

NATIONAL CAPITAL PLANNING COMMISSION

+ + + + +

COMMISSION MEETING

+ + + + +

OPEN SESSION

+ + + + +

THURSDAY  
FEBRUARY 5, 2009

+ + + + +

The meeting came to order at 12:30 p.m. in Suite 500 of the National Capital Planning Commission headquarters at 401 9<sup>th</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC, John Cogbill, III, Chairman, presiding.

PRESENT:

- JOHN V. COGBILL, III, Chairman
- PETER MAY, Department of the Interior
- ROBERT E. MILLER, D.C. Government
- HARRIET TREGONING, Office of the Mayor of the District of Columbia
- MICHAEL S. MCGILL, GSA
- STACIE S. TURNER, Mayoral Appointee
- HERBERT F. AMES, Presidential Appointee
- ARRINGTON DIXON, Mayoral Appointee
- RALPH NEWTON, Department of Defense

NCPC STAFF:

- MARCEL C. ACOSTA, Executive Director
- LOIS J. SCHIFFER, General Counsel
- DEBORAH B. YOUNG, Secretariat

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Opening Remarks..... 3

Report of the Chairman..... 4

Report of the Executive Director..... 9

Consent Calendar..... 13

National Naval Medical Center in  
Bethesda, Maryland ..... 15

Amendment to the Zoning Map..... 52

Marriott Marquis Hotel..... 74

BRAC 133 Project in  
Alexandria, Virginia ..... 121

Ajourn

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

12:33 p.m.

**OPENING REMARKS**

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Good afternoon.

This is the Open Session of the National Capital Planning Commission's February 5, 2009 meeting. Would you all, please, stand and join me in the Pledge of Allegiance?

I pledge allegiance to the flag of the United States of America, and to the republic for which it stands, one nation under God, indivisible with liberty and justice for all.

Thank you. Noting the presence of a quorum, I'll call the meeting to order. If there is no objection, the open session agenda will be adopted as the order of business. Seeing and hearing no objection, so adopted.

[Insert - Agenda]

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

**REPORT OF THE CHAIR**

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Agenda Item No. 1 is the report of the Chair and as the Chairman, I'm pleased to ask Jose Galvez to join me at the podium.

Mr. Galvez is a former Member of the National Capital Planning Commission. His term expired at the end of this year and he served with distinction from 2003 until 2009.

It has been a pleasure to work with Jose as a Member of this Commission.

He served as a Member of our Executive Committee. He was the Chairman of the South Capitol Street Task Force. He gave us always 110 percent and really made this process and our Commission better.

He was very instrumental in a number of important projects we worked on, not the least of which was St. Elizabeth's Master Plan, which involved a number of very complex issues. He was also a very good friend and a very good emissary for the United States and

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

for the National Capital Planning Commission as a participant in our Capital's Alliance Program.

There were many times when he would come down from Baltimore when I couldn't come up from Richmond to host and to sponsor activities and to participate and really do great things for this program.

Jose is a gentleman. He was and is the type of person who would -- works well with staff. His comments were always thoughtful and provided, I think, really good guidance to a very, very excellent and professional staff, but from your position as an architect, it was very helpful to have you provide that external look and really make our process better.

So on behalf of the Commission and on behalf of the employees at the National Capital Planning Commission, I would like to present you, Jose, with this small token of our appreciation for your great work.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(Applause.)

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: It's not required, but it's certainly expected that you will make appropriate comments.

MR. GALVEZ: Thank you all very, very much. As John certainly knows, you know, being a part of the Commission was a fantastic experience and I really thoroughly enjoyed doing it. And not only just for the work that the Commission does, because I think it's extremely important for the long-range vision for the city and the nation as it ties into the city, but also because of getting to know the staff and the people here.

And I have made some friends and I won't be a stranger to in the long run as we go forward. So really, it was a privilege for me to serve. I really enjoyed the process. I learned a lot in the process. And I hope to see what comes out of the Commission in years to come, because you do very vital work. Thank you all very much.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(Applause.)

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Thank you, Jose. You've been a great public servant. We very much appreciate it.

MR. GALVEZ: Thank you.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: During the past month, I have approved comments under the delegated authority of the Commission. This is a response to the Zoning Commission for the proposed Consolidated Planned Unit Development and Map Amendment at Square 421, 1500 Block of 7<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W.

In that report, I have advised them that the project is not inconsistent with the Comprehensive Plan for the National Capital nor would it adversely affect any other identified federal interests. A copy of that delegated action is included in your packet.

And since we have just now recodified these delegated authorities, I would tell you that this comes under Section 1.B.1 of those delegated authorities. So

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

thank you to the staff for, one, getting those, the recodification, done, particular, Ms. Schiffer and also to the rest of the staff for allowing me to take that action.

That concludes the report of the Chairman. I'll now turn it over to the Executive Director, Mr. Acosta.

[Insert - Report of the Chairman]

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

**REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR**

MR. ACOSTA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. And first of all, I would also like to add, from the staff's perspective, our thanks to Mr. Galvez for his generosity to the staff. He has been a very accessible person, who has been able to provide us with advice and his expertise and he has always been willing to share his time with some of these very important matters that this Commission deals with. And it was a privilege to serve with him over the last six years.

In order to keep -- I know we have a lot of folks here who are here to provide testimony on a number of projects, so I'll keep my report short today. I would just like to bring you up to date on a few of our initiatives.

First of all, with the National Capital Framework Plan, we are completing final revisions to the plan that incorporate public comments that we received during the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

review period. We plan to meet with the federal stakeholders over the next month to review the updated document. And we also plan to send the final plan for review to -- by the Commission of Fine Arts at their March 19<sup>th</sup> meeting. We will also submit the plan to this Commission for adoption at your April 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting.

This plan will be posted on our website prior to the CFA and the NCPC Commission meeting, so the public will have an opportunity to review it in advance.

Our Capital Space team have also completed almost all elements of our Joint Open Space Plan and now we are working on our final piece, which is on active recreation. We will have draft recommendations for review at the next Capital Space meeting scheduled for early March.

In addition, we have begun work on partnership recommendations and on a section that will consider regulatory tools and

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

funding. We expect to have a completed draft of the entire report by March for review by the Steering Committee and hopefully after that point in time, we will bring it back to the public and to this Commission for your review.

As part of our ongoing Flood Study Initiative, work is expected to commence in February on a six month study of the storm sewer system and its flooding risk in the monumental core. The study is cosponsored by NCPC, GSA, The Smithsonian, FEMA and the District of Columbia.

And I would also like to take this opportunity to thank all the parties involved in both -- funding of this very important effort.

Our goal is to, essentially, understand the workings of the storm sewer systems downtown and also its impacts on the potential flooding in the monumental core. And also look at ways to rectify the situation

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

by proposing various types of capital improvements that could be designed to deal with storm water flooding in the area.

So after the end of six months, we will come back to the Commission with an update of that initiative.

You will also find other matters that the staff has been working on in my written report, but for now, I would like to end this report and also, if you have any questions, please, feel free to ask.

[Insert - Report of the Executive Director]

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Mr. Chairman, I would like to ask a question. With regard to the flood study, I'm just curious how progress is coming on getting an MOU signed by WASA and the other contributing parties, so that we are in agreement on how it should be overseen and managed.

MR. ACOSTA: Okay. We are finalizing now. I think we have come to the basic terms on the scope of the study. Still -- we're still working it out with the District the final pieces in order to finalize the MOA, but we expect to have that completed soon.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Because I think it's important that that be in place, because it does concern oversight of the study.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Other questions or comments? All right.

#### **CONSENT CALENDAR**

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Then we will

#### **NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

move to Agenda Item No. 3, which is the consent calendar. There are five matters on the consent calendar. First is -- and they are Items 3A through 3E on your agenda.

First is the Fort Belvoir Missile Defense Agency Headquarters Command and Control Center; second, the Army National Guard Readiness Center in Arlington; third, the Southeast Federal Center, the yards, waterfront park; fourth, the United States Secret Service Headquarters modifications to perimeter security; and last, the Chancery of Monaco -- Morocco International Center and International Center Drive in Northwest.

Are there any questions or any comments about the consent items? If not, I would entertain a motion.

[Insert - Consent Items]

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

**MOTION TO APPROVE CONSENT ITEMS**

COMMISSIONER AMES: I move, Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Motion made by Mr. Ames. Is there a second?

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: Second.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Seconded by Mr. Newton. Further discussion?

All those in favor of the motion, please, indicate by saying aye.

**VOTE TO APPROVE MOTION**

ALL: Aye.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Opposed? Abstentions? The motion carries. Thank you.

All right. Next, we will move to Agenda Item 4A. This is an update on the Master Plan for the National Naval Medical Center, Ms. Goldkind.

**NATIONAL NAVAL MEDICAL CENTER IN****BETHESDA, MARYLAND**

MS. GOLDKIND: Good afternoon, Mr. Chairman, Members of the Commission. Today

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

you are being asked to improve a Master Plan Update for the National Naval Medical Center in Bethesda, Maryland.

The Medical Center is located northwest outside the boundaries of Washington, D.C. and it is accessed directly from Rockville Pike on the west and Jones Bridge Road on the south. It is also bordered by Interstate 495 to the northeast as well as residential development to the north.

Directly across Rockville Pike, as you will see here, is the National Institutes of Health. Both federal facilities are accessed by the Medical Center Metro Station on the Red Line, which is also connected to the MARC or regional transit system from the Rockville Station, which is 6 miles to the north.

The image in the lower left gives you a little snapshot of the surrounding development in addition to the NIH shown here in blue. All the orange shown is medium

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

density residential. This is Rock Creek Park. Yellow is low density residential development. And the red here is the Bethesda central business district to the south.

You might recall some of the history of the Medical Center which was established in 1938 with the input of President Roosevelt. He was inspired by the Nebraska State capital and out of his inspiration, the architect, Paul Cret, designed the Naval Hospital Tower, which is also known as Building 1. It's the landmark that you can see from Rockville Pike and it is often associated with the Medical Center.

The tower was completed in 1942 and listed on the National Register in 1978. Over time, the campus has been developed to include a number of buildings. Some of the early buildings reflect the same materials and design styles. There is a lot of open space as well as landscaping. There has been newer installations for housing, as well as bachelor

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

enlisted quarters and some medical facilities.

So the Base Realignment and Closure Act of 2005 generated some very new requirements to be accommodated at the Medical Center. It required the closing of the Walter Reed Army Medical Center in the District and realigning tertiary care from Walter Reed to Bethesda Naval as well as other medical functions to the Fort Belvoir Hospital to the south.

And that changed the mission at National Naval Medical Center, which was formerly to service the flagship of Navy medicine and provide quality health care to military members, their families and many of the nation's leaders.

The new mission, when BRAC is implemented in 2011 and the facility is renamed the Walter Reed National Military Medical Center, will be to provide single integrated health systems that leverages the assets of all DoD health care treatment

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

facilities in the national capital area to create a tri-service worldwide military referral and to create a world -- a tri-service worldwide military referral center.

So the program before you today doesn't include a change to the boundaries of the facility. It will remain 243 acres on its current site, but there is an expected increase in staff of about 2,500. 2,200 of those are related to BRAC and 300 additional staff members for support and services.

And the most significant increase is nearly doubling in the number of annual patients and visitors to the site to just under 1 million.

In response to that, there is an aggressive program to renovate existing facilities and to create an additional 35 percent of new building and to 2,000 new parking spaces.

I'll discuss a little bit later, but there is an aggressive effort to reduce

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

the parking ratio to meet the Comprehensive Plan as well.

I just want to review the 1990 Master Plan Update, because the Land Use Plan that was developed, at that time, is being continued into the new plan with some minor modifications. The goals in 1990 were to stabilize patient care and to increase access to patient services.

And there were -- there are several here, but in general, there were seven clusters or land use areas. The Medical Corps is located at the west edge of the site and you will notice this is Building 1, which is the main tower. Services for staff and visitors are in the south portion here, also referred to as Morrell Welfare and Recreation by the Navy.

Housing areas are located to the north. The center of the campus was to accommodate research and development facilities. Education and training here,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

including the Uniformed Services University. Maintenance in the north corner and this area designated as 12 for future expansion, which currently serves as open space and ball fields for the campus.

So due to the BRAC deadline of 2011, this Commission did review and approve three of the most significant construction projects related to this Master Plan Update. Two were approved in June of 2008, which included the National Intrepid Center of Excellence, which is a facility for traumatic brain injury, as well as the Medical Facility additions, Buildings A and B, to expand medical inpatient and outpatient care.

Last December you also approved a new patient parking garage to support this expansion. I thought this was a good image to give you an idea of how the Navy is working towards building on and expanding the image of the Medical Center.

This is Tower 1, the original

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

structure. This is Building A, Building B and the new patient parking garage. It is also worth noting that these projects are LEED-certified and that all new projects related to the Master Plan Update will also continue to meet LEED-certification requirements.

So this shows an aerial of the site. As you can see, it's very green around the edges and then the development is concentrated primarily in the middle. The new site development plan builds on that and I'm just going to go around the site to try to explain some of the key points.

So what you have already approved much of is expansion of the Medical Corps including this area down here. There is a proposed new bachelor enlisted quarters and dining hall up to the north. Expansion of administrative space including creation of a new fire and security complex at the core of the campus.

Expanded fitness center, expanded

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

warehouse and maintenance facilities, preservation of this open area, which is the wooded area, around Stoney Creek. Expanding the university, maintaining and improving these open recreation fields. Providing new transient housing including two or three new Fisher Houses, expansion of the child development center on the south. And a large expansion of the Navy Exchange also to the south, including a new parking garage.

There are four proposed new parking garages, which I'll discuss in a little while and also I'll discuss in greater detail later several transportation and transit improvements, both internal and external to the site.

So although the tower is listed on the National Register of historic places, the rest of the campus is not on the National Register, but it is considered a Historic District by the Maryland Historical Trust. And the Navy does undertake Section 106, our

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

review and consultation, for any projects that occur there.

The Historic District is outlined here in blue. It includes 18 contributing buildings as well as several landscape elements, including Wood Road, the West Lawn in front of Building 1, including Lake Eleanor, which is named after Mrs. Roosevelt, and retaining walls, a flag post and several landscape elements.

Work that is done in -- on any of these historic resources complies with the Secretary of the Interior standards.

So landscaping is also an integral part of the campus. As you can see here, a lot of it is wooded. Anything in dark green is the natural landscape areas that are highly retained. The peach area to the west is the protected lawn and viewshed in front of the Tower 1. And the other images just give you an idea of the range of landscape, anything from natural landscape and also shows some of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

the topography changes on-site as well as some of the man-made manicured landscapes that are preserved to enhance both the pedestrian experience as well as the buildings.

So the Master Plan Update does strive to make the campus more pedestrian-friendly. There are five access points to the campus, the main one being at the south intersection of Wood Road with Rockville Pike directly across from the Medical Center Station.

That entrance has 24 hour access. There is a north access point and three access points along Jones Bridge Road that are open at intermittent times.

Something I failed to mention in the site plan, but here there is a plan to include a Kiss and Ride facility so that people can be dropped off and then access the site by foot.

The Navy does have a shuttle system running, but there is expanded service planned

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

as part of the Master Plan Update. There are three lines, one that runs continuously from the Medical Center to just inside the south gate and that's a transfer point for two internal shuttles that alternate between this north route and south route.

And I should mention that Buildings 9 and 10, which are here, are the heart of the medical services for the campus.

Now, right now, the plan is to operate those shuttles during peak a.m. and p.m. hours, but the Navy will examine that and see if those hours or the shuttle routes need to be altered as the Master Plan is implemented.

So parking and transportation have been some of the key focus areas, not just by the Navy, but by all of the neighbors and consulting parties, as part of the EIS process and development of the Master Plan. So I just want to go through a little bit of the proposed parking.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

The staff parking ratio is based on the Comprehensive Plan and it is designed to meet the Comprehensive Plan ratio of 1:3 for federal facilities outside of the District of Columbia, but within 2,000 feet of Metrorail.

And all of the other facilities are based on the DoD uniform -- unified facilities criteria, which varies depending on the use of the building.

So there are two existing garages shaded in light green. This north one is for staff and it contains 765 spaces. The south one here has 975 spaces for patients and it has a direct connection to Building 9 and Building 10, two little walkways. The existing parking ratio is 1:2.5 and the proposed -- and it includes 45 percent of surface parking lots, which you can see shaded in pink in the upper left.

