. Adverse effect.</td>
<td>- Large granite pavers in keeping with Collier's unaltered hardscape design which featured gray flagstones. - Adverse effect minimized with the potential use of historic salvaged Swenson Pink granite slab steps for paving in certain locations. - Adverse effect minimized by maintaining a chronological paved circulation similar to the 1983 condition. - Adverse effect minimized with granite pavers that complement the aggregate concrete and Museum place paving in terms of color, and the bond pattern of the existing hardscape. - Adverse effect minimized by maintaining a compatible paving to planting ratio with the area condition.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AGCONS</strong></td>
<td>Historic site and layout restored, with improved visitor access. No adverse effect.</td>
<td>- Visitor access to agcons and to overlook the sculpture garden are currently blocked. Shared seating provided. - Site tree at southwest corner in the public right of way removed. - Agcons programmed to better connect the Sculpture Garden to the surrounding context.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Smithsonian

SCULPTURE GARDEN REVITALIZATION
HIRSHHORN MUSEUM AND SCULPTURE GARDEN

NCPC PRELIMINARY REVIEW
03 December 2020
## Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources

### Hirshhorn Sculpture Garden Revitalization

#### Assessment of Effects on Historic Resources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature/Action</th>
<th>Proposed Effect Determination</th>
<th>Additional Information/Minimization of Adverse Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Security Gates</td>
<td>Andere changing security gates at Sculpture Garden entry points integral with the concrete perimeter walls, no adverse effect.</td>
<td>Gates to be the same height as the perimeter walls. Gate design simply detailed and fabricated in bronze in keeping with the existing material palette.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security guard booth</td>
<td>Guard booth located at southwest corner in the open outside the Sculpture Garden perimeter walls, no adverse effect.</td>
<td>Indirectly prominent guard booth currently on the north overlook that disrupts the 8th Street axis is continued. Guard booth unobtrusively designed and clad in materials consistent with the existing material palette.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Lighting

- Fixtures integral and housed under benches and handrails. Minimal sculpture and tree lighting proposed with minimally visible fixtures. No adverse effect.
- Sculpture garden has always featured lighting in a variety of configurations.

#### Signage

- Integral to perimeter concrete walls, no adverse effect.
- Existing signage features granite panels inset into the concrete perimeter walls with incised letters.

#### Stormwater Management

- Non-visible concrete and bioswale planters located outside of the Sculpture Garden perimeter. No adverse effect.
- Stormwater management is currently not provided, and flooding is a regular occurrence due to failed storm drains.
- Stormwater management will have no visual impact on the Mall.

### Cumulative Effects

This project proposes changes to multiple character-defining features, which results in cumulative adverse effects. Cumulative adverse effects are limited to impacts to the Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden. Adverse effects are contained within the enclosed and recessed space of the sculpture garden, and therefore there are no cumulative adverse effects to the National Mall historic district.

---

**Smithsonian**

**SCULPTURE GARDEN REVITALIZATION**

**Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden**

**NCPC PRELIMINARY REVIEW**

**71**

**7/30/2020**
Area of Potential Effects
Over the course of design development, six pool alternatives were developed in response to comments from agencies, consulting parties, and the public. An enlarged reflecting pool maintains the organization of the Sculpture Garden around the central 8th Street axis and tempos the environment with evaporative cooling. The art platform within the reflecting pool facilitates broad exhibition types and programming. In all the alternatives, the reflecting pool is recessed and provides the flexibility to be drained or filled dependent on the current exhibition or event.
The existing historic balustrade at the south stairs and overlook are 32 inches in height, therefore, they do not meet the required 42 inch code requirement height. The historic balustrade design features a curb, gap, and a heavy concrete top railing. The gap between the curb and the railing is 9 inches, and exceeds code allowance of a maximum 4 inch gap.
Balustrade Alternative A increases the vertical dimension of the top concrete rail from 24 inches to 25 inches, and increases the open gap between the curb and the rail from 9 inches to 10 inches. A bronze horizontal metal tube installed within the gap with a two inch diameter makes the gap code compliant. The curb height is unchanged, and there is an increase in the heft of the top concrete rail.
Balustrade South Overlook Alternative B – Preferred

Alternative B is the preferred design solution. Balustrade Alternative B proposes to increase the height of the bottom cap from 4 inches to 9 inches. The top guardrail portion and the open gap will not have a dimensional change. A horizontal bronze metal tube is required in the open gap with a diameter of 1.5 inches to meet code requirements. Alternative B keeps more of the historic integrity of the balustrade in the reconstructed rail, and reduced visual height.
Underground Passage Opening Alternative A