So there has been a very strong effort to remove surface parking lots, both for design and by necessity, since those

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

parking lots take space that is now needed for building program and to consolidate that parking and parking structures. As I mentioned, there are four.

The first one is the patient and visitor garage that you approved in December.

The second one is a multi-use parking garage with just over 1,200 spaces and that will serve visitors and patients and visitors, both to the campus as well as the Navy Exchange Services and the Fisher Houses.

A third garage for multi-use is 484 spaces up in the northeast and then an expansion of the Navy Exchange in this area here will incorporate a 550 space garage as well. That's not all going to be done at once. And I'll discuss that a little more with the Phasing Plan.

So included with the Master Plan Update was a very aggressive Transportation Management Plan, which identifies several measures listed here to meet the Comprehensive

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Plan parking ratio. And it really accomplishes that ratio and accommodating a very significant increase in populations while making a campus that's less auto-dependent and a lot more pedestrian-friendly.

So the Navy has also hired an employee transportation coordinator who has already begun coordination with employees. They have seen a decrease in single-occupancy vehicles already and we hope that continues. And they have also coordinated extensively with several other federal and local agencies, as well as the community, to do something very unique to federal operations and that is to request defense access road funding for projects external to the federal facility.

That would include improvements to Rockville Pike that are still being developed, as well as working with WMATA to develop elevator or some other access direct to the Metro Station from the east side of Rockville Pike to eliminate that pedestrian crossing at

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

grade. So far those requests for DAR funding is about \$42 million and the coordination is ongoing.

So also new to this Master Plan are new Department of Defense Anti-Terrorism Force Protection Measures that are required. That includes set-backs, both at the perimeter of 148 feet shown in blue and then individual building stand-offs which range beginning at 33 feet.

The Master Plan doesn't identify specific projects yet. Any new security projects would need to come to the Commission for review, but they have identified expansion of access and entry points, the five points that I mentioned earlier, to replace what are now temporary gates with permanent gates. There is an existing perimeter fence that is scheduled to remain, but there may be modifications needed, both for queuing of cars and for screening of vehicles as some of these measures are implemented.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

They have also identified a location here to create a new truck screening facility, both to provide a secure location for that and to make it in a location that won't impact traffic around the site elsewhere.

So there is a Phasing Plan with four phases, but there are two general periods of construction. One is before 2011 on or by 2011, which is the BRAC and then any projects that will occur after that date. The projects shown in orange are BRAC-related projects that are needed to be complete by 2011.

Green projects are Medical Center expansion projects that are also scheduled to be completed by 2011. And purple projects are non-BRAC-related projects that are funded by others. And the majority of them here are funded by the Fisher Foundation and this is the National Intrepid Center, which you reviewed.

And then anything shown in blue is

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

for future development. The Master Plan right now plans for development up to 2016.

The NCPC staff has been involved in the Master Plan Update as well as the EIS process since 2006 when it began. And we find that the update is very well-developed and successfully addresses both the BRAC requirements, including the challenges posed by the 2011 deadline, as well as the impacts that have been identified through the EIS process.

There has also been a very successful effort to address development that respects and enhances the existing nature of the campus. The transportation components of the plan conform to the Comprehensive Plan and the Navy's TMP includes extensive mitigation for identified impacts.

Their unique approach to coordinating with outside agencies and funding improvements to alleviate traffic congestion set a new standard.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

And I just would like to acknowledge the coordination that the Navy has made, both including NCPC as well as the county, the Maryland Historical Trust, as well as other federal and local agencies and their commitment to continue that coordination to make sure this plan is carried out as efficiently as possible.

Staff does acknowledge that the plan is not fully conforming with the Comprehensive Plan, since it does include relocating employees from the Walter Reed Army Medical Center to the Bethesda Campus. However, we do find that it meets -- that it is consistent with several plan goals and policies and that it expands federal facilities in close proximity to public transportation.

It provides first class facilities for both employees and military personnel receiving medical care. It includes collaboration with local and other agencies to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

meet both federal and local planning goals.

As I mentioned, the Navy completed its Environmental Impact Statement in March of 2008 and issued a RoD in May of that year. There were several mitigation measures identified for adverse impacts. The most significant of those impacts being transportation.

NCPC did -- we don't have independent NEPA responsibility for this project, but we did participate and we did use those findings to inform our analysis and recommendations. With regard to the National Historic Preservation Act, the SHIPPO determined that the Master Plan will have no adverse effect related to the Master Plan Update by, as requested, individual project review as implementation is made to move forward.

So the agencies here were referred the Master Plan by NCPC, but this coordination was started, as I mentioned, in 2005 by the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Navy. They have established a website and have also used the Montgomery County BRAC Implementation Committee to disseminate information.

We received comments from several of these agencies. In general, they found the Master Plan to be consistent with their plans and policies. And any additional comments were considered for our recommendations.

With that, it's the Executive Director's recommendation that the Commission approve the Master Plan Update for the National Naval Medical Center, Bethesda. Notes that the final Master Plan is based on the preferred alternative presented and analyzed in the Navy's final Environmental Impact Statement dated March 2008. It includes mitigation outlined in the Navy's Record of Decision.

It encourages the Navy to continue collaboration with local planning and regulatory agencies to develop and implement

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

federally funded traffic and transportation improvements related to implementation of the Master Plan. Recommend that the Navy continue to coordinate individual project reviews with the Montgomery County Planning Department prior to submitting to NCPC for review.

And commend the Navy for developing a Master Plan Update that continues to respect and enhance the historic and cultural resources of the campus for their efforts to mitigate external impacts of the mandated expansion, as well as for their outreach and coordination with affected parties.

And that concludes my presentation.

[Insert - National Naval Medical Center]

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Thank you. Are there questions of staff from -- okay, Mr. McGill?

#### QUESTIONS/DISCUSSION

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Just a couple. In the parking total, does that include visitor parking, too, and how much visitor parking is proposed?

MS. GOLDKIND: There are 8,000, one second, the total parking at full implementation is 8,087. 3,279 are staff, the remainder are Navy Exchange Fitness Center, visitors and a variety of transient housing or permanent housing.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: So does the ratio -- what is the ratio? Divide --

MS. GOLDKIND: It's 1:3.2.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: No, but I mean, what is the number of parking places that the number of staff is being divided into?

MS. GOLDKIND: It's 8,087.

#### NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: So you are counting the visitor parking for the ratio, too?

MS. GOLDKIND: No, maybe I'm not understanding.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Well --

MS. GOLDKIND: The total including visitor and staff is 8,087.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Right.

MS. GOLDKIND: 3,279 of those are for staff.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: So then the 3,279 is the one you are dividing the number--

MS. GOLDKIND: Yes, into 10,000.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: -- of staff by.

MS. GOLDKIND: Into 10,500 staff.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Okay. Gotcha. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Other questions, Mr. McGill?

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: No.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay. Mr. May?

COMMISSIONER MAY: Yes. The image that you had shown with the stand-off distances, the perimeter I think -- I guess I can understand is an existing fence?

MS. GOLDKIND: Yes.

COMMISSIONER MAY: And it's just a fence. It's not necessarily a --

MS. GOLDKIND: It's a --

COMMISSIONER MAY: I mean, it's a substantive security fence, but it's -- okay. The -- does this -- all of the orange there, does that imply that there are going to be protective measures at those distances from all of those buildings?

MS. GOLDKIND: No. This was -- I'll ask the Navy to clarify if I misstate this. But this is my understanding that this has identified the requirements established by the DoD requirements.

COMMISSIONER MAY: Okay.

MS. GOLDKIND: And as projects are

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

developed, they will either be hardened or measures will be incorporated, at that time. There is no plan to start adding security around each of these individual buildings in response to the requirements.

It's kind of as it moves forward, these --

COMMISSIONER MAY: They will be considered on a case-by-case basis to determine whether or not the measurement -- measures are needed or is it that -- I mean, is there an assumption that as soon as we start to see some of these projects, I mean, the new projects presumably, that we will wind up seeing, you know, every building will have some level of hardening at that distance?

MS. GOLDKIND: Well, we have actually seen three of them and none of them have visible security elements.

COMMISSIONER MAY: Right.

MS. GOLDKIND: They do have just distance between the buildings and the parking

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

areas. So I can ask -- can I ask someone from the Navy to expand on that?

COMMANDER McCOMB: Good afternoon, Commander McComb. I'm the Department Head for Facilities for the National Naval Medical Center. In our diagram showing the ATRP setbacks in the Master Plan, highlights about 183 feet of perimeter stand-off distance. What we show there in orange are actually two distances.

These distances are relatively new.

These were put into place after September 11<sup>th</sup> as the world changed, so did the requirements for ATRP requirements on base. And what the orange shows is for a building that is what's called a primary gathering place, that there is about 80 feet set-back required. In simple terms, we don't want a car parking that close to a building in case it has an ability to make an explosion.

For buildings that are not primary gathering places, there is only about a 30

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

foot requirement and it's really blast protection not fences or personnel security requirements.

COMMISSIONER MAY: So in other words, it just means that you are not going to locate parking or driveways in that orange area. It doesn't necessarily mean that you are going to be putting bollards up at the outside edge?

COMMANDER McCOMB: For the most part, right. We are trying to prevent, as you are all aware from the news, the ability for a vehicle borne improvised explosive device to be that close to a building where there is a primary gathering.

COMMISSIONER MAY: Okay. But we are well aware of that requirement. It's just a question of what you do to keep them away. If it's just a matter of not planning parking or drives there, that's one thing. But --

COMMANDER McCOMB: Right.

COMMISSIONER MAY: -- other

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

measures are different.

COMMANDER McCOMB: I guess the second part to my response would be that these standards apply to new construction and renovation when there are significant renovation. Some buildings will be grandfathered and may not have any of these set-backs applied immediately until they are renovated a considerable amount.

COMMISSIONER MAY: Okay. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER TREGONING: Before you sit down, I might ask a question. We have been having these security conversations for a while around different sorts of buildings. And one of the ways in which a stand-off distance has been accommodated in at least some of the projects that we have looked at is to fill that space or at least the perimeter of that space with other uses that would also serve to prevent a vehicle from getting closer to a much more dense concentration of persons.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

But putting retail and putting other kinds of uses in front of what you are trying to primarily secure is something that other projects have looked at, particular when they are trying to create a much more convenient and walkable project, which I know you are trying to do at this particular location.

So I would just recommend as you consider perimeter security for individual buildings going forward, that you also look to see what other kinds of uses could be incorporated that would also accommodate the stand-off, but add to the urbanity and walkability and usability of your campus.

COMMANDER McCOMB: Thank you. We will take that into account.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Other questions or comments? Thank you, sir. All right. At this point, I want to bring it back to the Commission, but I want to acknowledge that we have with us Rear Admiral Cynthia Dullea, who

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

is here on behalf of the applicant and I believe would like to make some remarks. Thank you for being with us.

REAR ADMIRAL DULLEA: Thank you. Good afternoon. As mentioned, I'm Rear Admiral Cynthia Dullea. I'm the Deputy Commander for Navy Medicine National Capital Area, which is the Navy Medicine region that controls the Medical Center. And I have the honor to appear before you today representing my boss, Rear Admiral Matt Nathan, who is the Regional Commander for Navy Medicine National Capital Area and to advocate your approval of our Master Plan.

The National Naval Medical Center has a well-earned reputation for providing paramount care to our nation's most deserving.

As a result of the efforts of many dedicated military and civilian personnel, our Medical Center leads the way in the development of innovative practices to provide patient and family centered care and more importantly we

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

are now achieving previously unattainable battlefield injury survival rates.

We are proving to be the epicenter of change for military medicine and we continue to lead the way to an integrated continuum of world class care.

As a Naval officer and an American citizen, I cannot be more proud to work -- of the work that we do each and every day at National Naval Medical Center. Today we are faced with a number of changes in military medicine.

As you know, the Defense Base Closure and Realignment Commission of 2005 directed the closure of the existing Walter Reed Army Medical Center and the realignment of Walter Reed's health care activities to Fort Belvoir and to the National Naval Medical Center, which is to be renamed Walter Reed National Military Medical Center, Bethesda.

The realignment of activities to our Bethesda Campus has presented many

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

challenges, most significant of which are how to continue to provide world class care while we expand the Medical Center and provide for additional administrative services needed to support the increase in patients and staff.

Our Master Plan provides a road map to support the realignment as well as equally important objectives. The Master Plan you have before you today that Ellyn has presented is a product of countless hours of work by very professional and dedicated facility staff at the Medical Center. With your support, the Master Plan will ensure that we meet very specific objectives.

Specifically, it will allow us to continue to support the challenging mission of military medicine, provide the flexibility to meet future mission requirements, allow us to maintain and enhance our security profile without negatively impacting our host community and neighbors, maintain and enhance our historic campus, which we believe to be

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

the jewel of Bethesda, facilitate a walkable campus for our patients, visitors and staff and finally, demonstrate our commitment to working collaboratively with our host community what we ensure to continue to be a federal facility which we can be most proud of.

I am sure you are aware that our Master Plan contains a rather extensive, but clearly focused Transportation Management Plan or TMP. The TMP will allow us to ensure our patients, visitors and staff members are afforded access to health care services that they clearly deserve while preserving and respecting the objective to reduce single-occupancy vehicle traffic within the National Capital Area.

Please note that our plan is also the result of extensive and mutually supportive consultations with a broad variety and range of community, state and federal organizations. We clearly understand that if

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

we are to continue to sustain the national support we need to meet our mission requirements, we must routinely engage our host and these organizations to ensure we are working cooperatively with our common goals -- towards a common goal of world class health care for the most deserving men and women of our Armed Services.

Before I conclude, I would like to extend my personal thanks and the thanks of the entire Medical Center staff and the thanks most importantly of our nation's heroes to Ms. Ellyn Goldkind, Ms. Sheryl Kelly and Ms. Diane Sullivan from your staff. Each of these professionals has worked hand and glove with us to ensure our Master Plan achieves the high standards that this Commission demands.

They have led, mentored, taught and most significantly listened. We can't thank them enough for their support. And most importantly, they have been a delight to collaborate with. So thank you.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

So let me close by emphasizing that world class care in an environment fraught with often unpredictable change is indeed challenging. At National Naval Medical Center, we realize we cannot rest on what we have accomplished in the past. We must strive to see what more we can accomplish in the future.

Your approval of our Master Plan will facilitate the work we have before us and will allow us to continue to be recognized not only as the President's Hospital, but as one of the nation's greatest assets where those who bear arms to protect our freedom can come, be comforted and be healed. Thank you very much.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Thank you. Mr. Ames, did you have a question?

COMMISSIONER AMES: Not really. I have a statement.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay.

COMMISSIONER AMES: I would like to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

thank the Navy. You thanked us. We want to thank you, because it makes our job a lot easier when you reach out in collaboration with all the different agencies you have reached out to, because we don't have everybody against each other. And that means a lot to us.

**MOTION TO APPROVE RECOMMENDATION**

COMMISSIONER AMES: And with that, Mr. Chairman, I would like to move that we approve the Executive Director's recommendation.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: All right. We have a motion. Is there a second?

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: Second.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Seconded by the Department of Defense. Any further discussion? Yes?

COMMISSIONER MILLER: I just will be abstaining from the vote just to -- in recognition of the relocation of over 2,000 jobs outside the District of Columbia. I know

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

this is a done deal, BRAC directed.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: All right.  
Thank you, Mr. Miller. Any further  
discussion?

**VOTE TO APPROVE MOTION**

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: All those in  
favor of the motion, please, signify by saying  
aye.

ALL: Aye.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Opposed?  
Abstentions? One. The motion carries. Thank  
you very much for being with us.

REAR ADMIRAL DULLEA: Thank you  
very much.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Thank you for  
your leadership. We appreciate that. All  
right. We will move to Agenda Item 4B. This  
is an amendment to the Zoning Map to change  
the zoning from R-5-D to C-3-C at 2013 H  
Street, N.W. Mr. Hart?

**AMENDMENT TO THE ZONING MAP**

MR. HART: Good afternoon, Mr.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Chairman and Members of the Commission. This proposal is a Map Amendment to change the zoning on Lot 874, Square 101, from R-5-D to C-3-C and was referred by the Zoning Commission.

Square 101 is located in Northwest Washington on the George Washington University Campus along H Street between 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup>. Here is the site Lot 874 in this aerial. This is looking north. The site is here. This is a three-story row house and there is a small two-story carriage house to the rear.

This site is 5,373 square feet in area and is located at 2013 H Street, N.W. H Street, which is here, is a 90 foot right-of-way and this is 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> and a little corner of Pennsylvania Avenue up here.

North of Lot 874 is an 11 story office building and east of the lot is Lot 60, which is actual -- actually currently is a vacant parking lot. Sorry, it's a parking lot. Lot 874 is owned by a nonprofit

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

organization called the Health Services for Children Foundation With Special Needs.

This organization currently operates out of the three-story row house. West of the site is another three-story row house here and a six-story university owned building used by the university Media and Public Affairs Department located here.

There is also an alleyway that connects to this building from H Street and that's actually adjacent to the row house to the property.

Square 101 is located in the proposed boundary of the Foggy Bottom Campus Historic District. Lot 874 here is shown here in a little bit more detail. This is the three-story row house and the carriage house in the rear. And of course, H Street.

The development proposal which accompanied the Map Amendment is to construct a seven-story office building addition for the existing -- onto the existing three-story row

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

house. The seven-story addition would be 80 feet in height and would be constructed above the carriage house and behind the three-story row house on the site.

I will show an image of this proposed addition in the next few slides. The nonprofit organization will remain at this location and will expand into the proposed addition. Here is a computer generated drawing of what that addition would look like, that's here. Again, three-story row house, the 11-story building and a six-story building.

There is actually a local building that is shown, it is here, next to the east of the site. This building is not constructed, but there are plans to construct this building next door.

The next slides will show the -- a little more detail of where this building is. Again, this is just a little key to show where you are looking at. This image is a

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

little farther. Actually, that alleyway that I was speaking of, this is the addition here.

And then the row house here. The 11-story building is at the very far end of this alley.

Again, this is the carriage house.

The addition is actually above the carriage house and the row house is up here. And you are looking, as you can see, here to the south or southeast.

Here is a summary comparing the existing zoning with the proposed zoning. In the R-5-D District, the existing zoning, it would allow a medium density residential building at 90 feet with a 75 percent lot occupancy and a floor area ratio of 3.5.

In the C-3-C District, and under the proposed zoning, would allow a medium density commercial building also at 90 feet. It would have no lot occupancy restriction and a floor area ratio of 6.5.

In short, the new zoning would allow the same height, greater lot occupancy

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

and FAR and also allow a commercial use in addition to those uses allowed in the residential zones. The nonprofit foundation has indicated that, in the submittal again, it will remain at this location.

Staff has identified the federal interest as the Height of Building's Act of 1910 under the provisions of the Height of Building's Act a building of 110 feet would be allowed on this lot, which is located again on H Street, a 90 foot right-of-way.

Staff notes that the District of Columbia Historic Preservation Review Board reviewed this proposal in both September and November of last year given the pending Foggy Bottom Campus Historic District.

The Historic Preservation Review Board raised two concerns. One, the first was retaining the visual link between the original house and the carriage house. And the second is the overall treatment of the carriage house with respect to the proposed seven-story

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

addition. The carriage house needed to be more visible and not enclosed, fully enclosed, in the new addition.

Both of these concerns were addressed by the applicant and the Historic Preservation Review Board approved the building at the November meeting, November 2008 meeting.

In addition, staff notes that a local ANC, the Foggy Bottom/West End Advisory Neighborhood Commission is in opposition to the zoning change and that in a letter to the Commission dated December 4, 2008, they state their opposition citing the following reasons:

That it was too dense, too high behind the three-story row house and it would set a precedent changing -- it would set a precedent for changing residential zones to commercial zones.

While staff understands these concerns, this is -- staff in this instance finds that this is a local issue and that the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

local -- the Zoning Commission will be dealing with this local issue.

Therefore, staff -- therefore, the Executive Director recommends that the Commission advise the Zoning Commission of the District of Columbia that the proposed Map Amendment for Square 101 and Lot 874 to change the zoning from R-5-D to C-3-C would be inconsistent with -- sorry, would not be inconsistent with the Comprehensive Plan for the National Capital nor adversely affect any of our identified federal interests. And that concludes my presentation.

[Insert - Map Amemdment]

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Thank you. Are there any questions from staff at this time? I'll bring us back to the Commission. We do have a public hearing on this. We have two individuals who indicated they would like to speak to this. The first individual will be representing a group, which is the West End Citizens Association. The second is identified as an individual.

Just to sort of reiterate our rules and procedures, we have a clock on the wall, which shows the time. If you are speaking on behalf of an organization, we ask you to limit your remarks to 5 minutes or less. If you are representing yourself or speaking as an individual, then we ask you to limit your remarks to 3 minutes. And the clock will count down from the start of your presentation until that time has expired, at which time there will be a very loud unpleasant noise.

So I hope you will help us with that. At this point, I'll ask our first

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

speaker to come forward, Barbara Kahlow representing the West End Citizens Association.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

**WEST END CITIZENS ASSOCIATION**

MS. KAHLOW: Okay, ready? Okay. I, Barbara Kahlow, testify on behalf of the West End Citizens Association, the oldest citizens organization in Foggy Bottom/West End area. The WECA is primarily interested in maintaining and improving the quality of life for the existing residential community.

In December, the WECA received party status for this case. The applicant's related BZA case for reduced parking has not yet been scheduled, but we intend to state our objections. The Foggy Bottom ANC-2A passed a resolution in opposition both to the Zoning Commission and BZA proposals and also testified at the Zoning Commission in opposition.

The Zoning Commission's oral

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

decision, preliminary decision, did not speak to all of the points in the ANC resolution, which is required by law to be given great weight.

The applicant's proposal calls not only for a Zoning Map Amendment, upzoning in a huge R-5-D area from 100 percent residential use to 100 percent commercial use with an 86 percent increase in density, but also for a seven-story addition to a three-story historic townhouse.

Such upzoning would set an unwelcome and most unfortunate precedent for non-Planned Unit Development, PUD, high density use off of the avenues throughout our community, both in Foggy Bottom south of Pennsylvania and in the West End north of Pennsylvania.

The applicant's expert witness testified that he also did not know of any such non-PUD upzoning. The WECA agrees with the HPRB's Chairman's initial comments. He

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

stated it looked like it's on steroids of 137 times percent increase in gross story -- square feet and is totally overwhelming and inappropriate.

This HPRB staff stated it is one of the few surviving 1988 row houses in a once elegant residential neighborhood and both the row house and carriage house are remarkably intact and with an open feel.

The L'Enfant Plan of 1791 established broad diagonal avenues named for the 13 colonies, including Pennsylvania Avenue, which overlay the grid of residential streets, including H Street. Indeed, it was part of the L'Enfant Plan to establish a residential section of the Federal City.

One of NCPC's objectives is to protect the L'Enfant Plan. The DC Comp Plan so states: "The DC Comprehensive Plan future Land Use Map, which accompanied the 2006 DC Comprehensive Plan, calls for" -- and if you, please, look at your chart, color chart

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

attached, "institutional use in blue off Pennsylvania Avenue all along H Street from 18<sup>th</sup> to 24<sup>th</sup>, including 20, 13, H."

In fact, the only high density commercial use, the red color, is along Pennsylvania Avenue itself and in the central employment area to the north of Pennsylvania Avenue and to the east of 18<sup>th</sup> Street as intended by the L'Enfant Plan.

Therefore, this proposed Map Amendment is, in fact, inconsistent with the Comprehensive Plan. I must say that we did not present this particular map in the Comprehensive Plan arguments to the Zoning Commission because we thought the case was so self-evident.

The WECA requests that NCPC not undermine retention of one of the last remaining historic in tact and low scale buildings in this part of our community. The WECA believes that the seven-story addition that overwhelms the historic elements are most

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

unattractive and would block air and light from the sister row houses residential use on two of it's three floors, at 2021 H Street.

If that applicant were to rezone this site to all commercial versus community-friendly mixed-use zoning, it would be the first non-PUD all commercial zoning upzoning anywhere in our community. And I presented to the Zoning Commission a map with all of the R-5-B, R-5-D and R-5-E sites showing no such non-PUD upzonings.

Unlike in PUD cases, the proposed upzoning would provide no benefits whatsoever to our community. Instead, the proposal would actually seriously undermine one of our historic gems.

Immediately to the east, which your staff mentioned, is the GW parking lot. it is one of 16 development sites in the recently approved GW on to this PUD and was proposed for residential use, 244 new beds. In fact, the recently approved GW Plan calls for

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

residential use all along H Street, as mentioned in the DC Office of Planning's report on this case.

Upzoning a small record lot to 100 percent commercial would lead to multiple upzoning requests elsewhere in our community.

This would result in the destruction of our residential and mixed-use community. We believe the federal interest is to protect the L'Enfant Plan designed for residential sections outside of the broad diagonal avenues.

Therefore, we, please, do not approve this disturbing and unjustified Map Amendment request. Thank you for your consideration of our views. I'm prepared to answer any questions. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Thank you. Are there any questions for the speaker? Thank you very much.

MS. KAHLOW: Thank you.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: All right. I

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

now would ask Dennis Hughes to come to the podium.

MR. HUGHES: Good afternoon, Mr. Chair, Members of the Commission. I'm Dennis Hughes of the Law Firm of Holland and Knight here on behalf of the HSC Foundation, which, as Mr. Hart mentioned, is the owner of the property in question.

We have registered to appear before you today when we learned this was going to be taken on your action agenda. We have since reviewed the staff report, concur with it completely and request that you advise the Zoning Commission accordingly that this is not a consistent with the national -- the Comprehensive Plan for the National Capital nor does it adversely affect any federal interest. And I certainly have 2.5 minutes free to answer your questions if you have any.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Are there any questions for Mr. Hughes?

#### **QUESTIONS/DISCUSSION**

#### **NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Yes, Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: I would like to ask him a question.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay. Mr. McGill?

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: HSC occupies this property right now, right?

MR. HUGHES: No, sir. They own the property. They are currently -- their offices are currently on I Street. When the property is redeveloped, they intend to relocate to the property and that would be their headquarters.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: So what is the current use of the property?

MR. HUGHES: The current -- my understanding, the current use of the building is for a nonprofit group known as the Action on Smoking and Health.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Well, so does that violate a zoning category?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

MR. HUGHES: My understanding is that they have a Certificate of Occupancy for that use.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Oh, okay.

MR. HUGHES: It has operated as a nonconforming use for several years.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: All right. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Any other questions? Ms. Tregoning?

COMMISSIONER TREGONING: I think it's less a question, but maybe a clarification. I wanted to thank both folks for coming to testify from Holland and Knight and Ms. Kahlow from the West End Citizens Association. I just wanted to clarify one point that Ms. Kahlow raised.

And that is the question about why this is a Map Amendment and not part of a Planned Unit Development. And the simple reason is that the site is too small to qualify for Planned Unit Development. It's

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

not as if this is some aberrant action that we are taking. So thank you.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Thank you very much. All right. This is back to the Commission.

COMMISSIONER AMES: I have a question.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Oh, Mr. Ames, I'm sorry.

COMMISSIONER AMES: What are the-- well, I can ask. What are the surrounding properties that are adjacent to this? What is the zoning classification to those?

MR. HART: Well, there is several. There is C-3-C, which is actually due north. Actually in Square 101, it's kind of split, so the northern half is C-3-C and the southern half is the R-5-D. And so what they are looking to do is to extend, I guess, their -- you know, extend a piece of that C-3-C down on their property.

COMMISSIONER AMES: Okay.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

MR. HUGHES: May I supplement that? Commissioner, the property to the immediate west of this property has also been rezoned as part of the George Washington University Campus Plan PUD. That will take effect as C-3-C Zoning at its second stage approval.

MR. HART: It's actually to the east.

MR. HUGHES: I'm sorry, yes. I get that confused.

COMMISSIONER AMES: Thank you.

MR. HART: Okay.

MR. HUGHES: Thank you.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: So, Mr. Hart, in looking at the plans or the map that is attached to page 2 of our report, Square 101 is both north and south of H Street?

MR. HART: Square 101 is north of H Street.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Just north?

MR. HART: Yes.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay. Which

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

part, looking at that location map, again, is Zoned C-3-C?

MR. HART: It's basically the -- if you look on page 3, you can see the zoning. There is kind of like a diagonal line.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: I see.

MR. HART: And a straight line that is just above where Lot 874 is.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay.

MR. HART: This is a little easier, sorry. So this is all C-3-C here.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay.

MR. HART: This is all R-5-D. And the lot that we were speaking of a little earlier is Lot 60, which actually is -- it went through a PUD and that lot is actually being developed under a C-3-C Zone.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay.

MR. HART: So that actually would be kind of weird --

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay.

MR. HART: -- for C-3-C.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Thank you very much. All right. It's back to the Commission.

**MOTION TO APPROVE RECOMMENDATION**

COMMISSIONER TREGONING: I would like to make a motion to move the Executive Director recommendation.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay. Ms. Tregoning has made a recommendation to approve the Executive Director's recommendation. Is there a second?

COMMISSIONER MAY: Second.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Seconded by Mr. May. Further discussion? All right.

**VOTE TO APPROVE MOTION**

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Hearing none, all those in favor of the motion, please, signify by saying aye.

ALL: Aye.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Opposed? Abstentions? The motion carries. Thank you. All right. We will move to Agenda Item 4C.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

This is the Consolidated Planned Unit Development and Zoning Map Amendment for Square 370. Again, Mr. Hart?

**MARRIOTT MARQUIS HOTEL**

MR. HART: Good afternoon, again, Mr. Chairman and Members of the Commission. This project is a Consolidated Planned Unit Development and a related Map Amendment for various lots in Square 370 as part of the Marriott Marquis Hotel and was referred by the Zoning Commission.

Here is the proposed site on Square 370. It is located here in Northwest Washington next to the Washington Convention Center and northwest of Mount Vernon Square. Gompers Park, which is a small triangular park named after Samuel Gompers, the founder of the American Federation of Labor, is west of the site. You can see this little triangle here.

There are a few existing buildings and uses on Square 370. A Pepco station, substation, is located here, on the western

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

part of the site, but is not part of the proposed development.

On the 83,000 square foot site itself, at the corner of 9<sup>th</sup> and Massachusetts Avenue, there is an existing historic building here, The American Federation of Labor. Currently, as you can see, this site is used as a surface parking lot. This site is split by two commercial zones, both in the Downtown Development Overlay District, the C-2-C and C-3-C Zones.

The Map Amendment would allow the entire site to be developed under the Downtown Development Overlay District C-3-C Zone, which would allow a greater density for the site.

The project was submitted to the Zoning Commission by the Marriott International on behalf of the Washington Convention Center Authority and the District of Columbia. I thought it would be helpful to show some images of the existing site to provide further context.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

This photo is looking north along 9<sup>th</sup> Street standing at Mount Vernon Square. Here is the American Federation of Labor building at the corner of 9<sup>th</sup> and Mass. The American Federation of Labor building is seven-stories high and was constructed in 1916. It served as the headquarters of the AFL until 1956 and then in 1974 was designated a national historic landmark.

The Washington Convention Center, as you can see here, is on the right of the slide. Again, this is 9<sup>th</sup> Street and then Mass Ave. is actually across from here.

In this photo on the left is a view looking east along Mass Ave. and it's from Gompers Park. Gompers statue is here. And the photo on the right is a view of the existing streetscape along Mass Ave. in front of the AFL building. You can't actually see the AFL building, but this is the streetscape. The proposed hotel would be located here.

In the background on both photos is

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

the three-story Pepco station here and there.

Here is a computer generated image of the proposed Marriott Marquis Hotel from the corner of 9<sup>th</sup> and Massachusetts Avenue. The AFL building is here and will be incorporated into the design and turned into a boutique hotel. And as I said, it can be seen in the foreground. Also included in this image for your information is the Washington Convention Center, the edge of it, I guess.

The proposed development will include 765,000 square feet of gross floor area and will be 130 feet in height. The design includes 1,160 guest rooms, 4 restaurants, approximately, 100,000 square feet of ballrooms and meeting space, an enclosed atrium, streetscape improvements along several streets, including Massachusetts Avenue, L Street and 9<sup>th</sup> Street.

And vault space is also included in this proposal under Massachusetts Avenue and L Street. A proposed pedestrian tunnel under 9<sup>th</sup>

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Street will connect the hotel to the Washington Convention Center.

This complex project has three components, each of which is being reviewed by a different local agency. The Planned Unit Development shown here in light blue, which is contained within the property lines, is reviewed by the Zoning Commission.