Underground passage plaza access. Alternative A restores the size of the opening to match the historic design. This alternative requires a code-compliant handrail to: aggregate concrete handrail, and is not preferred programmatically for its restrictions of daylighting and views of the Museum building as visitors ascend the underground passage stairs.
Underground Passage Opening Alternative B - Preferred

Alternative B is the preferred design solution. The Plaza opening is larger than the historic condition but setback 8 feet from the monumental Plaza stairs. The enlarged opening improves daylight, provides a more welcoming entry and visibility of the museum building from the rear of the underground passage. This alternative requires a code compliant Rainscreen style aggregate concrete balustrade.
Underground Passage Opening Alternative C

Alternative C proposes to restore the size of the opening to match the original dimensions, and adds walkable skylights to bring light to the base of the historic stairs. This alternative restricts head height clearance at the stair landing in the passage, and introduces glass to the limited materials palette of the Fosca. Walkable skylights pose waterproofing challenges, and walkable glass flooring has reportedly made visitors uncomfortable at other Smithsonian facilities. This alternative also requires a code-compliant Bunsen-style balustrade.
Security Guard Booth Studies

These studies present alternatives for the guard booth design that will be located south of the West Apron. The height and footprint of the two alternatives is the same. Alternative 1 is preferred. This alternative is clad in aggregate concrete and situated adjacent to the concrete perimeter wall. Alternative 2 is clad in bronze and is offset from the concrete perimeter wall.
Dear Ms. Chiu:

In its meeting of 16 May, the Commission of Fine Arts reviewed a concept submission for the comprehensive renovation of the Hirshhorn Museum’s Sculpture Garden on the National Mall between 7th and 9th Streets, SW. The Commission approved the proposal with the following comments to guide the development of the design.

Noting the importance of the Sculpture Garden as a Modernist landscape inserted into the Mall, the Commission members emphasized an understanding of this garden as a palimpsest that reflects the successive contributions of its Modernist designers—Gordon Bunshaft and SOM, Lester Collins, and James Urban—over many decades. They recognized the garden’s significance as encompassing this broader design history, and they encouraged the Smithsonian Institution to document and interpret this history. For the proposed project, they observed that while the museum’s mission remains constant, the sculpture it presents continues to evolve in character, material, scale, and mode of display; they acknowledged the shortcomings of the existing garden landscape in creating an appropriate setting for many types of artwork, both Modern and contemporary. They also recognized the garden’s extensive physical deterioration, noting that most of the existing concrete retaining walls will need to be replaced. Therefore, they endorsed the proposal to renovate the garden comprehensively, commending the design as bringing much-needed improvements in accessibility; spatial quality and differentiation; opportunities for programming and performance; and the display of various types of artworks—physical, conceptual, and performance.

In their support for the proposed concept, the Commission members identified several issues to be addressed as the design for the Sculpture Garden is developed. In general, they commended the approach to differentiate the garden into three zones—lawn, pool, and grove—for different types of sculpture. They also supported the insertion of new stone walls within the garden to define its spaces, which would provide a good contrast with the austerity of the original concrete walls; however, they commented that the new walls should function first as settings for the sculpture, and their height, color, and texture should be studied further to enhance this purpose. Noting that spaces tend to appear smaller outdoors, they recommended ensuring that the eastern sequence of landscape rooms defined by the new stone walls will be sufficiently generous in size; they also recommended adding more trees in order to provide a figurative ceiling plane to enhance the perception of a larger outdoor room and to allow the experience of circulating within and under a bosque offering continuous shade. In general, they recommended careful detailing of the new elements within the garden—such as the junctures between concrete and stone walls, the materials and texture of the ground plane and other surfaces, and smaller elements such as steps and seats—to ensure they have a sculptural elegance commensurate with the quality of the museum as a whole. Regarding the pool and performance stage proposed for the sunken center of the garden, they expressed concern about the generic quality and functional limitations in creating a flexible performance.
space; they recommended considering other configurations of the stage platform, as well as removable access during times when no performances are scheduled.

In conclusion, the Commission expressed strong support for the proposed design as an ambitious renovation that will enhance the display and the public appreciation of this important sculpture collection. As always, the staff is available to assist you with the next submission.

Sincerely,

Thomas E. Luebke, FAIA
Secretary

Melissa Chiu, Director
Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden
Independence Avenue and 7th Street, SW
Washington, DC 20560

cc: Hiroshi Sugimoto, Sugimoto Studio
    Faye Harwell, Rhodeside & Harwell