The vault space here in dark blue, under the street right-of-way, accommodates portions of the hotel program not able to fit within the property lines and is reviewed by the Department of Consumer and Regulatory Affairs.

And finally, the streetscape, which is an integral part of the design, is a direct result of the PUD and is reviewed by the District's Department of Transportation's Public Space Committee.

Staff is reviewing the submitted components as a complete package, because they are all integral parts of the same project.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Staff acknowledges that the proposal has legislated identification of several federal interests: The Height of Building's Act, the District of Columbia Public Space Rental Act of 1968 and the Comprehensive Plan for the National Capital.

While staff comments are generally favorable on this proposal with regard to the building height, massing and overall building design, staff is concerned public space is not being adequately protected from intrusions along the important Massachusetts Avenue right-of-way. This will be discussed in further detail later in this presentation.

First, I will present a short summary of the Height of Building's Act analysis. In its report, staff has provided a detailed Height Act analysis for this proposal and concluded that this proposal conforms to the provisions of the Height Act. This conclusion is based on two determinations, that the atrium roof can be considered part of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

the penthouse and therefore can rise higher than the maximum allowed height of 130 feet. This is because the atrium is fully enclosed by the penthouse and is -- which is property set-back.

In addition, the atrium roof is not considered occupied space, but it enclosed occupied space located on the ground floor. The penthouse does not need to be set-back from the western wall as that wall is a party wall as described in the staff report.

Next, we will get to -- we will talk about the District of Columbia Public Space Rental Act. The DC Public Space Rental Act is a federal law passed in 1968. In combination with several DC laws, it permits the District to collect rent for private use of public space above or below the public rights-of-way in the District.

This first floor plan shows the extent of the proposed vault space outside of the property lines. The vault under

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Massachusetts Avenue right-of-way will be, approximately, 400 feet long and 39 feet wide, and will be used for meeting space and some parking in the underground parking garage.

Another vault space is being proposed under the L Street right-of-way here and will be used for administrative offices and support functions for the hotel. Also, a pedestrian connection here will be made to the Washington Convention Center and will require another vault under the 9<sup>th</sup> Street right-of-way.

While staff understands that the vaults are generally not a problem, their placement affects what can occur in the public space above ground.

Staff has identified the Massachusetts Avenue Streetscape design as a federal interest given the prominence of this avenue and the Comprehensive Plan and the L'Enfant Plan seen here. Staff conducted this analysis to support the protection of this

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

historic right-of-way.

Streets in the L'Enfant Plan are under a federal ownership, while the District of Columbia has jurisdiction over the streets.

The Comprehensive Plan for the National Capital calls for various policies with respect to the L'Enfant Plan and they include the ones that you see here:

Promoting continuity in the historic design framework of the nation's capital, preserving the historic street right-of-way and reservations that contribute to the significant system of open space, protecting and controlling visual and functional qualities of the L'Enfant right-of-way, protecting the open spaces of the L'Enfant streets and protecting the integrity, form and design of the L'Enfant Plan system of streets and reservations from inappropriate buildings, new buildings, and physical incursions.

These policies are augmented and supported by other local documents as well,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

such as the District elements of the Comprehensive Plan and various local area plans and guidelines like the Downtown Streetscape Regulations.

The next few slides will provide a detailed look at the public space design along Massachusetts Avenue. This image shows the first floor and streetscape. There are two outdoor dining areas, which you see here and here, which are separated from the sidewalk by a low wall. The walls are in the next slide.

Also included is the main canopy for the hotel and landscaping.

The sidewalk is proposed and it is a reduction from the existing sidewalk, reduction in size from the existing sidewalk, and it is shown here. The proposed vehicular drop-off area and garage entrance is, approximately, 330 feet long and 24 feet wide, which is more than half of the street frontage along Massachusetts Avenue.

The Historic Preservation Review

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Board noted in their staff report that this project had -- on this project that the extent of the paving greatly exceeds the norm for other hotels and buildings along L'Enfant Plan streets. This comment by the Historic Preservation Review Board supports staff's view that the proposed streetscape is not in line with the Comprehensive Plan policies.

This perspective looking west down -- is looking west down Massachusetts Avenue. And I'll point out a few pieces of the landscape. Visible in this image is the outdoor seating area here and a low 2 foot wall that is around there. This 2 foot wall is on the perimeter of the outdoor dining area and both visually and physically separates the dining areas from pedestrians.

To the very left of the image is the 10 foot pedestrian -- is the 10 foot sidewalk open for the general public. Also in this rendering is the canopy over the vehicular driveway for the hotel. And just to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

note that all of this landscaping, outdoor dining area, sidewalk and canopy are in the public space, because the building property line is actually the face -- along the face of this building.

This next conceptual image along Mass Ave. is looking east from 10<sup>th</sup> Street. Similar to the last image, there is an outdoor dining area here, a low wall separating from the pedestrian or from the sidewalk, double rows of trees and the, of course, planting strip along Mass Avenue.

And for your reference, the existing conditions along Mass Ave. are shown here. The sidewalks are generally 17 to 18 feet wide, the tree planting areas included. And this image is actually looking west up Mass Ave. with the hotel on the right. And this is the park, the Samuel Gompers Park.

In summary, this proposed design will reduce the width of the sidewalk from what is existing along Mass Ave. and degrade

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

the pedestrian experience along this important L'Enfant Street to create a physical and visible separation between the outdoor dining area and the sidewalk, which would then minimize pedestrian interaction in the public space and it would maximize vehicular circulation in the public realm and diminish the pedestrian nature of this public right-of-way and place vehicles at both sides of the pedestrians along Mass Ave.

And as such, staff finds that the current proposal for the design of the public space does not enhance the historic views along Massachusetts Avenue, protect the functional quality of the right-of-way, protect the openness of the street right-of-way or fully protect the integrity or design from physical incursions identified in the Comprehensive Plan.

And therefore, the Executive Director recommends that the Commission comment favorably to the Zoning Commission of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

the District of Columbia on the Consolidated Planned Unit Development and related Map Amendment for Square 370 with respect to the building height, massing and overall design and advises that the Zoning Commission of the District of Columbia that the project would be -- would not be inconsistent with the Comprehensive Plan for the National Capital nor adversely affect any of the identified federal interests, provided that this public space portion is modified to allow a sidewalk with -- along this portion of Mass Ave. that is consistent with the sidewalk west of the site, better integrate the outdoor dining space with the sidewalk and reduce the amount of public space dedicated to movement along Massachusetts Avenue and L'Enfant Street.

And with that, that concludes my presentation.

[Insert - Marriott Marquis Hotel]

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Thank you. Are there questions from the Commission? Mr. Ames?

#### QUESTIONS/DISCUSSION

COMMISSIONER AMES: In your EDR, you're talking about a sidewalk width. I have a tendency to disagree a little bit with that in that sometimes I think sidewalks are so wide they are not well used. So I've got a little question about that.

The next thing I have, I want you to show me what you actually mean by the concentration of vehicular movement and where exactly you are talking about, so I can get a better understanding of what you are saying.

MR. HART: This is the -- vehicles will come in and this is actually 24 feet wide. So there are actually two vehicles that you can have --

COMMISSIONER AMES: Right.

MR. HART: -- on either side here. And vehicles are going between the entrance

#### NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

of the -- I didn't show the garage or underground, but this is the actual entrance to the garage. So the vehicles will be coming in and out here as well as coming in and all the way through into the garage area and then they will have to come out of the garage, because this is both the entrance and the exit for the garage.

So there will be movement that is kind of two-way on this side and one-way on this side.

COMMISSIONER AMES: Well, let me ask you --

MR. HART: And the pedestrian way is here in this kind of dark area.

COMMISSIONER AMES: Right. The pedestrian way will only be affected at the entrance to that 333 feet from Massachusetts Avenue, correct?

MR. HART: At both of these points, that's where the --

COMMISSIONER AMES: Well, so there

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

is another entrance to it right there?  
There's two entrances off from Massachusetts  
Avenue?

MR. HART: Well, there is the  
entrance and, I think, this is just an exit.  
So I think it's actually just one-way --

COMMISSIONER AMES: Okay.

MR. HART: -- for the movement.

COMMISSIONER AMES: All right.  
What I would like to do is if you have a  
problem with it, what do you recommend?  
Because you have got a massive hotel which is  
1,160 rooms. First of all, I compliment  
Marriott for the idea of building such a  
facility in Washington, because I think it is  
something that is sorely needed.

And what I'm trying to figure out  
in your comments, I understand where you are  
coming from with vehicular movement, but  
except for the two entrances, which no matter  
what you do, it's either one entrance and one  
exit, no matter what you do, that's going to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

have to be provided.

No matter how much vehicular movement you've got and how long that area is, you're going to have to have the ingress, you know, and the egress coming back out. What I'm saying is I don't see from the exit through the garage area being an area that has a major effect on anything, because I'm assuming the green area between where it says 330 feet long, the green area between there and the sidewalk, I don't think that's going to be flat, is it?

Is there somebody here that can tell me what the idea or what the plan is? You see what I'm saying? I've got --

MR. HART: No, no, that's fine.

COMMISSIONER AMES: What I'm saying is I don't think you're even going to see that part of the driveway. I would hope you wouldn't.

MR. HART: This is -- there is a wall that is here and I'm not remembering how

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

actually high the wall is, but I know that this is actually going down right here.

COMMISSIONER AMES: Right.

MR. HART: But this area is actually wide open. I mean, there is --

COMMISSIONER AMES: Well, that has to be. I mean, how many hotels in Washington are that big?

MR. HART: I don't know.

COMMISSIONER AMES: Let me just tell you from traveling, that's a big hotel and there's a hell of a lot of people trying to get in and out of there. And if you make it too small, what we're going to do is create major traffic problems on Massachusetts Avenue, because you're going to have a back-up trying to get in and out. That's where my problem comes from what you are thinking about.

Too many times I have pulled up to a big hotel and you don't have enough room for the cars to get in, so there you are sitting

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

on the street, you've got traffic blocked and to me that causes more problems than something visual. But I also think that we're pushing it a little bit, because whether it's 330 feet long or shown on this drawing, I have a strong feeling that that's not even going to be something so big that's visible.

So your objection to that going back to the Planning Commission, I don't have a lot of objection to it. I just want to make that clear to you that, you know, sometimes when you are planning things, you know, you do your best to plan the best you can, but we also have to take into consideration that this is a major investment in the City of Washington that -- I'm not an architect by any stretch of the imagination nor am I a planner by any stretch of the imagination, but I am a user of your results.

And using the facilities that I have used in the past, what I see here is very reasonable for what they are asking for. I am

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

assuming the Planning Department signed off on this already? The City of Washington? Okay.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Before you take that down, I have a couple of questions. Those dashed lines shown along Massachusetts and then along the -- to the north.

MR. HART: Yes.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: What are those? What do they represent?

MR. HART: These?

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: No, not the property boundaries.

MR. HART: These?

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Yes, there are actually four.

MR. HART: They actually -- they-- this drawing is one of the drawings that they submitted and they actually have detailed drawings that show what this looks like.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay.

MR. HART: What this looks like, what this looks like, just to give you kind of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

a flavor, a detailed flavor, for that. They don't -- they are not significant in terms of these.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: You had asked a question or you had mentioned that the existing building on the corner there will stay, but that would be a separate hotel.

MR. HART: Well, it's integrated.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: It's integrated?

MR. HART: Yes.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay. Because the drawing seems to indicate that it's all part of the same building.

MR. HART: Yes, and it is integrated into this design.

COMMISSIONER AMES: There was one thing I forget to mention. You brought up about the outdoor dining space.

MR. HART: Okay.

COMMISSIONER AMES: About the separation from public space to the dining space. To be quite honest with you, I'm not

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

an outdoor diner. I don't do that, because where I live, we don't have a whole lot of outdoor diners, because it's too hot. But if I'm going to sit out there on a pleasant spring afternoon in Washington, D.C., I would certainly like to think that there is a separation between the public space.

Although I know you are locating this on public space, but I would like to think there is a separation where somebody off the street doesn't just walk through there while I'm trying to eat or do whatever I'm trying to do in that space. So I've got a little bit of a question about, you know, it's kind of like when you put something in that you want to change, then what do you change it to?

To me, and of course I have a hard time, I am a brick and mortar person. I have to see things already being built, like most normal -- you know, average, I won't say normal, people. But you know, I've got a good

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

feel for what they are trying to do there. And to be quite honest with you, I think they are going to an extreme to make it very nice, not only for the pedestrians, but for the people that are using that.

And I think it's a good looking plan. I commend them. In these economic times, I hope they can get it built soon. But I wish you a lot of luck.

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: Mr. Chairman?

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Mr. Newton?

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: I'm a little concerned about this 10 foot sidewalk considering the proximity to the convention center and the probability that there will be high densities of pedestrians traveling along on Massachusetts Avenue.

I would like to ask whether or not there has been any pedestrian density studies done projecting what the density of pedestrians on this 10 foot sidewalk would be that would continue to allow two-way traffic?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Has there been any studies? Did the architects do any studies at all?

MR. HART: None that I'm aware of.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Ms. Tregoning?

COMMISSIONER TREGONING: I would just like to associate myself with Commissioner Ames' remarks. And but I also want to commend the staff for what, I think, is a very good job. And you are raising exactly the same issues that we have raised in our conversations with, you know, the applicant, you know, on this project.

And I have to tell you a lot of effort has been made to try to accommodate those issues. And there are several of the slides in this presentation that I could point to, but really Commissioner Ames mentioned a lot of those issues that as long as the sidewalk is wide enough to accommodate travel, that wider and wider and wider isn't necessarily better.

As you probably are aware, this

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

part of Massachusetts Avenue is heavily trafficked. It is not considered terribly convivial, you know, for some sort of an outdoor experience. Part of what will enliven and make the street feel more safe for pedestrians is the proximity of that activity and the landscaping and the shelter of the double row of trees.

What Commissioner Ames pointed out about where the actual curb cuts are and the sidewalk are no different than any other hotel in Washington where there is at least a, you know, circulation pattern that allows drop-offs, vehicular drop-offs.

So visually as you look down Massachusetts Avenue, I think the applicant made a lot of effort to design visually, so that you still get that grand vista. There is a lot of transparency in the front of the project. So while I very much appreciate the issues and the comments that were raised, I would also submit to you that the District of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Columbia and our Zoning Commission have already taken action and worked with the applicant to address these issues.

And as you so eloquently stated in your earlier presentation that some matters are local matters. And I would submit that this might be one of those. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Mr. May?

COMMISSIONER MAY: Thank you. I wanted to point out something with regard to the sidewalk. When you showed us the drawings of similar sidewalks or photographs of similar sidewalks, they both measured at 17 feet and 18 feet. And those measurements were to the curb, right?

MR. HART: Yes.

COMMISSIONER MAY: And so that ignores the tree pit. The tree pit in this development is actually designed to be continuous and has special green features, as I understand it, right?

MR. HART: Yes, well, this is --

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

you see -- well, there are -- there is a tree pit that is here. This is continuous.

COMMISSIONER MAY: Right.

MR. HART: But the tree pit, you know, is

COMMISSIONER TREGONING: It's 18 feet.

MR. HART: Yes.

COMMISSIONER MAY: Right.

MR. HART: Yes.

COMMISSIONER MAY: So the drawing that you showed you have the cross section, public space section detail on page 4 of the report, which shows that the comparable distance is actually 14 feet in the proposed plan, right? And it's actually more analogous to the situation on the left where you show 17 feet. You know, the measurement is taken the same way. It is a continuous tree pit and it's that 17 versus 14.

So it's not as big a difference, I guess, is the only thing that I would point

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

out. That's all.

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: I would like to add one more remark. I think it's a beautiful project. My comments regarding the sidewalk though are if you give up the sidewalk, you give up the sidewalk and you will never regain it, even as the neighborhood develops and more pedestrian traffic arrives.

So I think there is -- it's worthy of some caution on the part of the city. The city has already, I guess, reviewed and approved this project in that sense. It would be potentially a local matter. I just think that it deserves some consideration.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Mr. Chairman?

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Yes, sir.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: I would like to ask a question. Following up Mr. Ames' remarks, I don't quite understand why -- what you mean by better integrate the eating area with the sidewalk. And why you want that to happen and how you would envision it

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

occurring.

MR. HART: I think this one -- I mean, right now, this is -- it really defines where -- the space outside of it. And I don't think that this is -- I'm not really sure that this is something that happens all around Washington. I have also seen where we have outdoor eating areas that are -- you know, they use planters or something that is not as -- it's a little bit more porous than what this is.

This seems very -- this is our space and outside of that is not our space. And I just found this to be a little too kind of definitive in what is considered part of the hotel and what is considered part of the public space.

I'm not going to sit and design the project itself, I just think that they need to look, you know, at this and find ways of addressing this that is a little bit more of an urban fashion. This seems a little bit--

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

you know, a long driveway. It seems a little bit on the suburban mode than it does on the urban part of D.C. that this is. And it just seems like it could use some refinement to get here.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Ms. Tregoning?

COMMISSIONER TREGONING: I will just address one more issue about the length of the driveway. As you saw from your earlier diagrams, this is a pretty unusual and difficult site. You know, it's not a big rectangle. When you talk about a suburban site, this would not be a suburban site, because it would not -- you know, it wouldn't have to come to a sharp point at one end like this and have part of it be taken up by an historic building and so on.

And part of the issue is how to accommodate underground parking and that circulation. So I would certainly concede

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

that if we had absolutely every degree of latitude, we would rather not have that length of run. But we did look at many different ways to try to accommodate this and this is the solution that seemed to work best.

If we agree that this is a good project and this is a needed amenity in our downtown, then, you know, the District of Columbia believes that this is the design that can best accommodate the issues that have been raised and still allow a viable project to be constructed. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Mr. May?

COMMISSIONER MAY: Yes, on the -- while we have this slide up here, I would just -- I'm not taking the position one way or the other, but I would point out that there are many, many circumstances in the city where the outdoor dining space is just part of the continuous sidewalk that goes from the curb to the building and it is fenced off in the most minimal way.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

And that happens in plenty of circumstances. There are also other circumstances where there are walls that form and shape that space. You know, what immediately pops into mind is what happens along Indiana Avenue between 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> maybe, something like that, there are a number of those sort of planted walls that step out.

It can be done a number of different ways. This is probably fairly unique in the extent of the sort of wall and the extent to which the building is capturing that open space. But it happens frequently with a lot more porosity than this, but walls aren't that uncommon.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: I think for me the question I have about that is because it is such a prominent location on the building, it is right at the corner and it takes on more importance and I think that's one of the reasons why we're having this discussion. But following up on Mr. Ames' point, because I can

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

see right now that this is a place where he intends to stay when he comes to Washington.

COMMISSIONER AMES: I wish I could afford it.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: In order to accommodate him at that outdoor seating and to provide shade, what would be the process to put some sort of awning over that space? What would be required?

MR. HART: To put in --

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: If you were to extend some sort of shade device from the building out across that dining area, how would -- what would be the process to do that?

COMMISSIONER AMES: I don't think you could do that.

COMMISSIONER MAY: I think you probably put up large umbrellas. I mean, that's a frequent device --

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Umbrellas?

COMMISSIONER MAY: -- that is used.

COMMISSIONER AMES: I'm not eating

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

out anyway, so don't try to protect me.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: All right. That's the end of my questions. We do have two speakers who are here to comment on this, so we will open the public portion of our hearing. Those speakers are representing themselves, each will have 3 minutes, as I understand it and I will ask Ms. Brown. Yes? Thank you.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT**

MS. BROWN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I appreciate the opportunity to speak this afternoon. I'm Carolyn Brown with Holland and Knight on behalf of the PUD applicant. And we are very pleased with the staff's favorable recommendation, but we wanted to update you on how we think we actually have already satisfied the conditions that are in the report.

We have done a lot of work since the HPRB met on this matter back on July 24<sup>th</sup>.

So while we were looking at the current

#### **NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

drawings, I think there may be a bit of a disconnect on how much progress we have made since that July meeting.

You will hear the specifics from Bob Neal, who is the project architect, who will follow my comments. But I just wanted to give you a brief background on the project.

In essence, this is a public/private partnership between the District of Columbia, The Washington Convention Center Authority and Marriott International. The ground is owned by the District and the Convention Center Authority and Marriott has a long-term lease for this property.

It is meant, obviously, to serve the Convention Center itself, thus in fulfillment of the Comprehensive Plan. And it has taken us a long time, many years, to get to this point. And our process has been extremely inclusive involving the City Council, the Deputy Mayor's Office for planning and economic development, the Office

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

of Attorney General, the Office of Planning, the Historic Preservation Review Board, the Convention Center Authority itself, the District's Department of Transportation, it's Public Space Committee, which approved the plans that you saw here today on December 18<sup>th</sup>, the Advisory Neighborhood Commission and a broad spectrum of community organizations, and all of them have recommended approval of the project.

The building design and the public space improvements, in particular, have been reviewed and modified throughout this process.

We take very seriously the considerations of the L'Enfant Plan and responded to the comments of the Historic Preservation Review Board.

We have since met with the Historic Preservation Staff most recently in December, which is part of the Office of Planning. The Office of Planning, as you heard, has recommended approval. There most recent memo

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

was dated January 2, 2009. And we have, as I mentioned, received specific approval from the Public Space Committee which has jurisdiction over these matters.

So you know, we fully support the staff recommendation to act favorably upon this, but we would respectfully suggest that the conditions are no longer needed. And then I would like to turn it over to Bob Neal who can give you the specifics of what has transpired. Thank you.

MR. NEAL: Thank you. Mr. Chairman, Members of the Commission, I'm just going to speak briefly and let you know some of the things that we have done, since we first met with HPRB and some of the ways that we think that we have improved. You can just leave it on this slide and if there's any questions, I'll move to the other ones.

The first thing that we did was that the drop-off area in front of the portico share, that's kind of the determining area

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

that determines a lot of the widths. We started off with 30 feet wide drop-off lanes. We moved to 27 and now we are at 24 feet wide. That's about a 10 percent reduction in the area that we believe that we had initially projected.

We also added 13 percent green area by doing that. I want to also notice that between 50 and 60 percent less vehicular traffic area than the other two Marriott Marquis, one in downtown New York and the other in downtown Atlanta. So we have cut back substantially in that area and believe we are beyond our minimum.

That section right there determines in some way the width of the sidewalk. The comment that was made a minute ago about the overall width is correct. We actually have an overall width of 16.5 feet, which includes a 4 foot planter area, a 10 foot sidewalk and another 2.5 foot planter strip at the portico share area.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

We had looked previously at widening the sidewalks to the east and the west, but, at that time, DDOT and Public Space and other people did not want us to change the width of the sidewalk and they asked that we not do a job which our earlier plans had shown and we do a continuous sidewalk from one end to the other, so everyone felt that the 10 feet was the appropriate dimension, but was not inconsistent with the other areas to the east, west, north and south of Massachusetts Avenue.

Again, we did add more green space in each one of the cafe areas. Our original presentation in July to HPRB showed more rectilinear cafes that were more connected to the street. They asked us to actually create more green area, so that those areas became more encompassed within that green area, so that less was seen of the cafe and more was seen of the green area.

We also added double rows of trees,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

at that time. And then at the entrance and exits to the portico share, we reduced in width from 24 feet to 20 feet. The other comment about the access to the parking, we do have an additional issue there that I don't believe was mentioned. That there is an existing Pepco vault line that runs from the Pepco Station bisects our site and it provides an enormous amount of power to downtown Washington and we are not able to actually go down underneath the building until we have passed over that duct bank.

We have worked very hard with all these people to try to get a solution. We think we have done that and we thank you very much. If you have any questions.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Thank you. All right. That concludes the public presentation. We are back to the Commission. I would entertain a motion.

**MOTION TO APPROVE RECOMMENDATION**

COMMISSIONER AMES: Mr. Chairman, I

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

would like to make a motion that we accept the Executive Director's recommendation until it gets to the point where the sentence ends "any other identified federal interests" I would say put a period there and delete the "provided that the public space portions is modified to those three things" to take those modification requests out and pass the motion as favorable with what was presented by the Planning Commission to the National Capital Planning Commission.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Second that.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay. There is a motion made and seconded. And can you tell me again where you would stop the --

COMMISSIONER AMES: Right here.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay.

COMMISSIONER AMES: A period right there and then take those three things out.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Does that not adversely affect any other federal interests period.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

COMMISSIONER AMES: Period, right.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Okay. With the proviso following. So the motion is made and seconded. Any further discussion on that?

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Yes, I didn't speak to the earlier discussion. I just wanted to speak in strong support of this project, which is vital to the success of the Washington Convention Center and the District's economy. And it's something the site, as has been pointed out, has a lot of constraints, which I think are being accommodated as best as they can be. And with its direct connection to the Convention Center, it will help ensure the success of that facility.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: I just will add a couple thoughts that I had that came to mind as Ms. Brown spoke. What we're dealing with here is the ability to use the vault space as part of this project. And I agree with everything anybody has said here about this is

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

a great project. It is well thought out. But I do have some concerns about the use of this vault space and particularly the fact that it has previously been approved by one of the city agencies that has responsibility for that.

In other cases we have dealt with in the past, and I won't try to remember the exact name of them, but we have dealt with that, but have required that those -- that action be brought to the Commission by the city for approval for the use of that vault space, because it is a federal right-of-way, as I understand the L'Enfant Street, which is operated and controlled by the city. Is that my understanding?

So the fact is that it has been approved by this other agency within the city, but it has not been brought to this Commission, raises in my mind a jurisdictional question about whether or not we need to take a look at that. I don't opine on that nor do

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

I ask counsel to do that, at this point. But it just strikes me that that's something we may want to look at in the future.

But I agree with all that has been said about the quality of this and I appreciate the work of the staff in acknowledging and identifying the issues that you deal with in terms of trying to make what we do internally consistent. And that's why I raised this other question and ask you to take a look at that, if you will.

But I have no further thoughts and certainly have no objections to the motion and the second that's been made to this point. Any further discussion?

**VOTE TO APPROVE MOTION**

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: All those in favor of the motion, please, signify by saying aye.

ALL: Aye.

CHAIRMAN COGBILL: Opposed? Abstentions? Okay. The motion carries. All

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

right. At this point, we come to Agenda Item 4D. I want to make a statement here for the record. As it turns out, the matter in question here has private property located around it. My law firm, McGuire Woods, represents a property owner in that area that has an interest in this project.

While there is no pecuniary interest on my part, there certainly is on behalf of my firm in representing this client.

While this does not represent a strict legal conflict, I do believe that I -- and I will tell you now that I intend to recuse myself from review of this project to avoid any appearance of impropriety.

And with that, I would also say for the record, I have not read the EDR. I have not participated in any discussions about this project and I do not intend to stay here while that discussion takes place. So with that, I turn the gavel over to you, Mr. Vice Chairman.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Mr. Chairman. We are at Agenda Item 4D. It is the location concept design and final foundation plans for the BRAC 133 Project in Alexandria, Virginia. And I will call upon Mr. Keller to give the staff presentation. Carry on. Thank you.

**BRAC 133 PROJECT IN ALEXANDRIA, VIRGINIA**

MR. KELLER: Good afternoon, Mr. Vice Chairman and Members of the Commission. The Department of the Army has submitted for approval of concept location and final foundation plans, what is titled the BRAC 133 Project, located within an area called the Mark Center Development.

It is to provide space for the Washington Headquarters Services under BRAC actions that were directed to be established at Fort Belvoir. The proposal's location is actually at Mark Center Drive and Seminary Road in Alexandria, Virginia.

Here in context with the region is the location of the parcel highlighted here in

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

the red. It is, approximately, 6 miles from the Washington Monumental Core area. It is about 4 miles from the Pentagon located here.

And then the closest Metro Stations are about a little over 3 miles at King Street.

In terms of some background, I'll present some information with regard to the previous actions of BRAC. Subsequent to the Army's decision in 2007 to separate the Washington Headquarters Services from the relocation at the Engineering Proving Grounds of Fort Belvoir, the Army identified in 2008 a 15.9 acre site, that it is a portion of an existing office park.

And it is one of three alternative locations for the Washington Headquarters Services. The Army's decision results responded to the local Government and state concerns that co-location of the Washington Headquarters Services at Fort Belvoir would adversely affect local infrastructure and in the Army's determination that the highway

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

capacity at Fort Belvoir would be notably degraded.

Here is the location of the Mark Center in a closer view. This is Shirley Highway. It's titled in the report as Interstate 395. You will hear about that in several instances. The north/south route adjacent to the east boundary of the property is the Seminary Road. And here in a closer view at ground level you see that site area.

The Army completed purchase of the 15.9 acre land area in December of 2008 after completing its National Environmental Policy Act review and a finding of no significant impact. The other locations that were analyzed in that analysis were the GSA warehouse site in Springfield, Virginia and the Victory Center development at Eisenhower Avenue in Alexandria, Virginia.

And again in this view, you see the location of the Mark Center. Its general parameters. It has three existing buildings

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

located on it. And you see them here at this view. This tower building located here is at the eastern boundary. In the south central area is the Center for Naval Analyses. And then on the western edge of the area is the Institute for Defense Analyses.

The tall structure you see in the far background is the outside of the site area, but you will see that in a moment. Here is the actual site configuration in the dark grey. Again, the existing development along here. There is an existing parking structure that you will see in a moment. The Center for Naval Analyses and the Institute for Defense Analyses.

Other uses in the area include residential development on the east side of Seminary Road, a hotel complex to the north of the site and lower elevation office development and again residential development.

You will also see to the immediate west what is identified as the Winkler Botanical

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Preserve. It's an open space area directly adjacent to the proposed site.

Again, by means of background here, you see some views key to that plan that you saw just previously. On the immediate east of Seminary Road you see the tree buffer area that exists. Again, here is the Center for Naval Analyses building, a portion of the northern private office building and then there is directly behind this buffer an existing parking structure.

In the elevated view, you see again the Center for Naval Analyses here, the Institute for Defense Analyses, that existing parking structure. You see a portion of the eastern entry road to the proposed Washington Headquarters Services site. And then on the west, the other entry road area that exists there presently.

Both this wooded parcel here and this parcel located back in the background here are the areas proposed for the Washington

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Headquarters Services. They are slated in the existing Master Plan of the city to be developed.

And again, here is a view of the Mark Center Drive at Seminary Road and the existing office building there. And then an internal view of the eastern most access point and the location of the one wooded parcel.

On the west side of the site is, again, the Mark Center Drive and this is a view just north of that looking into the site where the transportation center and north parking garage would be proposed and the western most access point to the Washington Headquarters Services.

Here is the overall concept site plan for the proposal. I'll point out the major elements of the Washington Headquarters Services complex and that will be the north parking garage. It will contain a transportation center on the very northern edge and a visitor's center, which is located

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

right in this point.

Visitors would first have contact in entering the site at this area and get credentialed in to move further into the site.

There would be parking for them, both exterior and interior to the parking structure. To the south campus area is the actual main heart of the Washington Headquarters Services space usage.

There is the west tower located here and then what is termed the east tower and then another parking structure that envelops the base of that complex and provides parking spaces adjacent to, but not within the building that is proposed.

The final element is a remote inspection facility that is located at the east side of the site. This would have access only for deliveries. All deliveries would get screened here and then proceed to the dock area for delivery of and storage locations under the parking structure.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Here you see the basic concept building plan for the structure. Again, it's in a T-configuration. This is the main floor that shows the connection to the surrounding parking structure. And the total size of the building is at, approximately, 1.7 million square feet and will be occupied by 6,409 employees.

Parking on this structure would be 1,854 spaces. And then the north parking structure would contain 2,004 spaces. And again, the visitor center located at this point is the security check-in point. Once you are cleared, you would be able to travel through the parking structure either by walking or walking along the pedestrian covered walkway at its western perimeter.

And then if you were credentialed to bring your vehicle in, you would enter into the security area parking through the vehicle barriers located here or moving around the site and entering on the west drive, you would

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

get checked at the guard post at this point and then proceed to the southern structure along the circulation road.

The pedestrian connection is a covered walkway that occurs on the western side and travels all the way to the face of the building.

Because there is a foundation approval involved, I'm presenting to you the foundation plan. It is reinforced concrete foundation development. It will have steel structure involved as well and with pier construction at all columns.

In terms of the Concept Landscape Plan, you see here the features that will be introduced. There will be streetscape development along the circulation road that encircles the building to the west side. There is the maintenance of the eastern buffer that would shield the remote inspection facility. And then there is the maintenance of an open space, green space, buffer at the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

very south side of the parking structure, as well as on the eastern sides of the parking structure.

Pedestrian ways exist both again between the north and south parking structure.

There is a circulation route for vehicles between both structures. And then the setbacks are established within this layout. They have perimeter security fence would occur along, essentially, the property line and then connect into the parking structure areas.

But as you see, it is well set-back from any potential viewshed from Mark Center Drive. And then the existing right-of-way of the interstate is well-screened with existing vegetation at this point, so that fence line would not be visible.

Here is a visual simulation from an aerial view showing the proposed development.

The BRAC buildings are these structures located right here. And it gives you a sense of the context of the western Alexandria

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

development of buildings in that vicinity along Shirley Highway. And again, the hotel complex in the tallest structure occurs in this area.

You also see the Winkler Botanical Reserve and the residential areas that surround both to the south as well as to the east or southwest and the east.

Here are other proposed building elevations of the Washington Headquarters Services. The west tower is a 15 story structure and the east tower is a 17 story structure. The main entrances occur both in a central circulation core area here and then at the eastern side of the east tower.

This is again one of the entry points or entry/exit points to the south parking structure. The south parking structure that entry/exit point is located here. And you see how it steps down and makes use of the transition of grade between the back of the building and the front. There is

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

over a 50 foot drop-off in grade level between the back of the building to the front.

And again, you can see some of that in this east elevation and you can see the location of the remote delivery facility under the parking structure.

Again, at the north campus is the north parking garage where the transportation center will be located. This will be a facility that is open to the public and can be utilized by the public. It will have bus bays at the immediate front. It does exhibit a concrete facade at that area. But on the three other sides, it will become a green wall structure. This is living plant material that will be developed along the wall of the structure.

And then at the west side again, the pedestrian covered walkway that I emphasized earlier. And then the security check-in point at the south edge of the parking structure inward campus of the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Washington Hospital -- or Washington Headquarters Services.

We have a rendering of the proposal as seen from Seminary Road Overpass. And again, this is a work in progress. Staff wants to acknowledge that the City of Alexandria has been working with the Army on refining their concept development, particularly in terms of the architecture of the buildings.

And this was the submitted rendition, but it has already been modified and that you see in your attached report as a comment from the City of Alexandria.

In terms of the parking structure, again, this shows the location of the major features of the transportation center. The purpose of this view is to show the extent of the set-back to the security gate at the south side of the parking structure. And then in addition, there is the provision for widening of lanes to feed directly to the Institute for

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Defense Analyses, so that their personnel will not get encumbered by the security check-in process occurring at the Washington Headquarters Service.

Staff's analysis has identified two main areas of review concerning the BRAC 133 Project. The first the appearance of NCPC Comprehensive Plan Transportation policies and project transportation improvements. And then the second being the concept design considerations that maintain support of federal goals and importantly also support the City of Alexandria design principles.

Okay. In light of the transportation issues, the transportation element of the Comprehensive Plan observes the parking ratios for federal facilities located outside of the District of Columbia, Arlington County and the Old Town Alexandria, and beyond 2,000 feet of the Metrorail Station adhere to one space for every 1.5 employees.

The submitted proposal establishes

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

one parking space for 1.65 employees, consequently it adheres to that direction.

The transportation element also observes that in order to create an internal integrated network of complimentary transit services, the Federal Government should support design and implementation of new expanded and innovative transit services and supplement existing transit and unmet transit needs in the development of the inter-mobile transit center that provide greater transit access and improved interconnectivity for federal commuters.

And staff noted that the submitted proposal establishes a new transportation center, public bus and carpool access to proposed site.

Additionally, the Comprehensive Plan Transportation policy notes that Transportation Management Plans are focused to adhering to goals of the Commission. And the transportation element of the federal elements

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

of the Comprehensive Plan observe federal agencies should prepare Transportation Management Plan to encourage employees commuting by modes other than single-occupant vehicles.

Development of the TMP to explore methods and strategies that meet prescribed parking ratios and to submit the most recent TMP with the development of all projects increases employment of over 100 personnel. And this submission has established that TMP and the parameters of that are in your report at page 15.

Additional measures identified with the submitted project are improvements off-site that were committed to by the Army in its finding of no significant impact and they include three areas, one being the intersection at Seminary Road located here; the next one being at north guard and the intersection with Mark Center Drive and then Mark Center itself at the elbow where the new

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

entry point for the Washington Headquarters Services occurs. So there will be a traffic light installed. And these are provisions that the Army has committed to.

I'll go back one. Another aspect was the improvement of transportation connections bus transit to the proposed transit center. And here are the routing of those proposed bus transit elements. They include the shuttle, bus shuttle, that will be occurring between the Washington Headquarters Service and the Pentagon and Pentagon City. And then there will also be public routing of buses to the King Street Metro stop as well as the Van Buren Street Metro stop.

And these are public bus routes. And then there is the local DASH system that will also be utilized in similar routes as well as connections going to the west.

Another aspect that is important to the submitted proposal is that the consideration that the Army has agreed to with

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

the city and the development of a slip ramp from the south parking garage directly to the Interstate 395 and diagrammatically this is shown in the analysis. The proposed location would be on the southbound ramp. There would be an in/out provision only to connect to that ramp for the movement.

But further evaluation by the Virginia Department of Transportation and the Federal Highway Administration must occur. Nevertheless, the staff is recommending that the Army implement the slip ramp from 395 to the south parking garage to accommodate federal employee traffic and that the preliminary and final submission of the project include a final design for the ramp when the Army submits it to the Commission.

In terms of design considerations, the staff has identified the submission in maintaining the Army installation architectural guidelines and it also achieves LEED-silver rating for sustainability

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

qualities and that's identified in your report at page 25, I believe.

It also is demonstrating ongoing inclusion of the City of Alexandria's design principles, as I mentioned earlier, and staff anticipates continued efforts of the Army with the city in that regard. And also minimizes the visual impact of four security features.

The project as submitted includes development of a well-designed perimeter. It will only be featuring this perimeter security fence, which is a reinforced fence, and will demonstrate cable system within it. Its actual exterior design is very similar to the 9/11 Memorial at the Pentagon who has its fence established around the full perimeter. And that will be the only feature other than the vehicle barriers and the guard house locations internal to the site.

Other design considerations include that the staff finds documented in the submission coordination of the concept design

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

effort with the City of Alexandria in terms of early meetings in January and further comment on the design issues regarding the use of materials and building fenestration has been submitted to NCPC from the City Planner. And again that is attached to your report.

Consequently, the staff is recommending further design coordination and review by the Army with the City of Alexandria be undertaken and documented to the Commission to address building design issues that the city has expressed in its comments to NCPC and prior to the submission of the project for final approval.

Staff finds the necessary information for the concept design review documented and the design information for the west and east towers final foundation complete. And staff has determined additional information for the National Historic Preservation Act, Section 106, process is necessary for the foundation at the north

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

parking garage.

Consequently, the staff is recommending the Commission approve the location of the project with the selection of the 15.9 acre site in Alexandria, Virginia and favorably comment on the concept design and the Commission approve preliminary and final building foundation plans for the west and east buildings and the associated parking there, but not the north parking garage.

In terms of conformance, staff has found that the proposed project is not inconsistent with the Comprehensive Plan. The plan states that federal work places that require extensive land and/or little contact with the public should be primarily located in suburban and rural areas.

In the context of federal facility, the proposed project location and concept design and other plans are subject to the update of the Fort Belvoir Master Plan that is to be submitted to the Commission in 2009.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

And the project was referred to Virginia agencies by the Army, including the City of Alexandria, for review.

The project and plans are generally consistent with the City of Alexandria planning for the Mark Center under its approved Master Plan. In terms of the National Environmental Policy Act, the project has had an environmental assessment issued by the Army in August of 2008 with a finding of no significant impact completed on September 25, 2008.

The Commission does not have an independent NEPA responsibility for this action in regards to the compliance with the environmental historic preservation policies and procedures of the Commission, but the staff has utilized information, its analysis and report.

In the context of the National Historic Preservation Act, the Army has determined no adverse effect to the west and

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

east tower locations and the City of Alexandria has concurred in the determination.

The Virginia Department of Historic Resources earlier found no resources in that general west and south building area.

However, the Section 106 requirements remain applicable to the north parking garage area and NCPC, in fact, does not have any overall compliance requirement for the proposed National Historic Preservation action because of its location in Virginia.

Finally, in the context of the Federal Capital Improvement Program, the latest program approved by the Commission, found this project identified as a project requiring additional planning coordination. And at that time, details of the proposal were not complete and now the Army is continuing coordination with the City of Alexandria and its planning officials to successfully accomplish a final design submission to the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Commission.

Consequently, it's the Executive Director's recommendation that the Commission approves the location, preliminary and final foundation plans, for the west and east tower buildings of the BRAC 133 Project for the Washington Headquarters Services as identified in the NCPC Map file; comments favorably on the concept site and building plans for the Washington Headquarters Services and recommends that continued development of the building and site design that the applicant planned for the location of a slip ramp from the Interstate 395 from the south parking garage to accommodate federal employee traffic include the final design of the ramp when the Army submits the BRAC 133 Project for review to the Commission.

Conduct further design coordination of the project with the City of Alexandria to address building and project design issues identified by the city and include any

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

revisions in the future submissions to the Commission; complete the National Historic Preservation Act, Section 106, process for the north garage location; submit a revised Land Use Plan as part of the update for the Fort Belvoir Master Plan.

And continue coordination with the interested members of the public with regard to the project.

That concludes staff's presentation. We do have representatives from the Army and then we also have registered, approximately, 12 members of the public that would like to comment on the project.

[Insert - BRAC 133 Project]

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you, Mr. Keller. Did the Army want to speak at this juncture or following --

MR. KELLER: I think they are here just to respond to questions asked.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Okay. Well, before we open it up to the Commission for questions or any discussion, I wanted to move to the public participation part of the meeting, since a number of people have been waiting for some time.

We have 11 or 12 persons signed up to speak, 5 of whom are representing organizations, who will have 5 minutes to speak, and 6 of whom are representing themselves as individuals, who will have 3 minutes each to speak. We have a clock on the wall that will count down your allotted time and when the buzzer sounds, if you have not completed your testimony, please, try to sum it up as quickly as possible.

We will call our first speaker

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

right now who is Vice Mayor Redella S. Del Pepper from the City of Alexandria, Virginia. Welcome.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

MS. PEPPER: Okay. Good afternoon.

I'm Del Pepper, Vice Mayor of the City of Alexandria and I am here representing the city with regards to the BRAC 133 Office Project. While the city concurs with many of the recommendations of the Commission and appreciates that our input was seriously considered by NCPC staff, there are four major areas that we would like to address: Transportation, the environment, neighborhood input and architectural design.

First, the planned 6400 DoD workers and their impact on the local transportation system is probably the most important issue. As an urban area, such as this, the solution is not just roads, so traffic mitigation should be the top priority.

The DoD initial plan was for a 40

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

percent non-single occupancy vehicle goal. That goal should be increased to 50 percent non-SOV to help further mitigate traffic impact. And I am requesting that the Commission incorporate the 50 percent goal into your recommendations, as well as require that a robust TMP should be completed in the next six months including performance reporting and a commitment by DoD to fully fund the TMP.

Additionally, the NCPC report states this: "NCPC staff does not endorse the introduction of high occupancy toll HOV lane/ramps onto or adjacent to the BRAC 133 site."

We think it is premature for NCPC to take a position, given that the requested data upon which NCPC and the city can make such a judgment is not yet available.

This is particularly premature if the HOV hot lane access is for buses only as VDOT has proposed.

Second, we have environmental

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

concerns. Although the DoD proposal generally conforms to the prior 2004 City Land Use Approvals, it does differ in many ways. The heavily wooded Mark Center site was maintained and enhanced by the previous property owner. The prior owner preserved vegetation to the greatest extent possible.

This DoD proposal will significantly lessen this vegetative buffer around the perimeter and reduce the internal open space by almost 20,000 square feet by the encroachment of the central parking structure.

We request additional trees be planted around the perimeter to help screen the facility and that a green roof or some green features be added to the central garage to mitigate the loss of open space and tree cover.

DoD should also provide funds to replace the lost open space with an equal size parcel in the immediate neighborhood. Perimeter plantings should also be coordinated with the DoD's anti-ram requirements to ensure

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

adequate screening. A secure facility can also be an attractive facility.

Third, in its land use decision making, the city seeks an open process with a high level of community involvement as this site is part of a neighborhood not a typical military fort. The concerns of the community should be heard and addressed. Unfortunately, the Army has been very slow to realize this. And in the coming months, it needs to work closely with its neighbors on issues such as transportation, the environment, site appearance as well as ensuring that the area remains safe for pedestrians.

And fourth, from an architectural standpoint, the earlier City Land Use Approval was for three smaller buildings with varying heights. The previous office buildings architecture used extensive amounts of glass.

The DoD design is for a building that is a massive single structure with two tall towers.

The city's concern is that this

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

will be a very prominent building in the National Capital Region skyline for generations to come and a high level of design and materials should be incorporated into the proposal. This can be done and still meet the anti-terrorism standards. We believe that NCPC should make it clear to DoD that its architecture needs to be world class and not second class.

They are moving into an area that has Class A buildings in it and we hope that will be continued. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you, Vice Mayor Pepper. Is there any questions for the Vice Mayor? If not, we'll move on to our second speaker, Jeffrey Farner. I would note that we do have the February 3, 2009 letter from the Mayor of Alexandria at our tables here. It's behind the witness list.

MR. FARNER: Yes, good afternoon, Members of the Commission. If I could ask your staff member to maybe bring up the image

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

showing the perspective of the site with the buildings? I think it's helpful in terms of thinking about this site and its potential impacts on the city.

As the Vice Mayor pointed out, this is going to be one of the tallest buildings certainly within the city, but also within the region. So as we think about the design of this facility, the other buildings that were shown in context from 395 are all, essentially, about 150 feet.

This proposal is 270 feet plus. So as we start thinking about this Government building, this will be one of the most prominent buildings along 395 and also within the region. So as we have been working with their team and acknowledged their team that they have been working with us, albeit, in the compressed schedule that they are working within, we have made progress.

But I think to emphasize some of the comments within the letter, it is

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

important that not only the materials be high quality, that the top expression of this building be appropriate. The applicant has begun to work with us and I think you have a revised attachment before you that begins to address some of those.

The other comment that we have heard from the community, and I suspect you will hear today, is also thinking about the top of the building on the western portion of the site, which faces many lower scale neighborhoods and how that is expressed. And that's one of the things we are recommending be incorporated prior to a final submission of approval before this Commission.

The other piece is the green building element of this facility. And given the size and magnitude and potential impacts, not only to the site, but to the city itself, and potentially some of our infrastructure, the letter that is before you is recommending, we understand that they are pursuing a LEED-

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

silver, we are recommending perhaps that that level be increased perhaps to LEED-gold.

We are also recommending the City Council is in the process of finalizing a green building policy for citywide facilities and one of those elements that we are focusing on is water, water reuse, and that is something that we are recommending as part of this site.

The other element is climate change. And as the Vice Mayor pointed out, one of the recommendations is to explore one of the parking structures and perhaps the use of a green roof is a way to not only mitigate storm water, but mitigate perhaps some of the impacts to the site.

We understand those parking structures aren't necessarily before you today, but that's one of the things we wanted to make sure as this continues to move forward it's on the record.

Another couple quick things. On

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

the site plan, we are recommending potential relocation of the remote inspection facility.

There are an enormous amount of trees that are being removed as part of this proposal. We think that is a way to not only mitigate traffic, mitigate some of the security concerns we have heard from some of the residents, but also retain some of the trees.

The other last element, as the Vice Mayor pointed out, is addressing some of the security elements. I won't get into them in detail, but we in the city have addressed those and we think perhaps in more sensitive ways than simply installing a fence while still meeting their needs.

And with that, I conclude my comments and thank you.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you. Any questions? Thank you. The next is David Dexter with West End Task Force.

MR. DEXTER: Good afternoon. I'm David Dexter. Thank you for the opportunity

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

to share some thoughts on the BRAC 133 Project at Mark Center. I live in the West End of Alexandria and Chair the West End Neighborhood Task Force on BRAC 133.

The Task Force is comprised of representatives from eight civic associations in the immediate area of the development. These associations represent several hundred households in the impacted area of the BRAC Project.

Our Task Force has looked carefully at the potential effect of BRAC on our neighborhood and last month prepared a compilation of issues relating to transportation, public safety, environment and funding. And we have provided our elected representatives in the City of Alexandria, Richmond and the U.S. Congress as well as to officials at the U.S. Army and Duke Realty with these observations. We also made this list of concerns available to the Commission.

Given the limited amount of time

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

that we have this afternoon, I would like to touch on just a few of those issues. The Task Force's overarching concern involves transportation issues that surround this project. We believe that without a more robust Traffic Management Plan and additional transportation funding, hopefully through the Defense Roads Acquisition Fund, that our community and the 6,400 BRAC employees will face significant traffic congestion.

There are some specific steps that can help, I think, manage the volume and flow of the BRAC traffic. For example, and this was mentioned by Vice Mayor Pepper, we understand the Army is putting together a Traffic Management Plan to achieve a goal of 40 percent non-single occupancy vehicle trips.

Our Task Force as well as the city recommends that the Army strive for 50 percent non-SOV vehicle trips. There is also an opportunity, as mentioned by Mr. Keller earlier, for direct site ingress and egress

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

from the I-395 Exchange at Seminary Road. A direction connection to I-395 would significantly reduce the impact of BRAC 133 on the surrounding neighborhood streets. And we strongly believe that this connection should be an integral part of the overall project design.

With respect to the building design, we clearly support the Army's goal of constructing a world class building. We believe one element of that goal should be to achieve a gold level LEED-designation for all major facilities in the complex.

We understand the city is working with the developer's architects to revise the top of the building to provide a more distinctive top expression. These revisions were initially being limited to the eastern and southern I-395 building elevations.

Our Task Force strongly believes that the norther and western elevations of the building must have a similar top expression.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

The northern and western elevations of the building will be seen from many area neighborhoods and office buildings. The Southern Tower Apartment Complex, the Hilton Hotel and the Winkler Botanical Reserve.

We also would recommend as a city just to also suggest that the remote inspection facility be relocated to another off-site area.

We believe that any approval by the Commission of the foundation plans today or in the future must not preclude any opportunities to link future I-395 improvements with additional direct access to the site.

In closing, I would like to stress the desire of our neighborhoods to work closely with this Commission, the City of Alexandria, Army and Duke Realty in all aspects of the project that affect our quality of life.

As Congressman Moran stated in a letter to the Commission last week, the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

remainder of the planning and construction of these new facilities should incorporate significantly more community impact than has been afforded in the past. Our Task Force looks forward to working as an equal partner with all parties in this important undertaking.

If you have any questions, I would be happy to answer them.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Any questions? Thank you. Jim Roberts, Ruth Greenstein from the Institute for Defense Analyses.

MS. GREENSTEIN: As the Acting Chairman mentioned, I'm Ruth Greenstein, Vice President of the Institute for Defense Analyses and I appreciate this opportunity to come here today to explain a little bit about our concerns with the way the BRAC 133 Project is proceeding.

I should be very clear, we are not against having a whole bunch of federal

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

agencies right next door. In fact, a number of them are folks we work with on a daily basis.

Let me just say a couple words about IDA and why we are here today. We were founded about 50 years ago to be a nonprofit research center supporting mainly the national security community and dominantly the Defense Department. And we leased -- we really liked Mark Center. We leased facilities from the Mark Winkler Company for many years and then finally we bought what in the Old Alexandria parlance was called Parcel 4 in about 1999 and moved in.

And part of what attracted us to that site was the open office complex, the general collegial quasi-academic look and feel of the place, the number of trees and such-like and the architectural design of the buildings. And we liked it enough that as the organization continued to grow, three years ago we bought an additional parcel, which I

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

think shows up in your materials as Parcel 5, Building 5.

So at this point, we have about 800 people working in Mark Center. About 600 of them in our owned buildings and about 200 of them in buildings that we are now renting from Duke Realty.

One of the things that interested -  
- a couple of things. We -- when we are now -  
- we have been. for the last two and a half years since we bought that additional parcel, working on trying to take that plan, which has originally been for one large building, and turn it into two smaller buildings, since we don't have the finances or the ability to build a 360,000 square foot building in one fall swoop.

But one of the things you will see from the various charts that have been shown up today, put up on the screen today, is that with the preserve, if you looked at the chart and where IDA showed up, we have preserve on

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

two sides for which we are very grateful. And the other two sides are the BRAC 133.

So basically, all of our access to our -- the colored one was good, yes. So the preserve is out there. IDA is that sort of squarish building on the left. The plot we bought for our expansion is what is that green space over there, yes. And all of our road access and utility easements are coming in front what is the BRAC space.

So this is going to have a very direct impact on our ability, both on the environment and quality of life and in our ability to function.

The biggest impact is the reduction of the roads. All of the original plan, every building, had two road accesses. We're down to one. And we have asked that there be a, instead of a solid fence, gate and a crash gate, so that emergency vehicles can get from our site into the federal site and vice versa in the case of emergencies, which strikes us

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

as prudent for both parties.

We're also worried about the access of our employees. As like everyone else, we have our doubts that the site really is going to be able to accommodate all of those people.

And we are particularly worried about ability to get in and out, because our folks are going to have to make a left turn across two lanes of traffic.

And so we hope that in addition to the slip ramp that perhaps another parking light, another traffic light can be installed instead of the current stop sign. And also that that gatehouse inspection facility be moved a little bit closer to the Government's building. Right now, it's two car lengths from where people have to turn into our road.

So the last issue is the security fence and we recognize the need for security, but, frankly, a 10 foot high fence right outside our front door we hope there is the ability to do something a little bit more

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

aesthetically pleasing, whether it's bollards or more extensive landscaping and use of berms and so forth. We hope that that will be explored.

I would like to just make a couple of comments in my remaining 23 seconds. The north parking garage, which will be the view from our building when we finally construct it, we have been working with Duke and the Army for now the last four or five months. It has until -- it has always been represented to us as a four-story building.

The staff report, as I noticed -- four stories above ground. The staff report, as I noticed, talked about it as a five-story building. I would hope it would revert to the four, but if it doesn't, I would very much endorse the city's view that perhaps it can be a green space and when we look down we're not looking down on yet another row of cars.

And if I had more time, I would explain why I think the comment that if we had

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

trouble accessing our road, we could do it -- there could be a second lane added to the IDA access is a little bit disingenuous. As far as I can tell, that would mean taking the land that we have already been designing for a building.

So I would be glad to answer any questions.

#### **QUESTIONS/DISCUSSION**

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Mr. Chairman, I would like to ask a couple of questions. SO IDA is a nonprofit. It is not part of the Department of Defense?

MS. GREENSTEIN: Correct.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Is that also true for the other organization on-site?

MS. GREENSTEIN: The Center for Naval Analyses is also nonprofit, but I believe they are a renter, rather than an owner.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Well, so do you and they have any perimeter security

#### **NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

requirements of your own?

MS. GREENSTEIN: No.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: And in terms of --

MS. GREENSTEIN: I mean, none that are externally imposed.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Right. In terms of collegiality, I assume you mean interaction with other people on the site?

MS. GREENSTEIN: We do. In fact, we work -- we have a fair number of interactions currently with the Center for Naval Analyses and we also have people in the building that is over, if I may, in this building. There is the impression that while the site plan provides for fairly good, I think, pedestrian access within the fence, it makes it very difficult for those of us outside the fence, because as you can see the fence goes right between us and CNA.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Okay. Well, let me just ask one more question then. A

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

hypothetical. Would you be interested in having a common perimeter security fence around the entire site with you on the inside of it?

MS. GREENSTEIN: Only if it were not permanent. I mean, we own that building, but we can't commit the corporation not to be able to sell it except to a defense contractor.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Any further questions?

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: I have a question.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Mr. Newton?

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: Who is your largest customer?

MS. GREENSTEIN: The largest customer is the Defense Department.

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you.

Our next speaker is Nancy Jennings.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

MS. JENNINGS: Good afternoon, I guess. My name is Nancy Jennings. I'm speaking as a private citizen in Alexandria. I live on the northeast side of the project across 395 and my daughter lives on -- in a townhouse community that is adjacent to Mark Center on the southwest side, so she would be off to your left there.

As two other speakers have noted, Vice Mayor Del Pepper as well as the head of the Task Force, Dave Dexter, the number one concern I have here is about the Transportation Plan.

The Army needs more complete plans for transportation and security before it begins to erect permanent structures at Mark Center. Direct access from I-395 into the site would ameliorate at least three problems: Traffic congestion along Seminary Road, which is already there; potentially dangerous materials going through our neighborhoods to get to the mail facility and improved security

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

for the employees, our men who work there.

Duke Realty's plan of adding left turn lanes at two intersections was developed in 2004 for an office site and is inadequate for BRAC's needs. In 1993, a Pakistani terrorist killed three CIA officers waiting to get into the main gate as they sat in two left turn lanes on Route 123.

The wife of one of the victims was a runner and she sprinted into the compound to alert security, who were at least a quarter of a mile down the road. The Agency has since put a guardpost at that intersection.

Our men in uniform could be sitting ducks for terrorist attacks as they turn left at these two intersections while trying to get into the secure complex. And their security guards will be almost a third of a mile away from them.

The first Executive Director recommendation in your report supports plans for a slip ramp into the south garage area.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

If that is the only option, so let it be. But perhaps another month of planning with the Army and the citizens of Alexandria would result in a better plan for getting more employees directly into the site.

Please, require a more detailed Transportation Plan before you approve the construction that will constrain our planning options. Thank you for your consideration.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you, Ms. Jennings. Any questions? Our next speaker is Theresa Pugh. Okay. Annabelle Fisher?

MS. FISHER: Good afternoon, Members of the Commission. My name is Annabelle Fisher. I'm a resident renter of Southern Towers Apartments Complex located on Seminary Road that is directly across the street from the BRAC site. I am also a member of the Board of the Federation Civic Association for Alexandria, but I'm here speaking for myself.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

For the record, I am submitting my comments to the clerk. I would like to address a few issues and possible suggestions.

Traffic and transportation for all employees who will work at the site, I would suggest that the Army, DoD in cooperation with the Corps of Engineers provide direct shuttle bus service in the morning as well as at the end of the work day to take federal employees directly to either the Pentagon Metro Station or the Springfield Metro Station via I-395 and 95 north and south.

I made the suggestion December 4, 08 meeting that was held at Ramsey Elementary School. I do not believe that the shuttle would require any permits from VDOT or the Federal Government. Federal employees who live too far from the BRAC site and need to make many transfers where it would take them an hour or so to get to and from BRAC will not drive and use -- will drive and not use public transportation.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

I do support an access lane from 395 and 95 that would greatly reduce traffic congestion. I would suggest that the Army, DoD advise all federal employees that there is limited parking on-site and provide incentives with Metro cards as other Government agencies do now.

Further, it would be important to work with Alexandria's Traffic Department in order to monitor and control the increased traffic that will happen on Seminary/Fort Belvoir and the surrounding neighborhood.

I would like to see more trees planted on the side of I-95, 395, the BRAC site, which faces the freeway. I also agree with the city and citizens to request to attempt to make some changes in the architectural design of the building.

Who will be responsible for police, fire and emergency medical service prior to and after completion of BRAC office building?

The City of Alexandria is responsible for

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

providing these services. I believe that DoD should reimburse the city if these services are needed.

I do understand that at Fort Belvoir, they have their own fire department.

However, we feel -- I feel we need some clarification and definitive answers regarding use of police, fire and EMS services to the City of Alexandria and the taxpayers. I'm aware that the city in its final point and several civic association groups are requesting that an advisory group be established.

I'm not so sure I agree with the establishment of such an advisory group, since this is the Army, DoD project and there is little they can do with land use. However, I do feel it is important that the Army be the primary facilitator in order for the City of Alexandria and its residents to be able to work in a cooperative positive manner to ensure realistic suggestions and concerns are

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

implemented during construction.

This is a federal project. What I would suggest is that citizens have one or two major contact persons with Dod and the Corps of Engineers to share any concerns as well as the City Manager's Office in Alexandria. Should the city and the Army decide to create an advisory group, there should be no more than nine members who will have clearly defined guidelines and criteria that can be addressed and hopefully resolved, if appropriate.

Again, I believe the Army should run this group and the City of Alexandria can make recommendations for citizen members. I know my time is over. I did have major concerns about this. This is right across the street from me. It's a lot of traffic, a lot of transportation, but it is happening.

I thank you for allowing me to speak and I hope you will take the concerns that we have all expressed into consideration

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

or at least the suggestions that I have expressed. It's important and it may be one of the safest places to live in Alexandria. My apartment building is right across the street. So thank you so much.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you, Ms. Fisher. Our next speaker is Geoffrey Goodale from Brookville-Seminary Valley Civic Association. I must have really mispronounced the name if --

MS. CANNADY: I'm not Geoff. Oh, he called me today and said he wouldn't be able to come. I'm Katy Cannady. I'm going to reference what he told me to tell you when I get going. I'm Katy Cannady. I believe I'm next on the list.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Proceed.

MS. CANNADY: I'm Katy Cannady. I'm the Co-Chair of the Alexandria Federation of Civic Association and I want to tell you in part about what we took a vote on last week at our meeting.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Everyone should understand that Alexandria is a city with a very strong civic involvement culture. If this facility were not a BRAC facility, it would be the subject of at least two public hearings, probably for something as large as this more than two public hearings, and there would be a lot of citizen participation in those hearings.

And we citizens are accustomed to making constructive contributions. We are often listened. Just this week the Planning Commission incorporated things into a small area plan that had come to them from the public hearing. This is the Alexandria culture. And we feel a little bit cheated that circumstances are such that we aren't doing this in the usual Alexandria way.

Therefore, the Federation of Civic Associations by a membership vote at our January meeting wishes to advise you that we would like you to recommend the creation of an advisory group for this facility, for the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

construction and the future operation, and advisory group that would be composed of the Army representatives, Alexandria City officials and civic leaders who we could recommend some of these civic leaders. We know who the people are who are most involved, the near neighbors in a very densely -- you really shouldn't consider this area as suburban.

We have got lots of trees, but we've also got lots of people and lots of traffic. It's not the suburbs. Anyway, we would recommend strongly that you create -- recommend creation of a group of the Army, the City of Alexandria officials and civic leaders to shepherd both the building of this facility and its integration into our community.

And Mr. Goodale who is President of the Brookville-Seminary Valley Association hoped to be here today, but he asked me to tell you that his association took a vote of the board and that they wished to be

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

associated with my remarks. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you. Any questions? Thank you. Our next speaker is Kasha Helget. Did I mispronounce your name?

MS. HELGET: That's okay, it's Kasha Helget. And I'm here as a citizen. I'm in the Dowden Terrace Neighborhood that is directly affected by this facility. I want to echo most of what everybody else has been saying in the public, including the representative from IDA, yes.

One thing she didn't say and a point that is well to be made is how many additional people are going to be coming into this area in addition to the WHS staff. When they build their buildings, they are going to have upwards of 1,300 new bodies coming in here.

In addition, there is staff that is going to be at this WHS site that is not -- that are not employees. They are contract

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

staff, people who run the building, clean the building, things like that. This is all additional traffic. These are all additional bodies.

They are proposing to build a garage for 3,900 non-SOV drivers. If you add this in addition to the other drivers in this area, it's going to be upwards of 5,000 additional cars on I-395. And I would ask that all of you sometime say between 5:00 and 7:00 p.m. on a weekday take a drive up 395.

First of all, look over to the right where all the trees have already been cleared. They are not what is showing on these maps any more. They are gone. And that's about what 15 acres of trees that have been sequestering carbon from the traffic already on 395 and now it's going to have to deal with additional traffic.

I'm very passionate about this, because this is important. And the most important thing about it is it is being

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

rushed. We were told, as a community, on December 4<sup>th</sup>, hello, this is happening and there is really not a whole lot you can do about it, but we're just going to tell you what is going to happen.

Why is this being rushed? They knew about this since 2005 about the BRAC and suddenly at the end of December or at the end of 2008, they are telling us we've got to hurry up and do this. We've got to throw up these buildings.

Let me tell you about a couple of other things that we have been talking about in some of the meetings we have had. Things like oh, let's put a wind generator on top of the building. This was practically laughed off the floor because of the problems with the airport, with birds on the preserve and other things. And I'm thinking, oh, my God, they are planning on doing something like this, what other bad decisions are going to be made in haste?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

What we have heard from one of the distinguished members of our group is build in haste, repent in leisure. And this is with apologies to the original author on this. But we have to also think about the other comment from Field of Dreams, "If you build it, they will come." If you put in parking spaces for 3,900 cars, they will come. They will fill up those cars. We have got to think about alternatives.

Shuttling would be extremely important. I'm in a neighborhood. It's already congested. We already have lots of people living there. Please, think about us. Think about your own neighborhoods. Thank you very much.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you. I think that completes the public participation part of the meeting. I'll now bring it back to the Commission for any questions of staff and any discussion. Mr. McGill?

#### **QUESTIONS/DISCUSSION**

#### **NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: I would like to ask Mr. Keller. I don't understand why Section 106 consultation is necessary for the north garage.

MR. KELLER: That's the result of just process essentially. The Army anticipated having full compliance for the site area. They -- in their archeological report, which has been signed off on by the city, they submitted that to the Virginia SHIPPO and the SHIPPO informed them they could not complete a review in time for this action.

So we are deferring that because we want to see complete compliance.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Well, does-- I thought that there were two different processes here.

MR. KELLER: It's under process.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: I thought there were two different processes involved here. One of which is 106. The other of which would be possibly a three phase analysis

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

of the site to ascertain whether there are any potential historic or archeological features on the site that need to be preserved.

MR. KELLER: Right. And that has been accomplished. They did a Phase I review.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: But I didn't think that analysis had to be part of the 106 process. Are you suggesting that they might have to do a programmatic agreement over the protection of possible archeological sites during excavation?

MR. KELLER: The decision is up to the State Historic Preservation Office in conference with the Army and that's what has yet to be determined, because the State Historic Preservation Office is looking at that information.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: But that has happened in the past?

MR. KELLER: It has not in terms of that --

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Not this

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

site, but I mean, has that ever happened in your knowledge? Has a 106 process applied to archeological sites?

MR. KELLER: Yes, it does.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: Has it -- in this area, has it resulted in a programmatic agreement?

MR. KELLER: I'm not sure. I'll have to ask our preservation specialist.

MS. WITHERELL: Mr. McGill, I want to make sure I understand your question. You are saying, you are asking if there have been archeological sources seen here before with an adverse effect resulting in a programmatic agreement?

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: No, let me explain. I thought the way it worked was you had archeological sites identified, possibly by doing test borings as well as an analysis of the history of the site.

MS. WITHERELL: It's like a Phase I archeology study.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: And if you find there is a potential for more, you do more borings. And then you identify areas on the site where those archeological features might exist under the ground and you would tell contractors as they did construction to go through a very careful procedure in screening those areas.

Now, I thought that was the process that follows. And I don't see how that lends itself to a programmatic agreement. Why the 106 process would apply.

MS. WITHERELL: Okay. I don't -- I'm not anticipating a programmatic agreement.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: I don't see why even the 106 process would apply, if you do that. I don't understand.

MS. WITHERELL: Well, a federal action requires review of resources. And we're not anticipating an adverse effect here or a serious National Register eligible process. But the Army, my understanding is

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

the Army has not completed that stage yet with the Virginia SHIPPO.

COMMISSIONER MCGILL: I see. Okay.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Commissioner Turner?

COMMISSIONER TURNER: Just a clarifying question for staff. Is it not the next step in the process that there will be a full detailed Transportation Management Plan that is done that takes into account all of these concerns that have been raised?

MR. KELLER: Yes, that's part of the NCPC submission requirements. Again, this is the concept stage with the exception of the foundation, but when they develop their final plans, they will have a more detailed TMP, that's part of the submission requirement.

COMMISSIONER TURNER: So then even with this expedited schedule, then citizens will still have the same opportunity to input as the process will be the same as normal?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

MR. KELLER: Hopefully the Army has heard that message. I can't speak for them. If someone from the Army would like to step up to the podium and discuss what they envision as the next steps?

MR. TURKEL: Good afternoon. My name is Jim Turkel. I'm with the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers. I'm here representing the Army and the interests of the Department of Defense as well on the BRAC 133 Project.

Yes, we have heard the message and we understand the importance of the transportation issues. We heard the city recommend to the Council last week that this Transportation Management Plan, Comprehensive Robust Transportation Management Plan be completed within six months.

We have set that as our goal. We fully intend to work with whatever the framework is for community involvement. That's under discussion among the city and the various neighborhood associations at this

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

time. We expect at the next City Council meeting to be provided with some additional guidance on that.

But the Army and DoD have committed to working within that framework, so that we continue this public involvement process and that we have this exchange of ideas. We have already, I believe, worked through a number of issues that, you know, were very well addressed, Mr. Keller, in your recommendations, and we appreciate that, in the city's letter and all of the various attachments through the report.

As Ms. Greenstein said, she, I think, mentioned that she has been working with Duke and the Army for several months, four months, I believe. We will continue to work through those issues and we are -- we understand these issues are important. We want this to be a quality facility as well.

We have certainly the same concerns about getting the DoD employees to and from

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

work in a timely fashion. We realize this is a prominent location on 395. We want it to be a world class facility that the Government is proud of, frankly, and that the employees that come there every day are proud of.

We think it can be that. We think it can be a vital and vibrant part of the community. It is, obviously, going to take some time to develop the details of many of these issues. The shuttle bus service, I mean, all of these things are on the table, are being discussed, but it takes a little while to work these through.

I realize it seems to many that this hasn't been a very open process. We -- this was a competitive procurement that we went through, at the direction of Congress. We had to maintain confidentiality of that process until we actually made an award and had made certain Congressional notifications.

As soon as we did that, we started to engage in more detail with the city.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

We had been having general discussions with the city prior to that time, so that we understood these issues and interests of concern before we even got to the point of award. Once we made the award, then we got into more details on those. And including a discussion of how to do the public outreach process.

You know, we have heard a little bit of criticism that we haven't been quick enough in that arena. I can assure you that was not our intention. We have just had some discussions with the Fort Belvoir Public Affairs staff as to the best format for that.

And sometimes this happens, but I believe, you know, we attended a West End Task Force meeting on the 26<sup>th</sup> of January and committed at that time to continue that public involvement process.

So I hope that responds at least in part to the issues that have been raised.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: Mr. Vice  
Chair?

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Mr. Newton?

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: Yes. Mr.  
Turkel, I think you have answered many of my  
questions, especially transportation and the  
emphasis that the Department of Defense will  
put on providing alternate means of  
transportation than the automobile.

I think it is representative that  
through the commitment to introduce a transit  
center that DoD is serious about providing for  
buses and shuttles that can move employees.

I would like to ask you a couple  
more questions and that's about pedestrian  
access across the site. Have there been  
discussions which would promote cross  
communication by pedestrians from the IDA  
facilities to CNA and to IDA's other separate  
location on the eastern side of the site?

MR. TURKEL: There have. We  
understand that that's an issue of some

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

interest to both CNAC and IDA and we have been engaging in discussions of ways to do that. Looking at some design changes that would allow for pedestrian access through our property between those facilities, so that they can conduct business or share amenities.

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: Is it not also true that regarding transportation that DoD runs a shuttle system already within the Northern Virginia region and that -- actually throughout the Washington, D.C. region as well and that we were -- as the Department of Defense are committed to providing shuttle bus service at least to the Pentagon, which connects to a Metro Station as well as other means of transportation?

MR. TURKEL: Yes, it is.

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: Okay.

MR. TURKEL: I understand that -- I believe there are already some shuttle buses that may be serving this area. And of course, part of the Transportation Management Plan

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

will be for a more robust service that that meets the needs of these tenants.

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: Have there been any considerations of -- as was requested water reuse within the design of this facility?

MR. TURKEL: There has. My understanding -- and somebody from the design team can correct me if I'm wrong, but I believe that this project already contemplates a 30 percent reduction in water and energy use.

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: Okay. Is it fair also to say that the Army and DoD then is committed to reaching out and achieving as many of the comments that have been received from the city and the local citizenry to achieve a mutual acceptable project and product in the end?

MR. TURKEL: Yes, I think that's a fair statement. I mean, from where I sit, you know, I believe we have been meeting regularly

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

with the city. Their comments combined with the various community entities comments, we have discussed most of those issues already. We have made a lot of progress on many of those issues. Mitigations of the resource protection area, certainly, we are still -- discussions are pending on the mitigation of the open space issue.

But virtually everything that you have heard here today, we are addressing in some way, shape or form. You know, I'm not going to represent to anyone here today that, you know, we are going to have a perfect solution for every concern. But we are going to try to come up with the best solution that we can given schedule time, budget and security constraints.

I mean, those are real factors that we have to deal with, but we are very open to the suggestions from the community and the city.

Let me specifically address the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

slip ramp concept. I mean, we have been working through that issue. We recently sent -- that's an issue that goes way beyond, you know, our ability to authorize, obviously, as you heard. VDOT is going to be initiating an interchange justification report to do a further analysis of that.

We have done an internal analysis just to see if the concept would work within our site and within the security requirements that we have. And we have made a preliminary determination that it can. On the strength of that determination, we have also agreed to incorporate now, even though we are uncertain as to whether the slip ramp will ultimately prove feasible, but we have agreed to incorporate design changes into the garage, the south garage here, so that the slip ramp can be accommodated if the subsequent studies by VDOT and others prove fruitful.

And we agree that that is a great way to release some of the traffic off of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Seminary Road and we hope that that works out.

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: I just have one last comment, because there was a request by one of the speakers with regards to supporting the issuance of Metro cards. In the National Capital Region, the Department of Defense issues \$42 million worth of Metro cards every year to employees. Not Metro cards, but mass transit benefit payments. And we have 35,000 participants in that program.

And we will continue to promote that program as a way to get people out of -- one way to get people out of single occupancy vehicles and down to more dense means of transit to and from work. Thank you very much.

MR. TURKEL: Okay.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Other questions? I have one question. You may have addressed this. The city's recommendation that there be a 50 percent goal instead of 40 percent for non-single occupancy vehicles.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Can you or Mr. Newton, one of you address that recommendation?

COMMISSIONER NEWTON: I'll address it. I think that through the Transportation Management Plan, frankly, we will look at transportation demand management and do our best to achieve higher goals. Without having the detailed numbers and having a better understanding of the population at our current locations and modes of transit and how they might be required to get to the site, I'm reluctant to commit to 50 percent or 60 percent. But we are targeting at least 40 percent.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Any further questions? Ms. Tregoning?

COMMISSIONER TREGONING: I don't know if I speak for the rest of my Commission or my fellow Commissioners, but I will say that I have been very impressed with the comments that we have gotten in the public testimony today. And I will -- I'm impressed

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

in a couple of different ways.

Most people seem to be supporting your location in this area and the nature of the comments are highly specific, seemingly highly practical, solutions about how to overcome some of the potential difficulties with this location, particularly around traffic and some of the other things. So that's encouraging that it's not just kind of general concerns, they are very specific.

And you seem to have made a lot of progress in the last couple of months, in particular, you know, so much so that the report we have can't even really keep up with some of the design changes that have been made. That being said, this is just concept review.

And that for my own part, I would certainly expect to see before there could be a final project approval, a very good faith attempt to address the comments that have been made that seem so very reasonable in the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

public testimony. So that's an important thing.

I think that we might be able to do something with the Executive Director recommendation with respect to the Transportation Demand Management Plan that would at least look at the feasibility of the 50 percent goal that was suggested. I appreciate Mr. Newton's acknowledgement that feasibility is key, but I think that stretched objective is certainly worth considering.

To Vice Mayor Pepper's concerns about the staff comment, which is not part of the EDR recommendation, I have been advised that that staff comment with respect to a lack of an endorsement for the HOV lane proposal isn't a binding comment. And that, in fact, we hadn't considered buses and that that might very well change that. So be assured that that's not binding.

And finally, when it comes to the transit center, I don't want to fail to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

recognize the potential for the benefit of having a good transit center there extending much more broadly than simply the new employees, that it might provide convenient access to existing residents and businesses to make it easier for them to get where they are going, especially if we're talking about consolidating some additional bus routes and making that transit center more robust.

And one of the things that I noted, well, two things. Again, convenience, if you can make it possible for people to meet more of their daily needs at the center and that means shopping or other services, it is a public facility. It's outside of your gates, per se, that might help to make it more convenient and more used.

And just down the road at Shirlington, I think there is a great example of a very beautiful transit center that also, you know, suggests, you know, shelter, convenience, even commuter services, so you

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

could buy transit services there that would help to enhance the convenience.

And I would recommend that you look at exploring ways to make this transit center not just a place where some buses pull in, but a real center where people can meet their needs and have it be a neighborhood-wide amenity.

MR. TURKEL: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER TREGONING: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you.

Mr. May?

COMMISSIONER MAY: You know, I have a question about the remote inspection facility and whoever can answer it best. I know that we got one comment that indicated it might be a good idea to move it for the sake of vegetation preservation, which, you know, makes sense on a certain level, but the real question I had is it seems, I mean, just looking at the plan here, like the -- that vehicles or trucks or whatever that would be

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

going into the inspection facility have to go pretty far into the facility or is that just that's because it's not -- those -- I mean, you are going past the parking garage, but you are not going past your buildings?

MR. KELLER: That's --

COMMISSIONER MAY: That's essentially it?

MR. KELLER: Yes.

COMMISSIONER MAY: That's why it's remote?

MR. KELLER: This is the complex, correct. And this drive entry --

COMMISSIONER MAY: But the fact that it is --

MR. KELLER: -- leads back to that.

COMMISSIONER MAY: -- going past the parking garage, I guess, doesn't have the same --

MR. KELLER: Right. There was not a security requirement in that respect.

COMMISSIONER MAY: Okay. Or the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

visitor center or anything like that?

MR. KELLER: Right.

COMMISSIONER MAY: And then the other thing I would point out is that the -- with regard to the planting and particularly with the east tower and the south parking garage there, you have a photo simulation or something from the -- that shows the view from the overpass.

Now, the one that shows the new building.

MR. KELLER: Oh, the new building?

COMMISSIONER MAY: Yes.

MR. KELLER: Okay. Let me move forward here.

COMMISSIONER MAY: Well, before we go there, stop here for just a second. Can you go back to the aerial of the plant? Okay.

I'll get my little pointer here. That area in here, at least in the drawing that we have in our report, seems very sparsely planted in this area in here. It's a little bit more

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

dense, but it's very, very narrow.

I mean, it looks to be on the order of 60 feet from there to the roadway. And then so if we can go to the other view?

MR. KELLER: You want the back view?

COMMISSIONER MAY: The view from the overpass.

MR. KELLER: Oh, okay.

COMMISSIONER MAY: There we go. I mean, that makes it seem like it is embedded in this expansive --

MR. KELLER: This actually --

COMMISSIONER MAY: -- forest.

MR. KELLER: -- probably entails more of the right-of-way of --

COMMISSIONER MAY: Right.

MR. KELLER: -- the existing interstate and the trees there than --

COMMISSIONER MAY: Right.

MR. KELLER: -- what trees exist--

COMMISSIONER MAY: Okay.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

MR. KELLER: -- back along the --

COMMISSIONER MAY: All right.

Well, it --

MR. KELLER: -- project.

COMMISSIONER MAY: I don't know how densely one can plant that 60 foot or so wide strip. But certainly more densely than is shown in that aerial photograph. And I'm assuming that when we get to the --

MR. KELLER: Exactly.

COMMISSIONER MAY: -- final or the preliminary and final, that we will see a more mature planting plan that will show that. And if we are going to see significant expanses of wall of the parking garage, that we might also see the kind of green wall treatment that we saw in the other parking garage.

MR. KELLER: Right. This area can be augmented in terms of the overall.

COMMISSIONER MAY: Yes.

MR. KELLER: Again, that was the initial concept for the project.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

COMMISSIONER MAY: Right.

MR. KELLER: What we saw in the concept landscape.

COMMISSIONER MAY: Right. And I would agree that there is a lot of progress to be made on the design of the building itself.

And I think some of the comments that came in from the City of Alexandria, in particular, will be quite helpful.

MR. KELLER: Yes, staff acknowledges that.

COMMISSIONER MAY: Yes. Okay.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you. Does someone want to make a motion on the Executive Director's recommendation?

**MOTION TO APPROVE RECOMMENDATION**

COMMISSIONER MAY: I would like to move the EDR.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Is there a second? Second.

Is there further discussion on the Executive Director's recommendation?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

**VOTE TO APPROVE MOTION**

COMMISSIONER MILLER: Hearing none,  
all those in favor signify by saying aye.

ALL: Aye.

COMMISSIONER MILLER: All those  
opposed? Unanimously carried.

**ADJOURN**

COMMISSIONER MILLER: And this  
concludes the Open Session agenda of the  
National Capital Planning Commission. Thank  
you all for attending. This meeting is now  
adjourned.

(Whereupon, the Open Session  
Meeting was concluded at 3:46 p.m.)

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701